

Reinterpretation of the Compound *svabhāva-pratibandha* in Dharmakīrti's Logical Theory

by
Yoichi Fukuda

Introduction

Many scholars agree that *svabhāva-pratibandha* forms the actual basis of Dharmakīrti's logical theory. However, there are different opinions about what *svabhāva-pratibandha* means.¹

In his article "Svabhāvapratibandha Again," Steinkellner wrote that "since the word *pratibandha* has only a formal meaning, the word *svabhāva* is responsible for connecting the reality needed" (1984: 458). He does not distinguish the meaning of *sambandha* from that of *pratibandha*, understanding both as having only the formal meaning of "connection."

Before examining the usage of the word *svabhāva-pratibandha* in Dharmakīrti's texts, I would like to consult how *pratibandha/pratibaddha* is presented in the *Mahāvvyutpatti* and *Abhidharmakośa*, two authoritative texts on Buddhist terminology. As the Tibetan equivalents for *pratibandha*, the *Mahāvvyutpatti* lists *phyir 'jil ba'am bgegs byed pa'am bar chad byed pa*, which mean hindrance or obstruction (*Mahāvvyutpatti*, 6483). The same is the case in the *Abhidharmakośa*, where *pratibandha* is translated into Tibetan as *gegs byed pa / bgegs su gyur pa* and into Chinese as 障, 障礙, 遮 (*Index to the Abhidharmakośa*, p. 248).

On the other hand, in *Mahāvvyutpatti* 6481, *rag lus pa'am 'brel ba'am bgegs su gyur pa* are given as the Tibetan equivalents of *pratibandha*, while in the *Abhidharmakośa* (Index, p. 248) in four cases "X-*pratibaddha*" is translated into Tibetan as "X *la rag lus/las pa*," and in one case as "X *dang 'brel ba*." In five cases, it is translated into Chinese as 繫屬, 屬, 隨. These translations in the *Abhidharmakośa* all mean "dependence upon." Thus, in these traditional texts, *pratibandha* is never used to mean connection, but is rather chiefly used to mean dependence.

In one-third of the cases where *pratibandha* is used in Dharmakīrti's *Pramāṇavārttika-svavṛtti* (hereinafter referred to as PVSV), the word means "obstruction," translated into Tibetan as *gegs/gags byed (pa)*. However, in two-thirds of the cases *pratibandha* is translated as *'brel ba* or *rag las/lus pa*. I have collected fifty-one passages that use the latter meaning for *pratibandha/pratibaddha* (List C). There is no distinction between *pratibandha* and *pratibaddha* in these Tibetan translations. The only difference between them is the syntactic

¹ Most articles on *svabhāva-pratibandha* have been published in Japanese. A historical survey of these discussions was written by Kei Kataoka (2012). The idea I present here dates back thirty years. At that time I wrote two short papers on this theme in Japanese ("An Inquiry into the Structure of Dharmakīrti's Logic," 1987; "On the meaning of *svabhāvapratibandha* in Dharmakīrti's Logic," 1989). In 2012, I wrote two additional longer papers ("On the Interpretation of the Compound *svabhāvapratibandha*," 2012a; "On the Meaning of *pratibandha* in *Pramāṇavārttikasvavṛtti*," 2012b), in which I rearranged the former presentations and supplemented them with more citations to demonstrate my idea.

difference in Sanskrit.² In twenty-seven of these passages, *pratibandha/pratibaddha* is explicitly related to expressions of the logical nexus, for example, *gamya*, *gamaka*, *gamayate*, *gamyate*, *avyabhicāra*, *avisamvāda*, *vyāpti*, *anvaya*, *vyatireka*, *ekaniṣṭyānyanivṛtti*, and so on.³ Another eighteen passages mention *pratibandha/pratibaddha* without *svabhāva*. From these usages I could conclude that *pratibandha* has a more important role than *svabhāva* as the basis of the logical nexus.

Of these fifty-one examples of *pratibandha/pratibaddha* in the PVSV, I believe that none conflicts with the meaning of dependence, which is the traditional meaning of *pratibaddha* as seen above. Later I would like to return to this point and add another piece of indirect evidence.

Analysis of the compound *svabhāva-pratibandha*

To understand the meaning of the compound *svabhāva-pratibandha*, I will discuss the assumptions regarding the syntactical value of *svabhāva* in this compound. Until now, there have been three interpretations of this compound, namely as instrumental *tatpuruṣa*, genitive *tatpuruṣa*, and locative *tatpuruṣa*. The first interpretation is the most common and the one used by Dharmottara in paraphrasing the compound in the *Nyāyabinduṭīkā*: *svabhāvena pratibandhaḥ svabhāvapratibandhaḥ* (NBṬ 110,1). However, I could not find any textual evidence in Dharmakīrti confirming that *pratibandha* is used with words in the instrumental case. Dharmakīrti mentions *pratibandha* with one word in the genitive case and another in the locative case; the former indicates a possessor of *pratibandha* and the latter indicates an object upon which the possessor of *pratibandha* is dependent. A similar situation can be seen in the example of *pratibaddha*, which is used with a word in the locative case indicating the object of dependence and a notional subject in the appositional case. In order to explain the usage of related words used with *pratibandha*, I would like to consult the *Nyāyabindu* (NB) instead of the PVSV for reasons of simplicity.

NB 2.19: *svabhāvapratibandhe hi saty artho(X) arthaṃ(Y) gamayet* ⁴

NB 2.20: *tad(Y)-apratibaddhasya(X) tad(Y)-avyabhicāranīyamābhāvāt* ⁵

NB 2.21: *sa ca pratibandhaḥ sādhye arthe(Y) liṅgasya(X) /*

NB 2.22: *[liṅgasya(X)] vastutas tād(Y)-ātmyāt tad(Y)-utpatteś ca /*

NB 2.23: *a-tad(Y)-svabhāvasya(X) a-tad(Y)-utpatteś(X) ca tatra(Y) apratibaddha-svabhāvāt* ⁵

In these statements, X (= *hetu* or *liṅga*) is the object that infers another thing, and Y (= *sādhyā*) is the object to be inferred.

According to NB 2.21, X (*liṅga*) in the genitive case is a notional subject of *pratibandha*, which is the repetition of *svabhāva-pratibandha* in NB 2.19. In other words, X (*liṅga*)

² Hereinafter I will mention these terms as *pratibandha/pratibaddha* without distinction.

³ In the actual texts of Dharmakīrti, these words are often part of negative expressions.

⁴ Cf. PVSV 2,19–20: *svabhāvapratibandhe hi saty artho arthaṃ na vyabhicarati /*

⁵ Cf. PVSV 8,12–13: *apratibaddhasvabhāvasya avinābhāvānīyamābhāvāt /*; PVSV 12,24–25: *apratibaddhasya tadabhāve sarvatra abhāvāsiddheḥ samśayād avyatireko vyabhicāraḥ śeṣavataḥ /*

is a possessor of *pratibandha*. *sādhye arthe* (= Y) of the locative case in NB 2.21 and its substitute pronoun *tatra* in NB 2.23 represent the object, which is connected to or dependent upon X (*liṅga*). In other words, Y (*sādhyā*) is an object upon which X (*liṅga*) is dependent. According to NB 2.23, X (*liṅga*), which is implicitly assumed to be in the same case (genitive) as *tatsvabhāvasya* or *tadutpatteś*, is a notional subject of the *bahuvrīhi* compound *pratibaddha-svabhāva*. The same usage of *pratibaddha-svabhāva* is found in PVSV: *apratibaddha-svabhāvasyāvinābhāvānīyamābhāvāt* (8,12f), or *na ca tadapratibaddhasvabhāvo bhāvo anyam gamayati* (107,25). In both cases, X (*liṅga* or *hetu*) is supplemented in the appositional case.

One could naturally interpret this compound as meaning that something (X = *liṅga*) has its *svabhāva*, which is dependent upon another thing (Y = *sādhyā*); in other words, this would mean that the *svabhāva* of X (*liṅga*) is dependent upon Y (*sādhyā*). From these usages of *pratibaddha-svabhāva*, one could conclude that the first component of the compound *svabhāva-pratibandha* is the *svabhāva* of X (*liṅga*) and that the compound is a genitive *tatpuruṣa*.

However, and inconveniently, one exceptional passage exists that possibly suggests that *svabhāva* expresses the dependent object.⁶ In this case *svabhāva-pratibandha* must be interpreted as a locative *tatpuruṣa*. These examples show that Dharmakīrti was not particularly rigorous in his interpretation of the compound, but that he generally considered *svabhāva* to be a *liṅga* and the compound thus a genitive *tatpuruṣa*.

The meaning of *pratibandha*

Next, I would like to return to the investigation into the meaning of the dependence of X (*liṅga*) upon Y (*sādhyā*). Because Dharmakīrti does not explain the meaning of *pratibandha* explicitly, we must try to understand it from its context. The word is very closely related to *ekānivr̥tīyānyanivr̥tī* (PVSV 10,23; PV I.24), which is an improved version of *avinābhāva*, itself a traditional expression for a logical nexus. While *avinābhāva* means the inevitable absence of one thing (X = *hetu*) in the sphere of the absence of another thing (Y = *sādhyā*), *ekānivr̥tīyānyanivr̥tī* means that the disappearance of one thing (X) is caused by the disappearance of another thing (Y).⁷ This causality of disappearance is expressed by the instrumental case or the causative verb, while the inclusive relation of the absence of two things is expressed by the locative case. Dharmakīrti introduces this causality of disappearance as a condition of an inevitable logical nexus, and insists that the causality of disappearance necessarily requires the *pratibandha* relation, meaning the dependence of the existence of one thing (X = *hetu*) upon another thing (Y = *sādhyā*). If X is dependent in this way upon Y, the disappearance of Y will inevitably cause the disappearance of X.

⁶ PVSV 17,1–3: *svam ca svabhāvaṃ parityajya katham bhāvo bhavet / svabhāvasyaiva bhāvatvād iti tasya (= liṅgasya) svabhāvapratibandhād avyabhicārah /*. In this case, *svabhāva* is consistently the object to be conferred and *bhāva* is the object conferring it. Śākyabuddhi commented on the second sentence: *tasyātmabhūtasya sādhaasya śimśapādeḥ svabhāvapratibandhād eva svabhāve sādhyābhimāte vṛkṣādau ... pratibandhād evāvyabhicārah /* (KG 75,3ff = PVT 39b7f).

⁷ The Tibetan equivalent of *avinābhāva* is *med na mi 'byung ba*, while on the other hand the equivalent of *ekānivr̥tīyānyanivr̥tī* is *gcig log pas gzhan ldog pa*. As will be shown below, in Tibetan logic the expression corresponding to the latter is *de ldog pa'i stobs kyis khyod ldog pa*.

Such dependence is, in itself, a connection between real objects and therefore to express this meaning Dharmakīrti does not need to mention *svabhāva*.

*tasmād ekanivṛtṭyā 'nyanivṛttim icchatā tayoh kaścit svabhāvapratibandho
'py eṣṭavyaḥ / anyathā 'gamako hetuḥ syāt /* (PVSV 10,23–25)

This passage shows that the logical reason (= *hetu*) is based on the relation of *ekaniṣṭyānyanivṛtṭi* and, in turn, this relation is based on *svabhāva-pratibandha*. Conversely, if *svabhāva-pratibandha* exists between two objects, the disappearance of one object causes the disappearance of the other and thus one can infer the existence of the former object from the existence of the latter. One can find this used in a similar way several times in the PVSV, as detailed below.

PVSV 16,28f: *tanmātrasambandhaḥ svabhāvo (= sādhya) bhāvam (= liṅga)
eva nivartayet* (k.23a–c) /.

PVSV 17,5: *kāraṇaṃ nivartamānaṃ kāryaṃ nivartayati /*

PVSV 17,7f: *ubhayathā (= tādātmyena tadutpattiyā vā)⁸ svabhāvapratiba-
ndhād eva nivṛtṭiḥ / anyathā ekanivṛtṭyānyavinivṛtṭiḥ katham bhavet* (k.24ab) /

PVSV 19,25: *tāv (= kāraṇa and vyāpaka) eva hi nivartamānau svapratiba-
ddham (= kārya and vyāpya) nivartayata iti /*

PVSV 20,1f: *apratibandhe hi katham ekasya nivṛtṭir anyasya nivṛtṭim sādha-
yet /*

This *nivartaka* power does not represent a kind of logical nexus, but rather the power to affect another object existentially. Based on these expressions, I would like to suggest that *pratibandha*, or existential dependence,⁹ is confirmed by means of the realization of the causality between the disappearances of two objects. If *svabhāva-pratibandha* does not exist, then it is not possible to confirm the causality between the two disappearances. Conversely, if one can find causality between the two disappearances, then *svabhāva-pratibandha* must exist.

This is the very idea evoked by Dar ma rin chen (1364–1432) when he said

*byas pa mi rtag pa la 'brel ba'i don ldog gi phyogs gcig de gnyis tha dad
mngon sum gyis grub cing / mi rtag pa log pa'i stobs kyis byas pa ldog pa'i
tshul ni mi rtag pa log pa'i gzhi la byas pa 'gog pa'i gnod pa can gyi rtags la
brten nas bsgrub pa yin ...¹⁰*

⁸ According to Śākyabuddhi, KG 75,23.

⁹ The translation “existential dependence” coincides with the translation by F. Th. Stcherbatsky (1930). He translated the first occurrence of *svabhāva-pratibandha* in NB II.19 (p. 69) as “Because one thing can convey the (existence of) another one when it is **existentially dependent** (on the latter)” (my emphasis, Y. F.).

¹⁰ rGyal tshab rje Dar ma rin chen, *tshad ma rnam 'grel gyi tshig le'ur byas pa'i rnam bshad thar lam phyin ci ma log par gsal bar byed pa*, Zhol ed., cha, 22b4–5. That the defining character of *'brel pa* is closely related to the causality of two disappearances was first pointed out in the presentation “rGyal tshab's Understanding of *Svabhāvapratibandha*” by Choi Kyeon-jin at the Conference of the International Association of Tibetan Studies, 2013, Ulaanbaatar.

don ldog is an equivalent of *mtshan nyid*, that is, the “defining character.” Therefore in this passage Dar ma rin chen is postulating that there are two conditions that define the character of the dependence of the produced object upon an impermanent object: (1) the two objects must be different, and (2) the disappearance of the former object is caused by force of the disappearance of the latter object.

It is obvious that the second condition is based on *ekaniṣṭṭyānyanivṛtti*. *don ldog* literally means the distinguishing character in the object, and therefore this *ekaniṣṭṭyānyanivṛtti* is a distinguishing character of *pratibandha*. This is indirect evidence of the close relationship between *pratibandha* and *ekaniṣṭṭyānyanivṛtti*.

Problems in the Tibetan translation of the PVSV and the commentaries on Dharmakīrti

As shown above, there is little that remains speculative about the meaning of *pratibandha* in the texts of Dharmakīrti. Now I would like to point out some interesting matters that can be drawn from the Tibetan translation of the PVSV and its commentary.

I have already mentioned that in the *Abhidharmakośa* and *Mahāvīyūtpatti*, *pratibaddha* is in most cases translated as *rag las pa*. In passages no. 1 to no. 25 of fifty-one citations in List C, below with the exception of no. 5, *pratibandha/pratibaddha* is translated as *'bral ba/pa* and in the rest of the passages, with the exception of nos. 27 and 34, it is translated as *rag las/lus pa*. The same situation is found in the Tibetan translation of the commentary on the PVSV by Śākyabuddhi (PVT). In half of the cases translated into *rag las/lus pa*, *pratibandha/pratibaddha* is used in the context of the basis for the logical nexus. For example, *svabhāva-pratibandha* in passages nos. 44 and 46 is translated as *rang bzhin la/gyi rag lus pa*, not as *rang bzhin (dang) 'brel ba*, which is the translation in the first half of the cases of *svabhāva-pratibandha/pratibaddha-svabhāva*. In passage no. 40, *tadapratibaddhasvabhāva* is properly translated as *de la rag lus pa med pa'i rang bzhin can gyi*, with the meaning of the *bahuvrīhi* compound. As mentioned above, there is no distinction made between *svabhāva-pratibandha* and *pratibaddha-svabhāva* in the Tibetan translation. This transition of the Tibetan translation of the PVSV and PVT might mean that the translator(s)¹¹ of these two texts realized Dharmakīrti's intentions behind this term in the process of their translation work, and changed their translation of *pratibandha/pratibaddha* halfway through.

But other Tibetan scholars who did not consult the Sanskrit texts must not have noticed that *rag las/lus pa* was the translation of *pratibandha*. Amazingly, they properly recorded the defining character of *'brel pa* as I have mentioned above, even in such a restricted or incomplete situation. I cannot but concede that they had a very profound ability to understand Dharmakīrti's intentions.

This change in the Tibetan translation of *pratibandha/pratibaddha* may have been influenced by an annotation of Śākyabuddhi, which paraphrases *pratibaddha* as *āyatta* and

¹¹ The colophon of the PVSV does not mention a translator, but that of the PVT mentions *lo ts'a ba rma dge ba'i blo gros*. Perhaps he also translated the PVSV during the same period.

pratibandha as *āyattatva* on several occasions (passages nos. 1,¹² 5, 24, 32, 35, 38, 39, 41, 42, 46).

In the midst of paraphrasing *pratibandha* in NB II.21: *sa ca pratibandhaḥ sādhye 'rthe liṅgasya*, Dharmottara comments that *liṅgam parāyattatvāt pratibaddham / sādhyas tv artho 'parāyattatvāt pratibandhaviṣayo na tu pratibaddha ity arthaḥ /* (NBṬ 112,1f); “*liṅga* is *pratibaddha* because it is dependent upon another [object], while on the other hand *sādhya artha* – because it is not dependent upon the other [namely the *liṅga*] – is an object of *pratibandha*, [but] it is not *pratibaddha*.” Dharmottara clearly interprets *pratibaddha* as *āyatta* and *pratibandha* as *āyattatva*. He also puts *liṅga* and *pratibaddha* in the appositional case and explains that *sādhya* is *pratibandhaviṣaya*. Moreover, Durvekamiśra annotates *pratibandha* three times with *pratibandhaḥ pratibaddhatvam āyattatvam* (NBṬ 96,21; 110,20; 115,15f). These explanations correspond with what I have explicated above in this paper.

Conclusion

To summarize my arguments in this paper:

1. *pratibandha* is more significant than *svabhāva* in the compound *svabhāva-pratibandha*.
2. Generally *svabhāva-pratibandha* is interpreted as *pratibaddha-svabhāvatva*, which is an abstract noun of a *bahuvrīhi* compound. Therefore, *svabhāva* stands for the *liṅga*'s *svabhāva* and *svabhāva-pratibandha* should be understood as a genitive *tatpuruṣa* compound.
3. *pratibandha/pratibaddha* is closely related to the causality of the dual disappearance of two objects (*ekaniṣṭyānyanivṛtti*).
4. Therefore, *pratibandha/pratibaddha* express the existential dependence of one object upon another, of which the former is *liṅga* or *hetu* and the latter is *sādhya*.

References and abbreviations

- AKBh** Vasubandhu, *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya: Abhidharmakośabhāṣyam of Vasubandhu*, ed. P. Pradhan. Patna 1967.
- AKBhT** Vasubandhu, *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya: chos mngon pa'i mdzod kyi bshad pa*. Derge ed. Tohoku No. 4090. mNgon pa'i bstan bcos, gu 27b6–ngu 109a8.
- Choi 2013** Choi Kyeon-jin, rGyal tshab's Understanding of Svabhāvapratibandha. Paper presented at the Conference of the International Association of Tibetan Studies, 2013, Ulaanbaatar.
- Dar ma rin chen** rGyal tshab rje Dar ma rin chen, *tshad ma rnam 'grel gyi tshig le'ur byas pa'i rnam bshad thar lam phyin ci ma log par gsal bar byed pa*. Zhol ed.

¹² At this first mention of *svabhāva-pratibandha*, Śākyabuddhi annotates that *rang bzhin bsgrub par bya ba'i dngos po dang 'brel pa ni de la rag las pa nyid de de yod na'o*. But Karṇakagomin comments differently, that *svabhāvena pratibandhaḥ sādhanam kṛtāiti samāsa / svabhāvena pratibaddhatvam / pratibaddhasvabhāvatvam iti yāvat /* (KG 13,18f), which is the almost same paraphrase as that in Dharmottara's *Nyāyabinduṭīkā* (NBṬ 110,1f).

- Fukuda 1987** Y. Fukuda, An Inquiry into the Structure of Dharmakīrti's Logic. *Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies* 33-1 (1987) 347–345.
- Fukuda 1989** Y. Fukuda, On the meaning of *svabhāvapratibandha* in Dharmakīrti's Logic. *Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies* 35-2 (1989) 888–885.
- Fukuda 2012a** Y. Fukuda, On the Interpretation of the Compound *svabhāvapratibandha*. *Indian Logic* 4 (2012) 205–222.
- Fukuda 2012b** Y. Fukuda, On the Meaning of *pratibandha* in *Pramāṇavārttikasvavṛtti*. *Indian Logic* 5 (2012) 73–107.
- Index to the Abhidharmakośabhāṣya** *Index to the Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*. Pt. 1: Sanskrit-Tibetan-Chinese, ed. Akira Hirakawa et al. Tokyo 1973.
- Kataoka 2012** K. Kataoka, A Sketch of *Svabhāvapratibandha* Studies. *Indian Logic* 5 (2012) 163–204.
- KG** Karṇakagomin, *Pramāṇavārttikasvavṛttiṭīkā: Ācārya-Dharmakīrteḥ Pramāṇavārttikam (svārthānumānaparicchedaḥ) svopajñāvṛtṭyā Karṇakagomiviracitayā taṭṭīkayā ca sahitam*, ed. Rāhula Sāṃkrṭyāyana. Allahabad 1943.
- Mahāvvyutpatti** *A New Critical Edition of the Mahāvvyutpatti: Sanskrit-Tibetan-Mongolian Dictionary of Buddhist Terminology*, ed. Yoichi Fukuda and Yumiko Ishihama. Tokyo 1989.
- NB** Dharmakīrti, Nyāyabindu. See NBT.
- NBT** Dharmottara, Nyāyabinduṭīkā: *Paṇḍita Durveka Miśra's Dharmottarapradīpa*, ed. D. Malvania. Patna 2 1971.
- PV** Dharmakīrti, *Pramāṇavārttika*. See PVSV.
- PVSV** Dharmakīrti, *Pramāṇavārttikasvavṛtti: The Pramāṇavārttikam of Dharmakīrti, the First Chapter with the Autocommentary*, ed. R. Gnoli. Roma 1960.
- PVṬ** Śākyabuddhi, *Pramāṇavārttikaṭīkā: tshad ma rnam 'grel gyi 'grel bshad*, tr. rma dge ba'i bo gros. Derge ed. Tohoku No. 4220. Tshad ma je 1–328a7, nye 1–282a7.
- Stcherbatsky 1930** F. Th. Stcherbatsky, *Buddhist Logic: In Two Volumes. Vol. II Containing a Translation of the Short Treatise of Logic by Dharmakīrti, and of Its Commentary by Dharmottara, with Notes Appendices and Indices*. Leningrad 1930.
- Steinkellner 1984** E. Steinkellner, *Svabhāvapratibandha* Again. *Acta Indologica* 6 (1984) 457–476.
- SVTib** Dharmakīrti, *Pramāṇavārttikasvavṛtti: tshad ma rnam 'grel gyi 'grel pa*. Derge ed. Tohoku No. 4216. Tshad ma ce 261b1–365a7.

List A: *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*

-
1. AKBh *icchāmātrapratibaddho hi teṣāṃ sarvaguṇasampatsaṃmukhībhāvaḥ* / (Ch.2, 70.23)
 AKBhT *de dag gi yon tan 'byor ba mngon sum du 'gyur ba thams cad ni bzhed pa tsam la rag lus pa yin pas ...* (Ku, 76a7)
 一切圓德，隨樂而起故。
2. AKBh *yasya yatpratibaddha utpādaḥ sa tasyānantaram utpadyate* / (Ch.2, 99.13)
 AKBhT *gang zhig gang la rag las te skye ba de ni de'i 'jug thogs su skye ste* / (Ku 100a5)
 若此法生，繫屬彼法，要彼無間，此乃得生。如芽等生，要藉種等。
3. AKBh *tatra pañcavidhamanaskārānantaram āryamārgasammukhībhāvo 'nyatropapa-ttipratilambhikebhyaḥ* / *prayogapratibaddhatvāt* / (Ch.2, 109.1f)
 AKBhT *de la skyes nas thob pa dag ma gtogs pa yid la byed pa rnam pa lnga'i mjug thogs su 'phags pa'i lam mngon du 'gyur te / sbyor ba la rag lus pa'i phyir ro* // (Ku 107b5f)
 此中五種，作意無間，聖道現前。除生所得聖道。繫屬加行心故。
4. AKBh *yadā cāsyāśrayo vipariṇantum ārabhate tadāvaśyam asya tadāśrayapratibaddham* *cittaṃ saṃmukhībhūya paścāt pracyavet nānyathā* / (Ch.3, 156.6f)
 AKBhT *gang gi tshe de'i lus yongs su 'jug par rtsom pa de'i tshe yang de las gdon mi za bar de'i lus dang 'brel pa'i sems mngon du gyur nas phyis 'chi 'pho bar 'gyur gyi gzhan du ni ma yin no* // (Ku, 143a1f)
 若所依身將欲變壞。必定還起屬所依心。然後命終。更無餘理。
5. AKBh *icchāmātrapratibaddhaḥ sarvaguṇasampatsaṃmukhībhāvaḥ* / (Ch.7, 421.3)
 AKBhT *de dag gi yon tan 'byor pa thams cad mngon du 'gyur ba ni bzhed pa tsam la rag lus so* // (Khu, 122b5)
 諸佛功德 . . . 隨欲能引現前。
-

List B: *Mahāvvyutpatti*

-
- 6483 *pratibandhaḥ* / *phyir 'jil ba'am bgegs byed pa'am bar chad byed pa* /
 6481 *pratibaddhaḥ* / *rag lus pa'am 'brel ba'am bgegs su gyur pa* /
-

List C: PVSV, commentaries of Śākyabuddhi and Karṇakagomin

-
1. PVSV *svabhāvapratibandhe hi saty artho 'rthaṃ na vyabhicarati / (2,19)*
 SVTib *rang bzhin dang 'brel pa yod pa don gyis don 'khrul pa med de / (262a6f)*
 KG *svabhāvena pratibandhaḥ sādhanam kṛteti samāsaḥ / svabhāvena pratibaddhatvam / pratibaddha-svabhāvatvam iti yāvat / (23,16f)*
 PVT *(≠) rang bzhin bsgrub par bya ba'i dngos po dang 'brel pa ni de la rag las pa nyid de de yod na'o // (10a7)*
 2. PVSV *kāryasyāpi svabhāvapratibandhaḥ / (3,3f)*
 SVTib *'bras bu yang rang bzhin dang 'brel pa yin te / (262b2)*
 KG – (24,25); PVT: – (11a2)
 3. PVSV *tatrānubhayasyāpratibandhāt tadabhāve anyena na bhavitavyam iti kuta etat / (5,19f)*
 SVTib *de la gnyis ka ma yin pa ni 'brel pa med pa'i phyir te / de med na gzhan med par 'gyur ro // zhes bya ba der lta ga la 'gyur // (263b7)*
 KG *anubhayasyākāryakāranātmakasya niṣedhyena saha pratibandhābhāvāt tadabhāve 'pratibaddhasyābhāve / (38,17f)*
 PVT *gnyi ga ma yin pa ste rgyu yang ma yin la 'bras bu yang ma yin pa'i bdag nyid ni dgag par bya ba dang lhan cig 'brel pa med pa'i phyir de med na ste 'brel pa med pa med na ... (16b2)*
 4. PVSV *apratibaddhasvabhāvasyāvinābhāvanīyamābhāvāt / (8,12f)*
 SVTib *rang bzhin ma 'brel pa ni med na mi 'byung bar nges pa med pa'i phyir ro // (265a6)*
 KG *tādātmyatadutpattibhyāṃ liṅginy apratibaddhasvabhāvasyāvinābhāvanīyamābhāvāt / (49,12)*
 PVT *de'i bdag nyid dang de las byung ba dag gi rtags can dang / rang bzhin ma 'brel pa ni med na ma 'byung bar nges pa med pa'i phyir ro // (22b2f)*
 5. PVSV *nāntarīyakam eva kāryaṃ kāraṇam anumāpayati / tatpratibandhāt / (10,5f)*
 SVTib *med na mi 'byung ba'i 'bras bu kho nas rgyu rjes su dpog par byed do // de la rag las pa yin pa'i phyir ro // (266a6)*
 KG *taipratibandhāt / tatra kāraṇe āyattatvāt / (55,4f)*
 PVT *med na mi 'byung ba'i 'bras bu kho nas zhes bya ba ni rgyu med na mi 'byung ba kho nas so // de la rag las pa yin pa'i phyir zhes bya ba ni rgyu de la rag las pa yin pa'i phyir ro // (26b2f)*
 6. PVSV *ekaniṣṭṭyā 'nyaniṣṭṭim icchatā tayoh kaścit svabhāvapratibandho 'py eṣṭavyaḥ / anyathā 'gamako hetuḥ syāt / (10,23f)*
 SVTib *gcig log pas gzhan ldog par 'dod pas ni de gnyis rang bzhin 'brel pa 'ga' zhig kyang 'dod par bya dgos so // de lta ma yin na gtan tshigs go bar byed pa ma yin par 'gyur ro // (266b6)*
 KG *tayoh sādhyasādhanayoh kaścit svabhāvena pratibandhas tādātmyatadutpattilakṣaṇo [']py eṣṭavyaḥ / (57,7f)*

- PVṬ (=) *bsgrub par bya ba dang sgrub pa de gnyis de'i bdag nyid dang l de las byung ba'i mtshan nyid kyis 'brel pa 'ga' zhig kyang 'dod par bya dgos te l (28a2f)*
7. PVSV *na hy asati **pratibandhe** 'nvayavyatirekaniścayo 'sti l (10,28)*
 SVTib *'brel pa med par ni rjes su 'gro ba dang ldog pa nges pa med de l (266b7)*
 KG – (59,27); PVṬ: – (28a6)
8. PVSV *anyathā hy asati **pratibandhe** 'darśanamātreṇa vyatireke l (11,5)*
 SVTib *de lta ma yin te l 'brel pa med par ma mthong ba tsam gyis ldog na l (267a2)*
 KG – (58,23); PVṬ: – (28b6)
9. PVSV *anupalambhāt tu kvacid abhāvasiddhāv apy **apratibaddhasya** tadabhāve sarva-trābhāvāsiddheḥ l (12,23f)*
 SVTib *mi dmigs pa'i sgo nas ni 'ga' zhig la med pa grub tu zin kyang 'brel pa med pa ni de med kyang thams cad la med pa mi grub pas l (267b4f)*
 KG ***apratibaddhasya** hetoḥ sādhye l tadabhāve sādhyābhāve sarvatra vipakṣe 'bhāvāsiddheḥ... (62,9f)*
 PVṬ *gtan tshigs bsgrub par bya ba **dang 'brel pa med pa** ni sgrub par byed pa de med kyang mi mthun pa'i phyogs su gyur ba'i dngos po thams cad la med par mi 'grub pa'i gtan tshigs kyis na the tshom za ba yin no ll (31a5)*
10. PVSV *tannivṛttau kvacin nivṛttāv api prāṇādīnām **apratibandhāt** l sarvatra nivṛtṭya-siddher agamakatvam l (13,10f)*
 SVTib *'ga' zhig la de log ste l srog la sogs pa log kyang 'brel pa med pa'i **phyir** l thams cad las ldog pa mi 'grub pas rtogs par byed pa ma yin pa nyid do ll (268a2)*
 KG *nivṛttāv api prāṇādīnām **apratibandhād** ātmanā saha sambandhābhāvāt l (63,23f)*
 PVṬ *srog la sogs pa log kyang 'brel pa med pa'i **phyir** l bdag dang lhan cig 'brel pa med pa'i phyir ... (32a4)*
11. PVSV *yadi kathamcid vipakṣe 'darśanamātreṇa **apratibaddhasyāpi** tadavyabhicāraḥ l (15,11)*
 SVTib *gal te ji zhig ltar mi mthun pa'i phyogs la ma mthong ba tsam gyis 'brel pa med **pa** yang de 'khrul pa med do zhe na l (269a1)*
 KG *yadi vipakṣe hetor adarśanamātreṇā**pratibaddhasya** svasādhye tadavyabhicāraḥ sādhyāvyabhicāra iṣyate l (69,2f)*
 PVṬ *gal te mi mthun pa'i phyogs la gtan tshigs ma mthong ba tsam gyis bsgrub par bya ba **dang 'brel pa med pa'i** yang bsgrub par bya ba der 'khrul pa med par 'dod na ni ... (35a6f)*
12. PVSV *svaṃ ca svabhāvaṃ parityajya katham bhāvo bhavet l svabhāvasyaiva bhāvāt tvād iti tasya **svabhāva-pratibandhād** avyabhicāraḥ l (17,1f)*
 SVTib *rang gi ngo bo yongs su bor nas kyang ji ltar yod par 'gyur te l rang gi ngo bo kho na ngo bo yin pa'i phyir ro ll de'i phyir de ni rang **bzhin 'brel pa'i phyir** 'khrul pa med do ll (270a3)*
 KG *tasyātmabhūtasya sādhanasya śiṃśapādeḥ **svabhāvapratibandhād** eva svabhāve sādhyābhimate vṛkṣādau yathoktena prakāreṇa **pratibandhād** evāvyabhicāraḥ l (75,3f)*

- PVṬ *sgrub pa shing sha pa la sogs pa bdag nyid du gyur pa de ni rang bzhin 'brel pa kho na'i phyir te / rang bzhin bsgrub par bya bar 'dod pa shing la sogs pa dang ji skad bshad pa'i rnam pas 'brel pa kho nas 'khrul pa med do // (39b7f)*
13. PVSV *ubhayathā svabhāvapratibandhād eva nivṛtṭiḥ / (17,7)*
SVTib *gnyis ga rang bzhin 'brel pa kho nas ldog go // (270a4f)*
KG *ubhayatheti tādātmyena tadutpattiyā vā yaḥ svabhāvapratibandhas tasmād eva / sādhyānivṛtṭiyā hetor nivṛtṭiḥ / anyatheti yadi pratibandho neṣyate / ekasyāpratibandhakasya sādhyasya nivṛtṭyānyānivṛtṭiḥ / apratibaddhasya sādhanadhar-masya nivṛtṭiḥ katham bhavet / (75,11f)*
- PVṬ *(=) gnyi gar zhes bya ba ni de'i bdag nyid dang / de las byung ba'i mtshan nyid kyis rang bzhin 'brel pa kho nas bsgrub par bya ba log pas gtan tshigs ldog go // de lta min na gcig log pas zhes bya ba ni bsgrub par bya ba ma 'brel pa log pas / ji ltar gzhan mi ldog par 'gyur sgrub pa'i chos ma 'brel pa ldog par 'gyur mi 'gyur ba kho na ste / (40a3f)*
14. PVSV *svabhāvapratibandhād eva hetuḥ sādhyam gamayati / sa ca tadbhāvalakṣaṇas tadutpattilakṣaṇo vā / (17,12f)*
SVTib *rang bzhin 'brel pa kho nas gtan tshigs kyis bsgrub par bya ba go bar byed de // de'i ngo bo'i mtshan nyid dam // de las byung ba'i mtshan nyid yin no // (270a6)*
KG *svabhāvapratibandhād eva sādhyābhimate vastuni pratibaddhatvād eva hetuḥ svasādhyam gamayati / (76,1f)*
PVṬ *rang bzhin 'brel pa kho nas bsgrub par bya bar 'dod pa'i dngos po dang 'brel pa kho nas gtan tshigs kyis bsgrub par bya ba go bar byed do // (40a6)*
15. PVSV *yadā punar dṛṣṭāntena nāgnidhūmayoḥ kāryakāraṇabhāvaḥ pradarśyate / tadā yatra dhūmas tratrāgnir ity eva na syāt / pratibandhābhāvāt / (19,16f)*
SVTib *gang gi tshe dpes me dang du ba dag rgyu dang 'bras bu'i dngos por mi ston pa de'i tshe ni 'brel pa med pa'i phyir / gang na du ba yod pa de na me yod do zhes bya ba nyid du yang mi 'gyur na / (271a7)*
KG – (85,5f); PVṬ: – (44a2f)
16. PVSV *dṛṣṭāntenāyam eva yathoktasvabhāvapratibandhaḥ pradarśyate / (19,21f)*
SVTib *dpes ji skad bshad pa'i rang bzhin 'brel pa 'di kho na rab tu ston pa / (271b1f)*
KG – (85,8f); PVṬ: – (44a4)
17. PVSV *tāv eva hi nivartamānau svapratibaddham nivartayata iti / (19,25)*
SVTib *de dag kho na ldog pa na rang gi 'brel pa zlog par byed pas ... (271b2)*
KG *tāv eva hi kāraṇavyāpakau nivarttamānau svapratibaddham kāryam vyāpyam ca svabhāvam nivarttayata ... (85,14f)*
PVṬ *rgyu dang khyab par byed pa de dag kho na ldog pa na / rang dang 'brel pa 'bras bu dang rang bzhin khyab par bya ba zlog par byed pas / (44a5f)*
18. PVSV *apratibandhe hi katham ekasya nivṛttir anyasya nivṛtṭim sādhayet / (20,1f)*
SVTib *ma 'brel na ni ji ltar gcig log pas gzhan ldog pa sgrub par byed / (271b3)*
KG – (85,18f); PVṬ: – (44a7)
19. PVSV *yadi nāmaite śabdāḥ puruṣaiḥ kvacit praṇiṅṣitā api na śakyante praṇetum vastupratibandhād dhūmādivat / (35,20f)*

22. PVSV *vikalpānām arthapratibandhaniyamābhāvāt / na hi vikalpā yathārtham eva jāyante / (51,8f)*
 SVTib *rnam par rtog pa rnam don **dang 'brel par** nges pa med pa'i phyir te / rnam par rtog pa rnam ni don ji lta ba bzhin skye ba med pa nyid do // (290a4f)*
 KG *arthapratibaddho 'rthākārānuvidhānenaotpattiḥ / (212,10)*
 PVT *don **dang 'brel pa** ni don gyi rnam pa'i rjes su byed par skye ba'o // (116a2)*
23. PVSV *upakāre 'pi tatraiva tatpratibandha iti kim anyas tatkarāṇāt tadupakārī / (53,24f)*
 SVTib *phan 'dogs na yang de kho na la de **'brel pas** de byed pa'i phyir de la phan par byed pa gzhan ci dgos / (291b1)*
 KG *upakāre vā sāmānyakṛte upakārasyābhyupagamyamāne / tatraiva sāmānye tasyopakārasya **pratibandha** iti kim anyo vyaktibhedas tasyopakārasya karāṇāt tasya sāmānyasyopakārī ... (218,15f)*
 PVT *phan 'dogs na yang zhes bya ba ni spyis byas pa'i phan pa khas len na spyi de kho na la phan pa de **'brel pas** de byed pa'i phyir spyi de la phan par byed pa gsal ba'i khyad par gzhan ci dgos te ... (120a1f)*
24. PVSV *tadutpattidharmā bhāvaḥ svabhāvapratibandhād apekṣate nāma / (53,26f)*
 SVTib *de las skye ba'i chos can ni **rang bzhin 'brel pa'i phyir** ltos pa zhes bya'o // (291b2)*
 KG *tasmād apekṣaṇīyād utpattiḥ sā dharmāḥ svabhāvo yasya sa tadutpattidharmma-bhāvaḥ / **svabhāvasya pratibandhād** āyattatvād apekṣate nāma upakāriṇam ... (218,20f)*
 PVT *gang la chos de'i ngo bo nyid yod pa de ni de las skyes ba'i chos can gyi dngos po'o // **rang bzhin 'brel** cing rag las pa'i phyir phan par byed pa la ltos pa zhes bya ste / (120a3f)*
25. PVSV *yaḥ kaścit kasyacit kvacit **pratibandhaḥ** sa sarvo janyatāyām evāntarbhavati / (54,1f)*
 SVTib *gang cung zad 'ga' zhig la lar **'brel pa** de thams cad ni bskyed par bya ba'i khongs su gtogs so // (291b3)*
 KG *yaḥ kaścid bhāvaḥ **pratibandhaḥ** kasyacid vastunaḥ kvacid āśraye sa sarvo janyatāyām kāryatāyām evodbhavati / (219,3f)*
 PVT *gang cung zad dngos po 'ga' zhig rten la lar **'brel pa** dngos po las gyur pa de thams cad ni bskyed par bya ba ste / 'bras bu kho na'i khongs su gtogs so // (120a6f)*
26. PVSV *katham anyonyasya sāmīyam / tatsaṃbandhād iti cet / na / **apratibaddhasya saṃbandhāyogāt** / (55,18f)*
 SVTib *ji ltar gzhan dang gzhan du mtshungs pa yin / gal te de dag dang **'brel pa'i** phyir ro // zhe na ma yin te / **rag ma las pa la** 'brel par mi rung ba'i phyir dang / (292b1f)*
 KG ***apratibaddhasya** vyaktāv anāyattasya tābhir anupakṛtasyety arthaḥ / (224,21f)*
 PVT ***rag ma las pa la** gsal ba la rag ma las pa la ste / de dag gis phan ma btags pa la zhes bya ba'i tha tshig go // (125a1f)*

27. PVSV *tathābhūtārthadarśanadvāreṇāyaṃ nānaikadharmabhedābhedapratibhāsavi-plavānusārī vyavahāra iti tasya tat**pratibandhe** sati tadavyabhicāraḥ* / (65,3f)
 SVTib *tha snyad 'di ni yang dag pa'i don de bzhin du mthong ba'i sgo nas chos du ma dang / gcig dang / tha dad pa dang / tha dad pa ma yin par snang ba 'khrul pa'i rjes su 'brang ba'i phyir / de dang der '**brel par** 'gyur ba la de (DN: las du) ma 'khrul pa yin no // (297a5f)*
 KG *tasya vyavahārasya tat**pratibandhe** tasmimṣ tathābhūte svalakṣaṇe pāramparyenotpattipratibandhe sati tadavyabhicāraḥ / vastvavyabhicāraḥ* / (260,12f)
 PVT *de ste tha snyad der '**brel par** gyur pa de lta bur gyur pa'i rang gi mtshan nyid der brgyud pas 'byung ba'i '**brel pa** yod na de ma 'khrul te / dngos po la ma 'khrul pa yin no // (153b3f)*
28. PVSV *samavāyasamyogāv ekārthasamavāyādayo 'pi vastusambandhāḥ kāryakāraṇabhāvān na vyatiricyante / parasparam anyato vānupakāriṇām **apratibandhāt** / **apratibaddhasya** ca asambandhāt* (70,3f)
 SVTib *phrod pa 'du ba dang ldan pa dang / don gcig la 'du ba zhes bya ba la sogs pa dngos po'i 'brel pa dag kyang rgyu dang 'bras bu'i dngos po las tha dad pa ma yin no // gcig la gcig gam gzhan dag gis phan 'dogs pa med pa ni **rag lus pa med pa'i phyir** dang / **rag lus pa med pa** yang 'brel pa med pa'i phyir ro // (300a6f)*
 KG *parasparam anyonyam upakāriṇām anyato vā 'śrayābhimatād anupakāriṇām **apratibandhād** anāyattatvāt / apratibaddhannasya [=apratibandhasya] cāsam-bandhāt kāraṇāt ... (278,1f)*
 PVT *gcig la gcig te / phan tshun nam rten du mngon par 'dod pa gzhan gyis phan btags pa med pa'o // phan btags pa med pa ni **rag lus pa med pa'i phyir** te / ltos pa med pa'i rgyu'i phyir ... (167a5)*
29. PVSV *tatrāpi kāryakāraṇabhāvakṛta eva **pratibandhaḥ*** / (70,9f)
 SVTib *de la yang rgyu dang 'bras bu'i dngos por byas pa kho na **rag lus pa** yin no // (300b1)*
 KG *tatrāpy ekārthasamavāyini kāryakāraṇabhāvakṛta evāśrayeṇa saha yaḥ kāryakāraṇabhāvas tatḥ eva yadvāreṇāropita eva sambandhaḥ* / (278,15f)
 PVT *(=) don gcig dang 'phrod pa 'du ba de la yang rgyu dang 'bras bu'i dngos por byas pa kho na ste / rten dang bcas pa'i rgyu dang 'bras bu'i dngos po gang yin pa des byas shing des sbyar ba kho na **rag lus pa'i** 'brel pa yin no // (167b4f)*
30. PVSV *tām eva sa āśrayaḥ karoti / sā **cāpratibaddhā** sāmānya iti kim sāmānyasyāśrayeṇa* / (72,2f)
 SVTib *de nyid de'i rten byed pa yin la / de yang spyi **la rag ma lus pa** 'i phyir / spyi'i rten gyis ci zhig byed / (301b2)*
 KG *sety arthāntarabhūtā sthitiḥ / na hi tasyāḥ sāmānye **pratibandhakāraṇaṃ** kiṃcid asti ... (285,18)*
 PVT *de zhes bya ba ni gnas pa don gzhan du 'gyur pa'o // de la spyi **la rag lus pa** 'i rgyu cung zhig kyang yod pa ma yin no // (172a1f)*
31. PVSV *pratibaddhe vā kaḥ **pratibandha** iti vācyam* / (72,3f)
 SVTib *rag las pa kho na **la rag las pa** zhes ji ltar brjod par bya / (301b2)*
 KG *abhyupagamyata eva sthiteḥ sāmānye **pratibandha** iti ced āha* / (285,10)

- PVṬ *gal te gnas pa ni spyi **la rag lus par khas blangs pa kno na yin no zhe na** / (172a2)*
32. PVSV *apekṣeti hi tat**pratibandhaḥ** sa cānādheyaviśeṣasya sāmānyasyāyukta iti / (72,7f)*
- SVTib *ltos pa zhes bya ba ni de **la rag lus pa** yin na de yang spyi khyad par med pa la mi rigs pa dang ... (301b3f)*
- KG *asmin vastuny asyāpekṣeti yeyam apekṣā sā tasminn apekṣye **pratibandhas tadāyattatā** / (286,2f)*
- PVṬ *dngos po 'di la 'di ltos pa zhes bya ba la ltos pa gang yin pa de ni ltos par bya ba 'di **dang 'brel** cing de la rag lus pa nyid de // (172b3)*
33. PVSV *nāpi vyatirekiṇas tasya kvacid anāśrayād anyasyāpi vyaṅgyavyaṅjakabhāvādeḥ saṃbandhasya kenacid anupakāryasyā**pratibandhenābhāvāt** / (75,27f)*
- SVTib *tha dad pa las kyang ma yin te / de 'ga' zhig la yang brten pa med pa'i phyir ro // 'ga' zhig gis phan btags pa med par **rag lus pa med pas na** bsal bar bya ba dang / bsal bar byed pa'i ngo bo la sogs pa las 'brel pa gzhan yang med pa'i phyir (303b6f)*
- KG *kiñ kāraṇaṃ / nityatvāt kenacid vyaktibhedenānupakāryasya sāmānyasyā**pratibandhena** / na hy **apratibandhasya** kaścit sambandho 'stīty uktaṃ / (297,8f)*
- PVṬ *ci'i phyir zhe na / rtag pa nyid kyis gsal ba'i khyad par 'ga' zhig gis phan btags pa med pa'i spyi **rag lus pa med pa'i phyir** ro // **rag lus pa med pa'i** 'brel pa 'ga' zhig kyang yod pa ma yin no // (180b3f)*
34. PVSV *kvacid avisamvādo 'syā vastuni kāryakāraṇabhāv**apratibandhān** ... (76,20f)*
- SVTib *'ga' zhig la 'di'i mi slu ba ni dngos po la rgyu dang 'bras bu'i ngo bo'i (D adds 'bras bu'i) **'brel pa las** yin gyi / (304a6)*
- KG *kvacid vastuny asya buddheḥ sakāśād avisamvādo yasmāt kāryakāraṇasambaddhād ... (300,4f)*
- PVṬ *dgnos po 'ga' zhig la 'di la blo las mi bslu ba gang yin pa de ni / rgyu dang 'bras bu'i 'brel pa las yin te / (182b6)*
35. PVSV *tad dhi kiṃcid upalīyeta na vā yasya yatra kiṃcid **pratibaddham apratibaddham** vā / (99,27f)*
- SVTib *de ni cung zhig 'ga' zhig la **'brel pa** ma yin te / (D: no //) gang gang la cung zhig rag las pa ma yin no // (317a6f)*
- KG *tad dhi vastu / kiṃcid upalīyet āśrayet / yasya yatra kiṃcid utpādādikaṃ **pratibaddham** āyattaṃ / na copalīyeta yasya yatrā**pratibaddham** / (366,2f)*
- PVṬ *dngos po de ni rten du gyur pa 'ga' zhig la 'brel ba ste brten par 'gyur ba'am / gang gang la skyed par byed pa po la sogs pa la cung zhig **rag lus pa** ste ltos pa'am / 'brel pa med pa ma yin zhing gang gang la **rag lus pa ma yin** no // (226b1f)*
36. PVSV *seyamṣ sattā **apratibandhini** cet / niyamavatī na syāt / (99,28f)*
- SVTib *gal te yod pa nyid de 'di ni 'ga' zhig **la rag lus pa can ma yin** no zhe na / nges pa can du mi 'gyur ro // (317a7)*
- KG *seyamṣ sattā kvacid **apratibandhini** cet / dravyakālāpekṣayā na niyamavatī syāt / (366,4)*

- PVṬ *gal te yod pa nyid de 'di ni 'ga' zhig **la rag lus pa can ma yin** no zhe na / rdzas dang yul dang dus la ltos par nges pa can du mi 'gyur te / (226b2)*
37. PVSV *yathāsvaṃ vyāpini sādhye tayor eva **pratibandhāt** liṅgayor liṅgini / (101,1f)*
 SVTib *bdag nyid ji lta ba bzhin du khyab (D: khyad) par byed pa bsgrub par bya ba'i rtags can la rtags de dag **rag lus pa'i phyir** ... (318a1f)*
- KG *kāryasya kāraṇaṃ vyāpakaṃ sādhyam (I) svabhāvasyāpi svabhāvo vyāpakaḥ sādhyas tasmin sādhye liṅgini tayor eva kāryasvabhāvayor liṅgayoḥ **pratibandhāt** / (370,5f)*
- PVṬ *'bras bu'i rgyu khyab par byed pa bsgrub par bya ba yin la / rang bzhin gyi yang rang bzhin khyab par byed pa bsgrub par bya ba yin te / bsgrub par bya ba rtags can de la 'bras bu dang / rang bzhin gyi rtags de dag de nyid **rag lus pa'i phyir** ro // (228a2f)*
38. PVSV *sadasatpakṣabhedena śabdārthānapavādibhiḥ // vastv eva cintyate hy atra **pratibaddhaḥ** phalaodayaḥ // (106,27f)*
 SVTib *sgra don bsnyon pa med rnam kyis // yod med phyogs kyi bye brag gis // dngos po nyid ni dpyad bya ste // 'di la 'bras 'byung **rag las** phyir // (321b1f)*
- KG *yasmād atra vastuni **pratibaddhaḥ** phalodayaḥ / (387,11)*
- PVṬ *ci'i phyir zhe na / 'di ltar dngos po 'di la 'bras bu **rag las** phyir sgra'i don la ni ma yin no // (240b7f)*
39. PVSV *tad ayaṃ pravartamānaḥ sarvadā sadasaccintāyām avadhīritavikalpapratibhāso vastv evādhiṣṭhānīkaroti / yatrāyaṃ puruṣārthaḥ **pratibaddho** ... (107,3f)*
 SVTib *de bas na 'di 'jug pa na thams cad du yod pa dang med pa dpyod pa na rnam par rtog pa'i snang ba la ltos pa med par gang la skyes bu'i don 'di **rag lus pa'i** dngos po nyid la dmigs par byed de ... (321b3f)*
- KG *vastv evādhiṣṭhānīkaroti viṣayīkaroti yatra vastuny ayaṃ puruṣārthaḥ **pratibaddhaḥ** / (388,4f)*
- PVṬ *dngos po gang la skyes bu'i don 'di **rag lus pa'i** dngos po nyid la dmigs par byed cing yul du byed de / (241a5)*
40. PVSV *na ca tadapratibaddhasvabhāvo bhāvo 'nyam gamayati / (107,25)*
 SVTib *de **la rag lus pa med pa'i rang bzhin can gyi** dngos po ni gzhan go bar byed pa ma yin no // (322a3)*
- KG *tasmin vastuny **apratibaddhaḥ svabhāvo** yasya śabdalaḥṣaṇasya / anyam yatrāsau na **pratibaddhaḥ** / (390,7f)*
- PVṬ *(=) dngos po de **la rag lus pa med pa'i rang bzhin** gyi sgra'i bdag nyid can gyi dngos po gang la yod pa zhes bya bar tshig rnam par sbyar ro // gang **la rag lus pa med pa** ni gzhan de'i go bar byed pa ma yin no zhes bya bar sbyar ro // (242b2f)*
41. PVSV *paryavasthānajanmapratibaddhaduḥkavivekāt / (111,5)*
 SVTib *kun nas dkris pa dang skye ba **la rag lus pa'i** sdug bsngal dang bral ba'i phyir dang / (324a3)*
- KG *tayor yat **pratibaddhan** duḥkhan tasya vivekāt / rāgādyutpattikāle yad duḥkham kāyacittaparidāhalakṣaṇan tat paryavasthānapratibaddham jātijarāvvyādhyādi-duḥkhan tu janmapratibaddham / (400,18f)*

- PVṬ *de dag la rag lus pa'i sdug bsngal gang yin pa de dang bral ba'i phyir ro // 'dod chags la sogs pa'i skye ba'i tshe lus dang sems yongs su gdung ba'i mtshan nyid can gyi sdug bsngal gang yin pa de ni kun nas dkris pa la rag lus pa'o // skye ba dang rga ba dang na ba'i sdug bsngal ni skye ba la rag lus pa'o // (251b3f)*
42. PVSV *tataḥ katham idānīm tatpratiniyamasamsādhyam tadanvayam sādhayeyuḥ / na hy apratibaddhas tatsādhana iti / (114,28f)*
- SVTib *de bas na de la so sor nges par bsgrub par bya ba de'i rjes su 'gro ba ji ltar sgrub par byed par 'gyur te / rag las pa med pa de'i (D adds ni) sgrub par byed pa ma yin no // (326a7)*
- KG *bāhye 'rthe 'pratibandhena niyamābhāvāt / (417,5)*
- PVṬ *(=) don gang la rag las pa med pa de ni sgrub par byed pa'i rigs pa ma yin no // (260b2)*
43. PVSV *parāśrayo hi sambandho 'pratibandhe tayoh sambandhitā 'yogāt / (115,14)*
- SVTib *gzhan la (D adds /) rten pa can 'brel pa yin na ni rag las pa med pa la de dag gi 'brel pa nyid mi rung ba'i phyir ro // (326b4)*
- KG *parāśraya iti parassambandhī āśrayo [']syeti kṛtvā / sambandhini sambandhasyāpratibandhe sati tayoh sambandhinos sambandhitāyā 'yogāt / na hy apratibaddhena kenacit kaścit tadvān bhavati gaur ivāśvena / (418,15f)*
- PVṬ *(=) gzhan la brten pa can 'brel pa yin te / 'brel pa 'di la gzhan la brten pa yod pa'i phyir ro // ni'i sgras (D adds ni) nges par gzung ba'o // ci'i phyir zhe na / 'brel pa can la 'brel pa rag las pa med pa yin na 'brel pa can de dag gi 'brel pa nyid mi rung ba'i phyir ro // rta ba lang dang 'dra bar ltos pa med pas don 'ga' zhig de dang ldan par mi 'gyur ro // (261b3f)*
44. PVSV *svabhāvāpratibandho 'nyattvam iti cet / (147,3f)*
- SVTib *gal te rang bzhin la rag lus pa med pa ni gzhan nyid yin no zhe na / (346b5f)*
- KG *nanv atatsvabhāvatve 'pi parasparam svabhāvāpratibandho [']nyattvam iti cet / sa ca pratibandhaḥ pudgalasya skandheṣu asti tato tatsvabhāvatve [']pi nānyattvam skandhebhyaḥ pudgalasyeti / (527,16f)*
- PVṬ *gal te rang bzhin la rag lus pa med pa ni gzhan nyid yin na gang zag gi rag lus pa de yang phung po dag la yod pa de bas na de'i rang bzhin ma yin kyang phung po dag las gang zag gzhan nyid ma yin no zhe na / (326a6f)*
45. PVSV *ko 'yam pratibandho nāma yena sa ca na syāt / nānyasvabhāvaś ca / (147,4f)*
- SVTib *rag lus pa zhes bya ba 'di gang yin / gang gis der yang mi 'gyur ba dang / rang bzhin gzhan du'ang mi 'gyur / (346b6)*
- KG *ko [']yam pratibandho nāma pudgalasya skandheṣu yena pratibandhena / sa ca na syād iti skandha-svabhāvaś ca pudgalo na syāt / nānyasvabhāvaś ca skandhebhyaḥ / (527,19f)*
- PVṬ *phung po dag la gang zag gi rag lus pa zhes bya ba 'di'i gang yin / rag lus pa'i rgyu gang gis der yang mi 'gyur ba zhes bya ba gang zag phung po'i rang bzhin du mi 'gyur ba dang gzhan gyi rang bzhin can du mi 'gyur ba ste / (326a7f)*
46. PVSV *na ca tajjanmalakṣaṇāt svabhāvāpratibandhād anyah pratibandho nāma / anāyattasya vyabhicārā-virodhāt / (147,10f)*

- SVTib *de'i skye ba'i mtshan nyid kyi **rang bzhin gyi rag las pa las rag lus pa** gzhan yang yod pa ma yin te / rag lus pa med pa'i 'khrul pa la 'gal ba med pa'i phyir ro // (347a1f)*
- KG *na cānyaḥ **pratibandhaḥ** pudgalasya skandheṣu / yasmān na hi janmalakṣaṇāj janmasvabhāvāt **svabhāvapratibandhād** anyaḥ **pratibandho** nāma / kim kāraṇam (l) anāyattasya tadutpattiyā tatrā**pratibaddhasya** / tena saha yo vyabhicāras tasyāvirodhāt / (528,8f)*
- PVṬ *(=) gal te skye ba'i mtshan nyid can gyi **rag lus pas** phung po dag las gang zag gzhan nyid du yod pa ni ma yin mod kyi 'on kyang **rag lus pa** gzhan nyid du yod do zhe na / de'i zhes bya ba la sogs pa smos te / skye ba'i mtshan nyid can te / skye ba'i dbang po can gyi **rang bzhin gyi rag las pa las rag lus pa** zhes bya ba gzhan yod pa ma yin no // ci'i phyir zhe na / de las byung ba'i rag lus pa med pa de ni de **la rag lus pa med pa** de dang lhan cig 'khrul pa gang yin pa de la 'gal ba med pa'i phyir ro // gang zhig gang **la rag lus pa med pa** de ni der 'khrul pa'i phyir zhes bya ba'i tha tshig go // (326b5f)*
47. PVSV *jñānakṛtaḥ **pratibandha** iti cet / syād etat / yatpratipattināntarīyakam yajjñānaṃ tadgatau niyamena tatpratibhāsanāt tad atadrūpam apy avācyam iti / (147,12f)*
- SVTib *gal te shes pas byas pa'i **rag lus pa** yin no zhe na / de ltar ni 'gyur na gang rtogs pa med na mi 'byung ba'i shes pa gang yin pa des rtogs pa la nges par de snang ba'i phyir de de'i ngo bo ma yin du zin kyang / brjod par bya ba ma yin no zhe na / (347a2f)*
- KG *pudgalasya skandheṣu jñānakṛtaḥ **pratibandha** iti cet / ... / yasya rūpādeḥ pratipattir yatpratipattis tayā nāntarīyakam avinābhāvi yajjñānaṃ yasya pudgalasya jñānaṃ / tadgatāv iti rūpādigatau niyamena tasya pudgalasya pratibhāsanāt / jñānakṛtaḥ **pratibandhas** ... / tena jñānakṛtāt **pratibandhāt** / (528,13f)*
- PVṬ *(≠) phung po dag las gang zag gi shes pas byas pa'i **rag lus pa** yin no zhe na / ... (327a4)*
48. PVSV *nanu saivāsati **pratibandhe** na yuktety ucyate / (147,26)*
- SVTib *de nyid **rag lus pa** (DN inserts med pa) med par rigs pa ma yin no zhes brjod pa ma yin nam / (347a6)*
- KG *nanu saiva pratītes tannāntarīyakatā / rūpādiṣu pudgalasyāsati **pratibandhe** na yuktety ucyate / (530,4f)*
- PVṬ *de med na mi 'byung ba'i shes pa de nyid ni gzugs la sogs pa gang zag **rag lus pa** med par rigs pa ma yin no zhes brjod pa ma yin nam / (328a4)*
49. PVSV *nākāryakāraṇayoḥ kaścit **pratibandha** iti coktam / (148,1)*
- SVTib *rgyu dang 'bras bu ma yin pa dag la ni **rag lus pa** cung zad kyang ma yin no zhes bya ba yang bshad zin to // (347a6f)*
- KG *akāryakāraṇayor na kaścīd vāstavaḥ **pratibandha** ity asakṛd uktam ... (530,7)*
- PVṬ *rgyu dang 'bras bur gyur pa ma yin pa dag la ni dngos su '**brrel pa** cung zad kyang yod pa ma yin no zhes mang du bshad zin to // (328a5)*
50. PVSV *vivakṣayā śabdo 'rthe niyamyate / na svabhāvataḥ / tasya kvacid **apratibandhena** sarvatra tulyatvāt / yatrāpi **pratibandhas** tadabhidhānanīyamābhāvāt / (172,19f)*

- SVTib *brjod par 'dod pas sgra ni don dag la nges par bya ba yin gyi ngo bo nyid kyis ni ma yin te / de ni 'ga' zhig la yang rag lus pa med par thams cad la mtshungs pa nyid kyi phyir ro // gang la rag las pa yin na yang de rjod par byed pa'i nges pa med pa'i phyir ro // (363a4f)*
- KG *tasya śabdasya kvacid vastuny apratibandhena sambandharahitatvena kāraṇena sarvatrārthatulyatvāt / yatrāpi śabdasya pratibandhaḥ sthānakaraṇeṣu tataḥ śabdānām utpatter abhivyakter vā / (606,3f)*
- PVṬ *de ni dngos po 'ga' zhig la rag lus pa med pa ste / 'brel pa med par don thams cad la mtshungs pa nyid kyi phyir ro // gang la sgra'i rag las pa gnas dang byed pa dag gi yin te / de las (DN: la) sgra rnams skye ba'i phyir ram rtag par smra ba'i gzhung gis mngon par gsal ba'i phyir ro // (nye 61a4f)*
51. PVSV *uktam atrāpratibandhād aniyama iti // (172,27)*
- SVTib *'dir rag lus pa med pa'i phyir / nges pa yod pa ma yin no zhes bshad zin to // (363a6f)*
- KG *uktam atrottaraṃ / kvacid vastuny apratibandhād aniyata iti / (606,17)*
- PVṬ *dir lan ni dngos po 'ga' zhig la yang rag lus pa med pa'i phyir nges pa yod pa ma yin no zhes bshad zin to // (nye 61b3)*
-