

CHINA TIBETOLOGY RESEARCH CENTER

AUSTRIAN ACADEMY OF SCIENCES

Dharmakīrti's  
*Sambandhaparīkṣā*  
and  
Devendrabbuddhi's  
*Sambandhaparīkṣāvṛtti*

Critically edited by

Ernst Steinkellner

CHINA TIBETOLOGY PUBLISHING HOUSE

AUSTRIAN ACADEMY OF SCIENCES PRESS

Dharmakīrti's  
*Sambandhaparīkṣā*  
and  
Devendrabbuddhi's  
*Sambandhaparīkṣāvṛtti*

Critically edited by  
Ernst Steinkellner

CHINA TIBETOLOGY RESEARCH CENTER

AUSTRIAN ACADEMY OF SCIENCES

# Sanskrit Texts from the Tibetan Autonomous Region

founded by

**Lhagpa Phuntshogs and Ernst Steinkellner**

edited in chief by

**Dramdul, Birgit Kellner, Harunaga Isaacson**

No. 23

---

中国藏学研究中心

奥地利科学院

西藏自治区梵文文本系列丛书

创办人

拉巴平措 与 恩斯特·斯坦因凯勒

主 编

郑堆, 比尔吉特·凯尔纳, 春永·艾萨克森

第二十三卷

CHINA TIBETOLOGY RESEARCH CENTER

AUSTRIAN ACADEMY OF SCIENCES

**Dharmakīrti's**  
*Sambandhaparīkṣā*  
**and**  
**Devendrabuddhi's**  
*Sambandhaparīkṣāvṛtti*

Critically edited by  
**Ernst Steinkellner**

CHINA TIBETOLOGY PUBLISHING HOUSE  
AUSTRIAN ACADEMY OF SCIENCES PRESS  
BEIJING – VIENNA 2022

Angenommen durch die Publikationskommission der philosophisch-historischen Klasse der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften:

Accepted by the publication committee of the Division of Humanities and Social Sciences of the Austrian Academy of Sciences:

Michael Alram, Bert G. Fagner, Andre Gingrich, Hermann Hunger, Sigrid Jalkotzy-Deger, Renate Pillinger, Franz Rainer, Oliver Jens Schmitt, Danuta Shanzer, Peter Wiesinger, Waldemar Zacharasiewicz

Published with the support of the Open Access Fonds  
of the Austrian Academy of Sciences



Diese Publikation wurde einem anonymen,  
internationalen Begutachtungsverfahren unterzogen.  
This publication was subject to international and anonymous peer review.  
Peer review is an essential part of the Austrian Academy of Sciences Press  
evaluation process. Before any book can be accepted for publication,  
it is assessed by international specialists and ultimately must be approved  
by the Austrian Academy of Sciences Publication Committee.

Die verwendete Papiersorte in dieser Publikation ist DIN EN ISO 9706  
zertifiziert und erfüllt die Voraussetzung für eine dauerhafte Archivierung  
von schriftlichem Kulturgut.  
The paper used in this publication is DIN EN ISO 9706 certified and meets  
the requirements for permanent archiving of written cultural property.

Alle Rechte vorbehalten.

All rights reserved.

Copyright © Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften und  
China Tibetology Research Center  
Austrian Academy of Sciences and China Tibetology Research Center  
Wien, Peking/Vienna, Beijing 2022  
ISBN ÖAW 978-3-7001-8840-7  
ISBN CTRC 978-7-5211-0380-9  
Druck/Printed: Prime Rate, Budapest  
<https://epub.oeaw.ac.at/8840-7>  
<https://verlag.oeaw.ac.at>  
Made in Europe

## Contents

Introduction.....	vii
The condition of the manuscript.....	ix
On the editions.....	xi
On the edition of the <i>Vṛtti</i> 's Tibetan translation.....	xii
On the <i>Sambandhaparīkṣāvṛtti</i> 's authorship.....	xiv
On the import of these texts for understanding Dharmakīrti's logic.....	xv
Acknowledgements.....	xxiii
Signs in the diplomatic and critical editions.....	xxiii
General Abbreviations.....	xxiv
Primary Literature and Abbreviations.....	xxv
Secondary Literature.....	xxviii
Analysis of the <i>Sambandhaparīkṣā</i> and its <i>Vṛtti</i> .....	xxxv
Samples of the Drepung Manuscript.....	xli
<i>Sambandhaparīkṣā</i> , critical edition.....	1
<i>Sambandhaparīkṣāvṛtti</i> , critical edition.....	9
<i>Sambandhaparīkṣā</i> and <i>Sambandhaparīkṣāvṛtti</i> , diplo- matic edition.....	39
Tibetan translations, critically edited.....	57
' <i>Brel pa brtag pa</i> 'i rab tu byed pa.....	59
' <i>Brel pa brtag pa</i> 'i 'grel pa.....	63



## Introduction

The possibility of editing the *Sambandhaparīkṣā* and the *Sambandhaparīkṣāvṛtti* is the result of something close to a miracle: the reappearance of an original Sanskrit manuscript of the *Vṛtti* and Hideomi Yaita's identification of the first and the long lost final three *kārikās* in the *Tarkarahasya*.<sup>1</sup>

In modern scholarship, it was Stcherbatsky who, in *Buddhist Logic I* of 1932, first referred to the *Sambandhaparīkṣā*, and explained its main points, namely, that relations are not ultimately real, but are conceptually constructed and superimposed upon reality.<sup>2</sup> Only little later, in 1934, Erich Frauwallner edited 22 of the 25 *kārikās* of the *Sambandhaparīkṣā* in Sanskrit with the help of citations in later Jaina works of Vidyānandin, Devasūri and Prabhācandra, together with two different Tibetan translations found in Vinītadeva's and Śāṅkaranandana's commentaries, as well as the Tibetan translation of the *Sambandhaparīkṣāvṛtti*.<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> The first three are published in Yaita 1986 and the last three in Yaita 1990. All his findings, including phrases from the *Vṛtti* on the latter *kārikās* are edited in Yaita 2005: 69\*-72\*.

<sup>2</sup> Stcherbatsky 1932: 245-250.

<sup>3</sup> Further editions of the 22 *kārikās* are based on Prabhācandra's citations in his *Prameyakamalamārtaṇḍa*. Swami Dvarikadas Shastri published them in *Vadanyayaprakaraṇa of Acharya Dharmakīrtti with the Commentary Vipanchitārthā of Acharya Śāntarakṣita and Sambandhaparīkṣā with the Commentary of Acharya Prabhachandra*. (Baudha Bharati Series 8) Varanasi 1972: 139-149. This edition was copied by V. N. Jha in *The Philosophy of Relations*. (Bibliotheca Indo-Buddhica 66) Delhi 1990: 2-46. Jha took Prabhācandra's commentary also from the *Prameyakamalamārtaṇḍa*.



In 1957 the Muni Jambūvijaya published an edition of the *kārikās* together with the Tibetan translation and the relevant citations by Devasūri and Prabhācandra, seemingly not knowing Frauwallner's article of 1934.<sup>4</sup>

In 1962 Frauwallner published the anthology *Aus der Philosophie der śivaitischen Systeme* with a translation also from Utpaladeva's *Pratyabhijñākārikā*, but apparently did no longer remember—30 years after his edition—the “Buddhist opponent” in chapter 1, kk. 15-16 (= 1.2, kk. 10-11 in all later editions), as the author of the *Sambandhaparīkṣā*. Next, I think, was Kajiyama-sensei who referred to SP 13 on how to determine causality in his paper of 1963 on the *trikapañcakacintā*, but did not touch upon its other main points.<sup>5</sup> Shimizu Yō published a Japanese translation of SP 1-22 in 1981,<sup>6</sup> and Jan Houben mentions it in his introduction.<sup>7</sup> Not much interest was paid to these works until Raffaele Torella identified the source of Utpaladeva in his translation of the *Īśvarapratyabhijñākārikā* and the *Īśvarapratyabhijñākārikāvṛtti*.<sup>8</sup> Then, there are my notes of 1997 in a Bechert-Festschrift,<sup>9</sup> remarks by John Dunne in his 2004 book on Dharmakīrti's philosophy,<sup>10</sup> and 2013 more notes in my translation of the logical parts in his *Pramāṇavārttika* 1 with the *Svavṛtti*,<sup>11</sup> all still relying on Frauwallner's editions. Eltschinger 2021 is the most recent survey of the *Sambandhaparīkṣā*'s topic and introduces

<sup>4</sup> Jambūvijaya 1957.

<sup>5</sup> Kajiyama 1963: 3.

<sup>6</sup> Shimizu 1981.

<sup>7</sup> Houben 1995: 26.

<sup>8</sup> Torella 1994: 95-98.

<sup>9</sup> Steinkellner 1997: 627-629.

<sup>10</sup> Dunne 2004: 42-45.

<sup>11</sup> Steinkellner 2013: II. n. 331 (pp. 158-165; 169-172) and n. 359 (pp. 204-210).

Śaṅkaranandana's commentary, the *Sambandhaparīkṣānusāriṇī*, with a first edition of Sanskrit fragments.

In early 2019 I received photos of a collective manuscript, hitherto quite unknown, that was found in the monastery of Drepung and contains various different manuscripts of works by Dharmakīrti: except for the *Pramāṇavārttika* and the *Svavṛtti*, large and smaller fragments of all of his works. In this collection, the *Vādanyāya* and the *Sambandhaparīkṣāvṛtti*, here attributed to Devendrabuddhi, are almost complete. It also contains the complete text of the *Santānāntarasiddhi* and the beginning of Śāntarakṣita's *Vādanyāyatīkā*. All these manuscripts are in scripts of the late 12<sup>th</sup> to the 14<sup>th</sup> century.<sup>12</sup>

We know of yet another, partly burned paper manuscript of the *Sambandhaparīkṣā* as listed in Luo Zhao's descriptions of the Potala manuscripts (Potala, Tanjur I, p. 74) with the name *Sambandhaparīkṣākārikā*.<sup>13</sup> There, also Vinītadeva's commentary, the *Sambandhaparīkṣātīkā*, is listed under the name of *Vyākhyāya-sambandhavicārabhāṣya* (Potala, Tanjur I: p. 71f).<sup>14</sup>

### The condition of the manuscript

It starts with the *Sambandhaparīkṣākārikā*, incomplete with only two folio-pages photographed with the text of kk.1-10 and 21-25

<sup>12</sup> For an analysis of this collection, cf. Steinkellner forthcoming.

<sup>13</sup> This is also the title in the version of Tabo (cf. Tauscher 1994: 182).

<sup>14</sup> Both are contained in this bundle which is hopefully part of the comprehensive publication of facsimiles of all manuscripts extant in the TAR which are, as of now, still inaccessible to research. The same bundle contains in addition to Dignāga's *Nyāyamukha* Dharmakīrti's *Santānāntarasiddhi* and Vinītadeva's *Santānāntarasiddhiṭīkā*.

and gaps at the end, and continues with the *Sambandhaparīkṣāvṛtti* in thirteen and a half folios.

In general the manuscript has not been too well preserved. Only a few edges are broken off (f.4a1,2; 4b5,6), ink-fading and letter-transference, possibly caused by humidity, are numerous. There is even a repair attempt with a strip of modern diaphanous paper (f.2b, between lines 2 and 3) covering the lower and upper parts of the adjacent lines. Also peeling off from the written surface results in the loss of upper and lower parts of *akṣaras* (f.4b, 8a).

The script is regular, professional, and by the same hand. Its character is that of Old-Bengālī or, as I would like to call it, Vihārī, of around the 13<sup>th</sup> century CE. In the best folios (f.6a, 8b), *anusvāra*, *i*, *ai*, superscript *r* are clearly visible. This is not the case in most of the more faded folios.

While the first apparatus indicates the testimonia, the second, therefore, consists of a mixture of notes in consideration of both, the textual and the physical nature of the manuscript. In regard to the text, on the one hand, reconstructions (*rec.*) provide parts of the manuscript too faint to be read or broken off and a retranslation (*retr.*) needed in the colophon. These parts of the text, in the diplomatic edition in parentheses, are in italics. Emendations (*em.*) mainly supply lacking syllables or larger units. They are put between angular brackets ⟨ ⟩.

On the other hand, because of the manuscript's unique character and the numerous damages mainly concerning upper and lower parts of *akṣaras*, many notes only supply these lacking or invisible features against what can physically be seen in the manuscript. Wherever possible, the lacking item is represented by an upper plus-sign (e.g., *sambandham* : *sambandha*<sup>+</sup> Ms), or is without this sign (e.g.,

*tatsiddhau* : *tatsiddho* Ms).

Changes of Sandhi are not indicated when punctuation is introduced against the diplomatic text.

Only a few corrections and additions in the margin seem to be by a second hand. And there are also two short notes in Tibetan.<sup>15</sup>

### On the editions

In addition to the new *Vṛtti*, also the *Sambandhaparīkṣā* is re-edited. The title of Dharmakīrti's work is *Sambandhaparīkṣākārikā* in the Drepung manuscript. This is also the Sanskrit-title of the Tabo version (cf. Tauscher 1994: 182) and in Luo Zhao's description (Potala, Tanjur I: 74). But the addition *kārikā* is most probably only conventional to separate the root-text from the commentary. The versions of the Tibetan translation have the name *Sambandhaparīkṣāprakaraṇa* ('*Brel pa brtag pa'i rab tu byed pa*), which is also the Tibetan title in the Tabo version.

Meanwhile to the citations in Jaina works identified by Frauwallner, more from Śaiva texts and the last three *kārikās* from the *Tarkarahasya*<sup>16</sup> can be added. Moreover, Vidyānandin's and Devasūri's partial, and Prabhācandra's heavy reliance on the *Sambandhaparīkṣāvṛtti* in his *Prameyakamalamārtaṇḍa* can be better appreciated now that the Sanskrit of the *Vṛtti* is available.

The Tibetan translations of both texts are also re-edited: First, because Frauwallner had only access to the Narthang version of the

<sup>15</sup> Above the string hole in f.7b: *sbyor ba can dan du ba can la sogs pa* on the beginning of SPV on k.19; and in the margin above l. 1 of f.8b: *g'zan yan sbyor ba ni* on the beginning of SPV on k.22.

<sup>16</sup> Cf. Yaita 1986, 1989, 1990, 2005.

Tanjur, and secondly the Austro-Italian expedition to Tabo monastery in 1991 initiated photographing its huge manuscript collection.<sup>17</sup> This Tabo collection harboured, among other treasures, some fragments of the *Sambandhaparīkṣā*, its *Vṛtti* and its *Ṭīkā*, all in the pre-canonical form it had before the mid-11<sup>th</sup> century revision, thus providing valuable variants.<sup>18</sup> And, last but not least, while the Tibetan translation is quite good in general, there are also a number of cases where it leaps or can barely be understood without the knowledge of the Sanskrit, although our new text can hardly have been the exemplar of these translations.

### On the edition of the *Vṛtti*'s Tibetan translation

Frauwallner's edition is based on the Narthang versions. Where he made use of Vinītadeva's *Ṭīkā* "to constitute a readable text," he "usually" ("in der Regel") noted the different readings, but not consistently. He corrected mistakes in the Tibetan translation perceived ("soweit sie mir erkennbar waren") in the German translation. In the present edition besides Narthang (N) also the versions of Peking (P) and Derge (D) are used, as well as, in certain cases, the *Ṭīkā* (Ṭ) and Śāṅkaranandana's *Anusāriṇī* (A), the latter only in the Peking version.

The pre-canonical version of the SP-, SPV-, and SPT-texts luckily extant among the manuscripts found at Tabo monastery (cf. Tauscher 1994) represent these texts in the form they had before

<sup>17</sup> This tiring task was undertaken over several years by Helmut Tauscher and his colleagues. The photos are available at <https://www.istb.univie.ac.at/kanjur/rktsneu> under "Archives: Tabo, RN 131." SP, title + kk.1-2d' are on 33 below, l.10, SP 2'd-23a on 15 below; SPV on kk.'16-19' on t009 28, and SPV on kk.'19-23' on t009 29.

<sup>18</sup> Cf. Tauscher 1994. The 22 kk. of the SP were edited *ibid.*, 182-183.

the revision by Subhūti(śrī)śānti and Tiñ ñe 'dzin bzañ po. Therefore I chose the Tabo variant as a rule when it is supported by the *Vṛtti* (V).<sup>19</sup> This choice of the Tabo variant as the better reading, or as better corresponding to the Sanskrit text, also implies a judgement on the post-revision canonical versions, namely that on occasion the older text has been changed mistakingly.<sup>20</sup>

The Tibetan translation of the *Vṛtti* deviates from the Sanskrit of the only manuscript available. While it is often possible to decide between Tibetan variants on the basis of the Sanskrit equivalents, it seems meaningless to try or impossible to correct the Sanskrit text in comparison with the Tibetan in the case of most of these differences. One reason for this is the often elliptical style of the Sanskrit

<sup>19</sup> The following ancient scribal idiosyncrasies in these Tabo manuscripts are not noted: use of the *da drag*, *ji ste* for *ci ste*, *las stsogs* for *la sogs*. In the particular occasion of SP k.1, where the Sanskrit is of no help, the decision is difficult. SP 1b has the verb *yod* in all canonical version supported by V and Ṭ, while the Tabo version has *yin*. The Sanskrit can be read both ways, with a copula “What is dependence in ...” or as expressing existence “What dependence is there in ...”. A decision is only possible with a view to the general direction of the whole argument which aims at proving the non-existence of all relations.

<sup>20</sup> Examples are in the translation of SP: the change of *ni* to *ñid* in SP 3b, of *pa'an* to *pa* in SP 4c, of *dños po* to *'brel pa* in SP 7a, of *'ga'* to *gañ* in SP 13a, of *'am* to *dañ* in SP 21a, of *las* to *la* in 22a, as well as in the translation of SPV: of *byed // mi byed pa ñid de* to *byed pa ñid de* (n. 136), of *can du mi 'dod de* to *can mi 'dod* (n. 173), of *de bas na sbyor ba* to *de bas na sbyor ba dañ bral ba na sbyor ba* (n. 193). A comparable case, fragments of two manuscripts of Dharmottara's *Nyāyabinduṭkā* also found at Tabo, has been closely examined by Horst Lasic and compared with the canonical versions (Lasic 2007). Here, too, the Tabo text clearly represents the first translation by Dharmāloka and Jñānagarbha of ca. 800, and differs considerably from the second, revised translation by Blo Idan śes rab and Sumatikīrti. With regard to the fact that Tabo shows occasional correspondences with the canonical version of Cone and Derge, Lasic offers a convincing hypothesis on how this could have been caused during the revisional activity (Lasic 2007: 72-76).

text which seems to have been conducive to misunderstandings. And, of course, the exemplar of the Tibetan translation must have been different from the present Sanskrit manuscript. I have, therefore, with exceptions, not attempted to adjust the Sanskrit wording where the Tibetan differs, and vice-versa. Nevertheless, where extant variants in the Tibetan versions are supported by the Sanskrit text, I have chosen the variant better fitting. Most valuable are, however, the often good variants found within the citations in Vinītadeva's *Ṭīkā* (SPT) because it seems that in the pre-printing period this text must have been less copied than the main texts and, thus, less suffered from scribal errors.

Since the position of simple and double *śads* is wildly different in all canonical versions, I have mainly kept the syntactic *śads* as given in Frauwallner's edition in order not to disturb the relationship between the Tibetan text and Frauwallner's translation if one wishes to compare.

### **On the *Sambandhaparīkṣāvṛtti*'s authorship**

So far it was never doubted that Dharmakīrti is not only the author of the *Sambandhaparīkṣā*, but also of its *Vṛtti*. This is unanimously supported by the colophons of the Tibetan translation in its Tanjur versions. The respective colophons of the Drepung manuscript, however, name Dharmakīrti as the author of the *Sambandhaparīkṣā*, but Devendrabuddhi as the author of the *Vṛtti*. This need not off-hand be doubted, but, nevertheless, asks for an explanation. My explanation for the suppression of Devendrabuddhi's authorship is, of course, only hypothetical: I think that the *Vṛtti* is a text written down by Devendrabuddhi following a teaching by Dharmakīrti.

It is hardly possible to consider the *Vṛtti* as Dharmakīrti's own commentary on the *kārikās* because of its truly simple commentarial style quite unknown from other works of the master in prose, such as his *Vṛtti* on the *Pramāṇavārttika*'s *svārthānumāna*-chapter.<sup>21</sup> The present *Vṛtti* stands out with the pedantic addition of the explanatory appositions *liṅgāt* or *kāraṇāt* following evident logical or causal phrases, or often apparently superfluous clarifications.

Moreover, there are a number of objection-and-response extensions in the *Vṛtti* that do not explain only the text of the *kārikās* (as on k.1), but elaborate on their content or offer additional explanations (as on kk. 2, 13, 19). Such extensions might be seen as the result of the teacher's dealing with questions raised in the class which were, then, also noted down by Devendrabuddhi, but could, at least with regard to the responses, reflect the teacher's.

### **On the import of these texts for understanding Dharmakīrti's logic**

It is, at last, with the availability of almost all of Dharmakīrti's works possible to ask the question what the historical position of this treatise might have been among his works.

---

<sup>21</sup> With regard to Devendrabuddhi's style of commenting, studded with elaborate proof-formulations (*prayoga*), we can compare his commentary on PV 2.8-16 in Krasser 2002: I. 237-256 with II. 43-55. In this commentary, the *Pramāṇavārttikapañjikā*, Devendrabuddhi's writing seems more controlled and mature than in the somewhat sophomoric *Vṛtti*. This, then, could suggest that he wrote the *Vṛtti* near to the time that Dharmakīrti composed the *Sambandhapariṅśā* and presented it to his students. Although Devendrabuddhi's authorship of the *Vṛtti* cannot be ascertained by such comparison, its attribution need also not be doubted.



I fully agree with Katsura's decision in his paper of 1992<sup>22</sup> to agree with my understanding that the *svabhāvapratibandha* presents the state of affairs in reality. In the sense that there is an invariable concomitance between the concepts of probans and probandum only when based on factual identity (*tādātmya*) or causality (*tadutpatti*) as relational features in reality. In SP and SPV, however, the reality of relations, particularly the one between cause and effect is strictly denied. Thus, this “ontological” foundation of the logical nexus can only be understood if the necessity-providing natural connection denotes a character, a property, of instances of reality, but not in terms of being a real relation. By drawing upon the *Sambandhapariṣā*, I already tried to clarify the implications of *kārikā* PV 1.33 (now counted as 31) which summarizes the long section beginning at PV 1.15 (now 13) on the cognition of an invariable concomitance (*avinābhāva*) as based on natural connections in reality.<sup>23</sup>

Then, why and when did Dharmakīrti feel it necessary to compose this tract on relations?

Stcherbatsky had already pointed out a statement which clearly says that all logical matter only belongs to the mind (*buddhyārūḍha*). This statement was later found at the beginning of Dharmakīrti's first work (PVSV 2, 22-3, 1) and assumed by Frauwallner<sup>24</sup> to be a fragment from Dignāga's lost *Hetumukha*. Stcherbatsky also pointed to the SP and Śāṅkaranandana's commentary to conclude that “inference is founded upon relations which are a superstruc-

<sup>22</sup> Katsura 1992.

<sup>23</sup> Cf. Steinkellner 1997: 627-629, and 2013: II, n. 331 (pp. 158-165; 169-172) and n. 359 (pp. 204-210). Cf. also Dunne 2004: 42-45.

<sup>24</sup> Frauwallner 1959: 164 (= 1982: 840). Cf. Steinkellner 2013: II., n. 36.

ture upon a foundation of ultimate reality”<sup>25</sup> and that “relations are constructions of our imagination.”<sup>26</sup>

Dharmakīrti starts his work in full awareness of this *Hetumukha*-fragment’s meaning, and subsequently presents for the first time his idea that the formal conditions of Dignāga’s triply characterized reason (*trirūpahetu*) are not sufficient for restricting the invariable concomitance (*avinābhāva*) but have to be based on relations that are given in reality (*vastutaḥ*).

How this specification of relations as being given “in reality” is to be understood, namely as conceptually given, has been elaborated by Dharmakīrti mainly in the digression on *apoha*, when he shows how the distinctness (*bheda*) of entities is concealed by beginningless conceptualization connecting them. Tilmann Vetter, in his dissertation of 1964 (pp. 49-59: “die psychologische Seite des Begriffs”), offers a summary based on Frauwallner’s translation of 1932 (= 1992: 406ff). Suffice it to refer to PVSV 38, 17-24 on PV 1.68-69 (cf. the translations in Dunne 2004: 136; Eltschinger 2014: 262f; Eltschinger et al. 2018: 76f), or to PVSV 118, 27f on PV 1.327ab.

Moreover, in the extensive digression with elaborate refutations of the theorem of the Veda’s authorlessness (*apauruṣeyatva*) (PV 1. 213-268),<sup>27</sup> Dharmakīrti turns directly against the Mīmāṃsaka concept of a permanent uncreated relation between words and meaning.<sup>28</sup> And it seems that it is from the refutation of *this* relation that Dharmakīrti developed some main arguments against relations

<sup>25</sup> Stcherbatsky 1932: 248.

<sup>26</sup> Stcherbatsky 1932: 246.

<sup>27</sup> Cf. Eltschinger 2007.

<sup>28</sup> For overviews of the Mīmāṃsā position, cf. Eltschinger, *ibid.*: 115-128, and for Dharmakīrti’s counter-position, cf. *ibid.*: 134-143.

in general as seen in the SP and SPV.<sup>29</sup> Yet in this, his first work, the polemical energy did not yet reach out to other relation-theorems propounded by other realist philosophers, as these were not a target here.

Dharmakīrti composed the *Sambandhaparīkṣā* in order to avoid the danger that his new conception of a real (*vāstava*) basis of the logical nexus may be taken as an ontological commitment, in particular as concerning causality, the *kāryakāraṇabhāva*. Here he argued for the unreality of all relations that up to his time were believed to exist by Indian realists, including and above all the relationship between cause and effect. Dharmakīrti's dictum is: *ity amiśrāḥ svayaṃ bhāvās tān miśrayati kalpanā* (SP 5cd), "Thus entities are not mixed themselves. Conceptual construction<sup>30</sup> (*kalpanā*)

<sup>29</sup> Such a generalization of his solution for the relation between words and meaning can already be seen in PVSV 113,23-25 on PV 1.227cd: "(Objection:) How is, then, the relation between word and meaning a convention (*samaya*), since (this) is employed (only) among people? (Response:) Of unmixed and established (entities) there is no relation, because (their) non-difference would ensue and (they) would not depend." (*samayas tarhi katham śabdārthasambandhaḥ\**, *puruṣeṣu vṛtteḥ. nāmiśrāṇāṃ siddhānāṃ kaścit sambandho 'bhedaprasaṅgād anapekṣaṅc ca*. Cf. Eltschinger 2007: 248 with n. 146), or in PVSV 115, 24-116, 2 on PV 1.231cd: "Based on nothing but presence or absence two (entities) although unmixed appear as if mixed because of a person's habituation of conventional practice. The fusion of entities is, therefore, man-made." (*tāv eva bhāvābhāvāv āsṛityāsaṃśṛṣṭāv api saṃśṛṣṭāv iva puruṣasya vya-vahārabhāvanātaḥ pratibhāta iti pauruṣeṣo bhāvānāṃ saṃśleṣaḥ*. Cf. Eltschinger 2007: 259). Dharmakīrti's discussion of the *puḍgalavāda* also touches upon the issue of relation. Cf. Eltschinger-Ratié 2013: 69-99. \* °*sambandhaḥ* em. (PVSVṬ 412,12) : °*sambandhāḥ* ed.

<sup>30</sup> In the present context this translation is preferred to intimate the creative character of *kalpanā* or *vikalpa* which is not felt in other translations such as "conceptual awareness or thought." On the function of concepts and their dependence on beginningless karmic imprints (*vāsanā*) in Dharmakīrti, cf. the recent discussion in Prueitt 2018: 326-333. This background is also implied in the phrase of SPV on SP 25:

mixes them.”

The probably most concise summary of Dharmakīrti’s treatise is by the Śaiva theologian Utpaladeva. He ends the second chapter in the first section of his *Īśvarapratyabhijñākārikā* with a summary of Dharmakīrti’s critique of relation. In Torella’s translation: “[A relation, however conceived, is inadmissible] since, as it rests on the two related terms, it cannot be unitary in nature; since a thing that is [already] accomplished cannot ‘require’ another and dependence etc. are not logically tenable.” (*dviṣṭhasyānekarūpatvāt siddhasyānyānapekṣaṇāt / pāratantryādyayogāc ca // I 2.11a-c*).<sup>31</sup>

That means Utpaladeva agrees with Dharmakīrti’s critique, notwithstanding his own final point that distinct entities owe their relations to being rooted in the unitary conscious subject Śīva (cf. ĪPK I 7.2).<sup>32</sup> Following ĪPK I 2.10a-c’ (*tatra tatra sthite tat tad bhavatītyeva dṛśyate / nānyat*),<sup>33</sup> in the translations of ĪPK I 2.10’cd (*nānyo ’sti sambandhaḥ kāryakāraṇabhāvataḥ*) by both, Frauwallner and Torella, causality, however, seems to be excepted from the Buddhist’s negation of relations: “Daher gibt es keine andere Verbindung als das Verhältnis von Ursache und Wirkung.” (Frauwallner 1962: k.15, p.34) and “There is no relation other than that of cause

---

*nirantarotpattyādyāśrayair aparāparaiḥ pratyayaiḥ.*

<sup>31</sup> “Weil etwas, das auf Zweien beruht, keine Einheit sein kann, weil etwas Vollendetes keines anderen bedarf, und weil eine Abhängigkeit usw. unmöglich ist.“ (Frauwallner 1962: 34)

<sup>32</sup> For comprehensive explanations of the nondualistic Śaiva philosophers’ position on causality, cf. Ratié 2014. Cf. also ĪPK II.2, a chapter devoted to justifying all kinds of categories among which relation (*sambandha*) (II.2.4) as real (*satya*).

<sup>33</sup> “The various things come into being in concomitance with the presence of certain other things: this is what is experienced and nothing more.” (Torella 1994: 95); “Wenn das und das gegeben ist, dann entsteht das und das; dies allein läßt sich beobachten, und nichts anderes.“ (Frauwallner 1962: 34)

and effect.” (Torella 1994: 95).

Then in the *Vṛtti* on ĪPK I 7.2, Utpaladeva in explanation of his own position clearly includes *all* different objects of cognitive events, such as relations, “in the network of connections pertaining to practical reality, such as, for instance, the cause-effect relation and so on” (Torella 1994: 136f for *bhāvabhedaḥ kāryakāraṇatādīvyavahārasamanvayam bhajante*). Further, in ĪPK I 7.4 even the Dharmakīrtian establishment of the cause-effect relation through perceptions and non-perceptions is said to be reasonable “as long as they rest on a single knowing subject” (*ekapramāṭṛjā*).

The above cited interpretations by Frauwallner and Torella of the Buddhist summary *nānyo ’sti sambandhaḥ kāryakāraṇabhāvataḥ* can, nevertheless, not be right at face value, and are not in accordance with Dharmakīrti’s understanding of “the relationship between cause and effect.” In fact Dharmakīrti clearly points out in SP 16a-c, that being cause and being effect are conventionally known as “the presence of that (entity) when an entity is to come about, and the character of coming about only when (this entity) is present” (*bhāve bhāvini tadbhāvo bhāva eva ca bhāvitā / prasiddhe hetuphalate*).<sup>34</sup> In this I take Dharmakīrti to draw on the

<sup>34</sup> This is already felt in Eltschinger-Ratié 2010, n. 30: “Indeed Dharmakīrti acknowledges one relation besides pure and simple identity, namely, the causality relation, but he shows that the natures involved in it remain heterogeneous.” Cf. also Eltschinger 2010: 416.

And, indeed, what is formulated in SP 16a-c is modelled after the definitions of cause and effect in PVSV 19,6-8: *idam eva hi kāraṇasya kāraṇatvam, yad arthāntarabhāve svabhāvopadhānam. kāryasyāpi tadbhāva eva bhāvaḥ* (“For precisely this is the causeness of a cause that through its nature it is near too the presence of another entity. Of an effect, too, (its effectness) is the presence precisely in the presence of this (cause).”

In general, the compound *kāryakāraṇabhāva* is understood as “relation or relationship between cause and effect” or simply “causality,” and this is also the case of its regular synonym *kāryakāraṇatā/tva*. But I take the

Buddha's statement at the beginning of the *pratītyasamutpāda*: *asmin satīdaṃ bhavati, asyotpādād idam utpadyate*. I would, then, propose to translate in accordance with the context Utpaladeva's words as "than being cause and effect."<sup>35</sup>

latter to indicate that °*bhāva* in the first means nothing else than the abstract suffix °*tā* or °*tva*. The compound, then, means "being effect and cause." An it is this meaning that is in place here, in the SP, as well as in ĪPK I 2.10'cd. Cf. Steinkellner 2013 II: 158ff for a discussion of this compound.

Of course, if this meaning can be accepted in this particular place, nothing speaks against the traditional translations of the term *kāryakāraṇabhāva* in its conventional usage as long as the question of its reality as a relation is not the issue. Nevertheless, through the present experience of trying to understand ĪPK I 2.10 I have chosen to translate the frequently used term by "relationship between cause and effect" in the hope that it is sufficient to indicate that this "relationship" (Frauwallner's "Verhältnis") is not a real "relation."

From a lengthy e-mail exchange with Raffaele Torella who doubts that Utpaladeva would have been ambiguous in his choice of words, I can offer his own new translation as "There is no *sambandha* apart from mere concatenation of cause and effect (which might commonly, and wrongly, be understood as a case of *sambandha*)." (e-mail of March 20, 2021).

<sup>35</sup> My special gratitude is due to Isabelle Ratié who directed me to a passage in Abhinavagupta's commentary on ĪPK I 2.10. There, Abhinavagupta makes a similar point by focusing on the word *bhāva* in *kāryakāraṇabhāva*. I take the liberty of citing her words from an e-mail of November 19, 2020. Ratié says that Abhinavagupta emphasizes "that in his perspective, in fact there are nothing but momentary entities (*bhāvakṣaṇas*) such as the shapeless lump of clay ..... up to the pot; and, after an aside on other types of relations, he adds ..... that 'it is precisely this (momentary) entity (*bhāva*), which, when talked about (*vyavahṛ-*) through conceptualization as occurring in a specific succession with another (momentary) entity, is called *kāryakāraṇabhāva* (*ayam eva ca bhāvo bhāvāntareṇa saha niyatapūrvāparatayā vikalpena vyavahriyamāṇaḥ kāryakāraṇabhāva ity abhidhīyate*. ĪPV I,117,2f)" Ratié also assumes that Abhinavagupta probably follows Utpaladeva's *Vivṛtti* as yet unavailable, and proposes that Utpaladeva "seems to read the words *nānyo 'sti sambandhaḥ kāryakāraṇabhāvataḥ* as really meaning 'there is no relation that would be (something) other than the (very) entities that are (conceptualized as being) cause and effect'."

To conclude: Besides several evident links in arguments and expressions with stanzas and phrases in the *Pramāṇavārttika* and the *Svavṛtti* on its first chapter,<sup>36</sup> in the *Vṛtti* on SP 22, Devendrabuddhi even refers to the *Pramāṇavārttika*, possibly to PV 1.145 with the *Svavṛtti* (71,11-72,10). There is, then, no reason not to assume that Dharmakīrti composed this text right after the *Pramāṇavārttika* and before starting with the *Pramāṇaviniścaya*, and that Devendrabuddhi produced the *Vṛtti* in close connection under the teacher's guidance.

With the recovery of Dharmakīrti's refutation of relation as existing in reality together with explanations in the shape of Devendrabuddhi's *Vṛtti* which shows an expected familiarity with the relevant grammarians' analyses and conceptions, a centre-piece of the long history of Indian *sambandha*-reflections from Patañjali and Bhartṛhari<sup>37</sup> onwards to Abhinavagupta is now finally available again.

---

Aware of Abhinavagupta's comment, Ratié, already in Ratié 2011: 298, n. 85, moved beyond Frauwallner's and Torella's understanding when she translated ĪPK I 2.10 as "Voici ce qui seul est perçu: lorsque telle ou telle entité (A) existe, telle ou telle entité (B) vient à l'existence; et rien d'autre. Il n'y a pas de relation (*sambandha*), la relation de cause à effet (**ainsi comprise**) mise à part." (My emphasis)

<sup>36</sup> For example, S PV on k.2 has links to PV 1.231 with PVSV 115, 24-116,2 and PV 1.237cd with PVSV 118, 27f; SPV on k.3 links to PVSV 119, 3f; SPV on k.13 links to PVSV 22, 2-3; SP k.14 is Ce'e-text of PV 4.268; and SPV on k.22 refers to PV 1.145 with PVSV 71,11-72,10.

Other links have been noted by rGyal tshab rje in his commentary '*Brel pa brtag pa'i rnam bśad ñi ma'i sñiñ po* (bLa brañ par ma 1999): in 4b3, commenting on k.2, he refers to PV 3.26a-c (cf. Franco-Notake 2014: 83f) and in 4b6 to PV 1.237cd, and again on k.14 to PV 4.268cd.

<sup>37</sup> Cf. Houben 1995 and Hideyo Ogawa's explanation "Bhartṛhari's Denotation Theory" in Ogawa 2019: 622-630. Cf. also Ogawa 2020.

## Acknowledgments

I am grateful to Isabelle Ratié and Elliot Stern for various help received, to Muroya Yasutaka for the pleasure of a joint afternoon reading of the Drepung manuscript, to Cynthia Peck-Kubaczek and my daughter Katharina for revising the English, to Dania Huber for taking great care in formatting this publication, to Raffaele Torella for a fruitful e-mail-exchange on the issue of the *kāryakāraṇabhāva*, and, above all, to Vincent Eltschinger who was the first reader of this work and expertly improved it in all of its parts and aspects.

## Signs in the diplomatic and critical editions

- . . two points each for the place of one *akṣara* faded or lost
- . illegible part of an *akṣara*
- + missing part of *akṣara* due to damage in the leaf
- \* *virāma*
- ' *avagraha*
- / *daṇḍa*
- // double *daṇḍa*
- |  
| line-filling sign
- # filling sign
- <...> contain emended text
- <...> contain *akṣara*(s) added in the manuscript's margin or inter-linear space



(...) contain *akṣara*(s) or parts unclear due to physical damage, fading, etc.

{...} contain *akṣara*(s) deleted by stroke(s)

{{...}} contain *akṣara*(s) erased

☐ square space around string-hole

~ unreadable *akṣara*

*italics* reconstructed or retranslated words or their parts

**bold** words of the *mūla*-text

## General Abbreviations

cf. confer

D Derge edition, Tokyo

em. emended

F Frauwallner

*IBK* *Indogaku Bukkyōgaku Kenkyū*

IIBS The International Institute for Buddhist Studies

IsMEO Istituto Italiano per il Medio ed Estremo Oriente

M *Sambandhaparīkṣā* as here edited

Ms the Drepung manuscript

N Narthang edition

- n. note
- n.e. no equivalent in
- om. omitted
- P Peking edition, Tokyo
- rec. reconstructed
- retr. retranslated
- s. see
- SOR Serie Orientale Roma
- T Tibetan translation
- Ṭ *Ṭikā*, s. SPT
- Ta Tabo fragments (cf. Tauscher 1994; for the photos see n.12 above)
- V *Vṛtti*, s. SPV<sub>t</sub>
- VÖAW Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften
- WZKS *Wiener Studien für die Kunde Südasiens*

## Primary Literature and Abbreviations

- A Sambandhaparīkṣānusāriṇī (Śaṅkaranandana) - P 5736  
Ze 27a1-44a3.
- AS Aṣṭasahasrī (Vidyānandana) - *Aṣṭasahasrī sakala-tārkikacakracūḍāmaṇisyādvādividyāpatinā Śrī-Vidyānandanāsvāminā nirmitā*. Ed. Vaṃśīdhara. Mumbāpurī:

Nirṇaya Sāgara Press 1915.

- ĪPK      Īśvarapratyabhijñākārikā (Utpaladeva) - s. Torella 1994.
- ĪPV      Īśvarapratyabhijñāvimarśinī (Abhinavagupta) - *Īśvarapratyabhijñā-vimarśinī of Abhinavagupta. Sanskrit Text with the Commentary Bhāskarī*. Vol. I. Ed. by K. A. Subramania Iyer and K. C. Pandey. Delhi etc. 1986: Motilal Banarsidass. (Reprint of The Princess of Wales Sarasvati Bhavana Texts 70, 1938)
- ĪPVV     Īśvarapratyabhijñāvivṛtivismarśinī (Abhinavagupta) - *Īśvarapratyabhijñā Vivṛtivismarśinī by Abhinavagupta*. 3 vols. Ed. Madhusūdan Kaul. Srinagar: Research Department, Jammu and Kashmir Government 1938-1943. [Reprint: Delhi, Akay Book Corporation 1987]
- TR        Tarkarahasya - s. Yaita 2005: 261-407.
- TŚV      Tattvārthaślokavārttika (Vidyānandin) - *Śrīmad-Vidyānandisvāmi-viracitaṃ Tattvārthaślokavārttikam*. Ed. Manohar Lāl. Bombay 1918.
- NKC      Nyāyakumudacandra (Prabhācandra) - *Nyāya Kumud Chandra of Śrīmat Prabhāchandrāchārya*. 2 vols. Ed. Mahendra Kumar. Bombay 1938, 1941. [Reprint: Delhi, Sri Satguru Publications 1991]
- NBhūṣ    Nyāyabhūṣaṇa (Bhāsarvajña) - *Śrīmadācārya-Bhāsarvajña-praṇītasya Nyāyasārasya svopajñaṃ vyākhyānaṃ Nyāyabhūṣaṇam*. Ed. Svāmī Yogīndrānanda. Vārāṇasī 1968.
- PDhS     Padārthadharmasaṅgraha (Praśastapāda) - Johannes Bronkhorst & Yves Ramseier. *Word Index to the Praśastapādabhāṣya, a complete word index to the printed editions of the Praśastapādabhāṣya*. Delhi 1994: Motilal Banarsidass, 1-88.
- PKM      Prameyakamalamārtaṇḍa (Prabhācandra) - *Prameyakamal Martand by Shri Prabha Chandra*. Ed. Mahendra Kumar Shastri. Bombay <sup>2</sup>1941.

- PV 1-4 Pramāṇavārttika (Dharmakīrti) - Y. Miyasaka, *Pramāṇavārttika-kārikā* (Sanskrit and Tibetan). *Acta Indologica* 2 (1971-72), 1-206; s. also PVV.
- PVV Pramāṇavārttikavṛtti (Manorathanandin) - *Dharmakīrti's Pramāṇavārttika with a commentary by Manorathanandin*. Ed. Rāhula Sāṅkṛtyāyana 1938-1940 [Appendix in *JBORS* 24-26].
- PVSV Pramāṇavārttika(sva)vṛtti (Dharmakīrti) - Raniero Gnoli, *The Pramāṇavārttikam of Dharmakīrti. The First Chapter with the Autocommentary*. Text and Critical Notes. (SOR 23) Roma 1960: IsMEO.
- PVSVṬ Pramāṇavārttika(sva)vṛttiṭīkā (Kaṇṇakagomin) - Rāhula Sāṅkṛtyāyana, *Ācārya-Dharmakīrteḥ Pramāṇavārttikam (svārthānumānaparicchedaḥ) svopajñavṛtṭyā, Kaṇṇakagomiviracitayā taṭṭīkayā ca sahitam*. Ilāhābād 1943: Kitāb Mahal.
- SPT Sambandhaparīkṣāṭīkā (Vinītadeva) - P 5735 Ze 1-26b8.
- SPV<sub>1</sub> Sambandhaparīkṣāvṛtti (Devendrabbuddhi) - the present edition.
- SVR Syādvādaratnākara (Vādidevasūri) - *Śrīmad-Vādidevasūri-viracitaḥ Pramāṇanayatattvālokālaṅkāraḥ tadvyākhyā ca Syādvādaratnākaraḥ*. 5 vols. Ed. L. Motīlāl. Poona 1926-1930.
- SS Sambandhasiddhi (Utpaladeva) - In: *Siddhitrayī Īśvarapratyabhijñākārikā-vṛtṭiś ca*. Ed. Madhusūdana Kaul Śāstri. Srinagar 1921.
- VR Vādarahasya (anonymous) - *ĀcāryaRatnakīrtivira-citam Udayananirākaraṇam*. Ed. Raghunath Pandey. Delhi 1984.<sup>38</sup>

<sup>38</sup> For the correct title of this work, cf. Gudrun Bühnemann, *Tarkarahasya and Vādarahasya*. *WZKS* 27, 1983, 185-190, 187f, and her review of Pandey's edition in *WZKS* 28, 1984, 228f; as well as M. T. Much's review of the same in *Buddhist Studies Review* 6.1, 1987, 88-90.

- HBṬ      Hetubinduṭīkā (Arcāṭa) - *Hetubinduṭīkā of Bhaṭṭa Arcāṭa with the sub-commentary entitled Āloka of Durveka Miśra*. Ed. Sukhlalji Sanghavi and Muni Shri Jinavijayaji. (GOS 113) Baroda 1949: Oriental Institute.

## Secondary Literature

- Dunne 2004      John D. Dunne, *Foundations of Dharmakīrti's Philosophy*. Boston 2004.
- Eltschinger 2007      V. Eltschinger, *Penser l'autorité des Écritures. La polémique de Dharmakīrti contre la notion brahmanique orthodoxe d'un Veda sans auteur. Autour de Pramāṇavārttika 1.213-268 et Svavṛtti*. Wien 2007: VÖAW.
- Eltschinger 2010      V. Eltschinger, Dharmakīrti. *Revue Internationale de Philosophie* 64.2, 2010, 397-440.
- Eltschinger 2014      V. Eltschinger, *Buddhist Epistemology as Apologetics. Studies on the History, Self-understanding and Dogmatic Foundations of Late Indian Buddhist Philosophy*. Wien 2014: VÖAW.
- Eltschinger 2021      V. Eltschinger, A Note on Śaṅkaranandana's *Sambandhaparīkṣānusāriṇī*. In: T. Endo (ed.), *Illuminating the Dharma: Buddhist Studies in Honour of Venerable Professor KL Dhammajoti*. Hong Kong 2021: Centre of Buddhist Studies. The University of Hong Kong, 99-119.
- Eltschinger-Ratié 2010      V. Eltschinger and I. Ratié, Dharmakīrti against the *pudgala*. *Journal of Indian and Tibetan Studies* 14, 2010, 185-214.

- Eltschinger-Ratié 2013 V. Eltschinger and I. Ratié, *Self, No-Self, and Salvation. Dharmakīrti's Critique of the Notions of Self and Person*. Wien 2013: VÖAW.
- Eltschinger et al. 2018 V. Eltschinger, J. Taber, M. T. Much, I. Ratié, *Dharmakīrti's Theory of Exclusion (apoha). Part I. On Concealing. An Annotated Translation of Pramāṇavārttikasvavṛtti 24,16-45,20 (Pramāṇavārttika 1.40-91)*. (Studia Philologica Buddhica. Monograph Series 36) Tokyo 2018: IIBS.
- Franco-Notake 2014 E. Franco and M. Notake, *Dharmakīrti on the Duality of the Object. Pramāṇavārttika III 1-63*. Zürich-Berlin 2014: LIT Verlag.
- Frauwallner 1932 E. Frauwallner, Beiträge zur Apohalehre. I. Dharmakīrti. Übersetzung. WZKM 39, 1932, 247-285 (= 1982, 367-405).
- Frauwallner 1934 E. Frauwallner, Dharmakīrtis Saṃbandha-parīkṣā. Text und Übersetzung. WZKM 41, 1934, 261-300 (= 1982, 490-529).
- Frauwallner 1959 E. Frauwallner, Dignāga, sein Werk und seine Entwicklung. WZKS 3, 1959, 83-164 (= 1982, 759-841).
- Frauwallner 1962 E. Frauwallner, *Aus der Philosophie der śivaitischen Systeme*. Berlin 1962.
- Frauwallner 1982 E. Frauwallner, *Kleine Schriften*. G. Oberhammer und E. Steinkellner (eds). (Glasenapp-Stiftung 22) Wiesbaden 1982.
- rGyal tshab rje rGyal tshab rje Darma rinchen, *'Brel pa brtag pa'i rnam bśad ñi ma'i sñiñ po*. PDF of bLa brañ par ma 1999 in Buddhist Digital Resource Center.
- Houben 1995 Jan E. M. Houben, *The Saṃbandha-*

- Samuddeśa* (Chapter on Relation) and *Bharṭṛhari's Philosophy of Language*. (Gonda Indological Studies 2) Groningen 1995: Egbert Forsten.
- Jambūvijaya 1957 Muniśrī Jambūvijayajī, Jain dārśanika sāhitya ane Sambandhaparīkṣā. In: Śrī Gulbacand Lallabhai (ed.), *Śrīmad Vijaya-Rājendrasūrismāraka-grantha*. Bhavanagara 1957: Saudharmabṛhattāgacchīyajainaśvetāmabara-saṅgha, 774-789.
- Jha 1990 V. N. Jha, *The Philosophy of Relations (Containing the Sanskrit Text and English Translation of Dharma Kīrti's Sambandha-parīkṣā with Prabhācandra's Commentary)*. Delhi 1990.
- Kajiyama 1963 Y. Kajiyama, Trikapañcakacintā. Development of the Buddhist Theory on the Determination of Causality. *Miscellanea Indologica Kiotiensia* 4-5, 1963, 1-15.
- Katsura 1992 Sh. Katsura, Pramāṇavārttika IV, 202-206 – towards the correct understanding of *svabhāvapratibandha*. *IBK* 11.2, 1992, 1052-1047.
- Krasser 2002 H. Krasser, *Śaṅkaranandanas Īśvarāpākaraṇasaṅkṣepa mit einem anonymen Kommentar und weiteren Materialien zur buddhistischen Gottespolemik*. 2 Teile. Wien 2002: VÖAW.
- Lasic 2007 H. Lasic, Fragments of *Pramāṇa* Texts in Tabo Monastery. In: D. Klimburg-Salter, K. Tropper, Chr. Jahoda (eds), *Text, Image and Song in Interdisciplinary Dialogue*. (Proceedings of the Tenth Seminar of the IATS, Vol.7) Leiden-Boston 2007: Brill, 63-77.

- Nishizawa 1997 F. Nishizawa, *Sa bcad* of rGyal tshab rje's 'Brel pa brtag pa'i rnam bśad ñi ma'i sñiñ po. In: *Basic Studies for Tibetan Buddhism 2. Sa-bcad of rJe yab sras gsung 'bum (2)*. Tokyo 1997: The Toyo Bunko, 224-225.
- Ogawa 2019 H. Ogawa, Two Truths Theory: What is *vya-vahāra*? Language as a Pointer to the Truth. *JIPh* 47, 2019, 613-633.
- Ogawa 2020 H. Ogawa, Dignāga on the View of a Generic Term as Denoting a Relation. In: B. Kellner et al. (eds), *Reverberations of Dharmakīrti's Philosophy. Proceedings of the Fifth International Dharmakīrti Conference Heidelberg, August 26 to 30, 2014*. Vienna 2020: VÖAW, 313-330.
- Prueitt 2018 C. Prueitt, Karmic Imprints, Exclusion, and the Creation of the Worlds of Conventional Experience in Dharmakīrti's Thought. *Sophia* 57, 2018, 313-335 (DOI 10.1007/s11841-017-0618-5).
- Ratié 2011 I. Ratié, *Le Soi et l'Autre. Identité, difference et altérité dans la philosophie de la Pratyabhi-jñā*. Leiden-Boston 2011: Brill.
- Ratié 2014 I. Ratié, A Śaiva Interpretation of the *Satkāryavāda*: The Sāṃkhya Notion of *Abhivyakti* and Its Transformation in the Pratyabhi-jñā Treatise. *JIPh* 42, 2014, 127-172.
- Shastri 1972 Swami Dvarikadas Shastri, *Vadanyayaprakaraṇa of Acharya Dharmakīrti with the Commentary Vipanchitārthā of Acharya Śāntarakṣita and Sambandhaparīkṣā with the Commentary of Acharya Prabhachandra*. (Bauddha Bharati Series 8) Varanasi 1972, 139-149.



- Shimizu 1981 Y. Shimizu, Dharmakīrti “Sambandhaparīkṣā” no wayaku kaisetsu. *Bukkyōgaku Kenkyū* 37, 1981, 21-53.
- Stcherbatsky 1932 F. Th. Stcherbatsky, *Buddhist Logic*. I. (Bibliotheca Buddhica Series 26, I) Leningrad 1932 (Dover edition 1962).
- Steinkellner 1997 E. Steinkellner, Kumāriḷa, Īsvarasena, and Dharmakīrti in Dialogue. A New Interpretation of Pramāṇavārttika I 33. In: *Bauddhavidyāsudhākaraḥ. Studies in Honour of Heinz Bechert On the Occasion of His 65th Birthday*. (Indica et Tibetica 30) Swisttal-Oden-dorf 1997, 625-646.
- Steinkellner 2013 E. Steinkellner, *Dharmakīrti’s Frühe Logik II*. (Philologica Buddhica. Monograph Series 29b) Tokyo 2013: IIBS.
- Steinkellner forthcoming E. Steinkellner: Analyse einer Sammelhand-schrift von Werken Dharmakīrtis. In: a fest-schrift ed. by Vincent Eltschinger, Birgit Kellner and Ethan Mills.
- Tauscher 1994 H. Tauscher, Tanjur Fragments from the Ma-nuscript Collection at Ta pho Monastery. *Sambandhaparīkṣā* with Its Commentaries *Vṛtti* and *Ṭikā*. *East and West* 44.1, 1994, 173-184.
- Torella 1994 R. Torella, *The Īsvarapratyabhijñākārikā of Utpaladeva with the Author’s Vṛtti*. (SOR 71) Roma 1994: IsMEO.
- Vetter 1964 T. Vetter, *Erkenntnisprobleme bei Dharmakīrti*. Graz-Wien-Kōln 1964: Hermann Bōhlaus Nachf.
- Yaita 1986 H. Yaita, Tarkarahasya ni mieru inyōbun [Citations to be found in the Tarkarahasya].

*Sankō Bunka Kenkyūjo Nenpō* 16-17 (1983-84), 1986, 17-30.

- Yaita 1989 H. Yaita, Tarkarahasya ni okeru Sambandha-parīkṣā [SP in the Tarkarahasya]. *IBK* 38.1, 1989, 387-385
- Yaita 1990 H. Yaita, Tarkarahasya kenkyū (II) [Studies in the Tarkarahasya]. *Naritasan Bukkyō-kenkyūsho Kiyō* 13, 1990, 83-104.
- Yaita 2005 H. Yaita, *Bukkyō chishikiron no genten kenkyū – Yogaron Inmyō, Dharmottaraṭṭippanaka, Tarkarahasya* [*Three Sanskrit Texts from the Buddhist Pramāṇa-Tradition - The Hetuvidyā Section in the Yogācārabhūmi, the Dharmottaraṭṭippanaka, and the Tarkarahasya*]. Narita 2005: Naritasan Shinshoji.



## Analysis of the *Sambandhaparīkṣā* and its *Vṛtti*<sup>1</sup>

(Those parts of the analysis that refer to the *Parīkṣā* are in grade 12, to the *Vṛtti* in grade 10.)

0.	Purpose: the refutation of relation ( <i>sambandha</i> ) as real	11,2
1.	Refutation in general	<b>k.1-6</b>
1.1	Refutation of relation as dependence ( <i>pāratantrya</i> )	<b>k.1</b>
1.1.1	As depending on another ( <i>parāyattatā</i> ) it is given neither for established nor unestablished entities.	11,4-11
1.1.1.1	When an entity is established, unestablished aspects are impossible.	11,8-11
(1.1)	Conclusion: All entities have no relation in reality, but conceptually constructed relations are not refuted.	11,11-12
1.2	Refutation of relation as fusion of natures ( <i>rūpaśleṣa</i> )	<b>k.2</b>
1.2.1.1	Fusion is impossible when the entities are two;	12,4-5
1.2.1.2	when they are identical there is no relation.	12,5-6
1.2.2	Not being separate ( <i>nairantarya</i> ) is not fusion.	12,7-10
1.2.3	Union ( <i>prāpti</i> ) etc. are the same as not being separate.	12,11
(1.2)	Conclusion: Entities with distinct natures have no relation in reality, except for a conceptually superimposed one.	12,11-14
1.3	Refutation of relation as reliance on another ( <i>parāpekṣā</i> )	<b>k.3</b>
1.3.1	A reliant entity can be existing or non-existing.	13,3-5
1.3.1.1	As non-existing an entity is not reliant,	13,5-6
1.3.2	as existing and indifferent to others an entity is not reliant.	13,7-8

---

<sup>1</sup> A detailed analysis in Tibetan style is also provided in rGyal tshab rje Darma rinchen, *'Brel pa brtag pa'i rnam bśad ñi ma'i sñiñ po*. PDF of bLa brañ par ma 1999 in Buddhist Digital Resource Center, and has been extracted in Nishizawa 1997: 224-225. A formal analysis of the *Sambandhaparīkṣā*'s content is also offered in Jha 1990: xxxvii-xl, followed by a survey of Dharmakīrti's positions "Dharmakīrti on Relations" (*ibid.*: xl-xlvi).

1.4	Refutation of relation between two relata through relation with a single entity relation ( <i>ekābhisambandha</i> )	<b>k.4</b>
1.4.1	If this single entity is not distinct, the relata remain isolated.	14,3-9
1.4.2	If it is distinct, there is no relation.	14,9-14
1.4.3	The unfolding of an infinite regress ( <i>anavasthā</i> ) in this case	14,15-20
1.4.4	Without a relation with an entity relation the latter does not relate.	14,20-22
1.4.5	This also refutes not being separate ( <i>nairantarya</i> ) and the like.	14,22-23
1.5	Summary: All these entities exist on their own. They are not mixed, only conceptual construction ( <i>kalpanā</i> ) mixes them.	<b>k.5</b> 15,3-9
1.5.1	People rely on this construction when using verbal actions and actors to relate the difference of entities from others ( <i>anyāpoha</i> ).	<b>k.6</b> 16,3-7
2.	Refutation in particular	<b>k.7-24</b>
2.1	Refutation of the relationship between cause and effect ( <i>kāryakāraṇabhāva</i> )	<b>k.7-18</b>
2.1.1	This relation is not based on two, for cause and effect do not occur together.	<b>k.7</b> 17,3-11
2.1.2	Relation cannot occur successively ( <i>krameṇa</i> ) irrespective of the other.	<b>k.8</b> 18,3-10
2.1.3	If relation occurs in need of another, this would be assisting ( <i>upakārin</i> ) which is impossible when it does not exist.	<b>k.9</b> 19,3-8
2.1.4	If relation occurs through relation with a single entity relation, entities would be related through all types of common	<b>k.10</b>

	properties.	20,3-7
2.1.5	Relation is not a junction ( <i>yoga</i> ) with the delimitating factors ( <i>upādhi</i> ) of presence and absence.	<b>k.11-17</b>
2.1.5.1	Relation is based on two entities	<b>k.11ab</b> 21,3-7
2.1.5.1.1	Opponent: It is a junction conditioned by presence and absence.	<b>k.11cd</b> 21,8-10
2.1.5.1.2	Response: If it were, why is it not the latter, since words depend on the user.	<b>k.12</b> 22,3-9
2.1.5.2	A user recognizes an effect under certain experience even without instruction.	<b>k.13</b> 23,3-7
2.1.5.2.1	Presence and absence are the content of the knowledge of the relationship between cause and effect.	23,8-12
2.1.5.2.2	The latter is not inferred through the former.	23,13-16
2.1.5.2.3	Even the word “effect” is used for presence and absence as conventional referent for the sake of ease.	<b>k.14-15</b> 24,3-6, 25,3-9
2.1.5.3	The establishment of the relationship between cause and effect.	<b>k.16</b>
2.1.5.3.1	How presence and absence can qualify cause and effect.	26,3-13
2.1.5.3.2	Conceptions of causes and effects show entities falsely as joined.	<b>k.17</b> 27,3-7
2.1.5.3.3	Summary: There is no relation for separate or non-separate entities, nor a fusion through another entity relation.	<b>k.18</b> 28,3-8 28,9-13
2.2	Refutation of other relations	<b>k.19-25</b>
2.2.1	Refutation of the Vaiśeṣika categories connection ( <i>saṃyoga</i> ) and inherence	<b>k.19-22</b>

## (samavāya) as relations

2.2.1.1	The preceding refutation holds for connection, inherence, and the Sāṅkhya-relations.	<b>k.19</b> 29,3-5
2.2.1.1.1	An inherent entity is not assisting,	29,6-10
2.2.1.1.2	nor is a relationship between sustaining and sustained possible.	29,11-16
2.2.1.2	There is no inherent entity even through production,	<b>k.20</b>
2.2.1.2.1	because the respective two are not mutually assisting ( <i>anupakāra</i> ),	30,3-9
2.2.1.2.2	for everything would be mutually inherent.	<b>k.21</b> 31,3-9
2.2.1.2.3	If two entities would produce connection, they are not therefore connected, because also motion ( <i>karman</i> ) would then be connected. They do not cause the connection's abiding ( <i>sthiti</i> ).	<b>k.22</b> 32,3-8 32,9-11
2.2.2	Refutation of suitability ( <i>yogyatā</i> ) as relation	<b>k.23-24</b>
2.2.2.1	That unsuitable entities become suitable ( <i>yogya</i> ) based on connection is incompatible.	<b>k.23</b> 33,3-14
2.2.2.1.1	The nature referred to as suitability is expressed by words for separation, association, and motion.	<b>k.24</b> 34,3-6
(2.2)	Summary: In all these cases a genitive relation of the kind "of this" is not established. Thus the difference of natures is valid for momentary entities.	<b>k.25</b> 35,3-11

	Thus there is no relation defined as connection etc. in reality.	35,11-12
(1.)	Summary: Thus the natures of all entities are without relation.	35,11-13
	Colophon	35,14-15





# **Samples of the Drepung Manuscript**











# **Sambandhaparīkṣā**





## Sambandhaparīkṣā

¶ namo vītarāgāya //

Ms 1b

<sup>α,α'</sup>pāratantryaṃ hi<sup>α'</sup> sambandhaḥ <sup>α"</sup>siddhe kā paratantratā<sup>α"</sup> /

tasmāt sarvasya bhāvasya sambandho nāsti bhāvataḥ<sup>α</sup> // 1

<sup>β,β'</sup>rūpaśleṣo hi<sup>β'</sup> sambandho <sup>β"</sup>dvitve sa ca katham bhavet<sup>β"</sup> /

ṽtasmāt prakṛtibhinnānām sambandho nāsti bhāvataḥ<sup>β,γ</sup> // 2

<sup>δ,δ',δ",δ""</sup>parāpekṣā hi<sup>δ"</sup> sambandhaḥ so 'san katham apekṣate<sup>δ""</sup> /

<sup>δ""</sup>saṃś ca sarvanirāśaṃso<sup>δ'</sup> bhāvaḥ katham apekṣate<sup>δ,δ""</sup> // 3

<sup>ε,ε'</sup>dvayor ekābhisambandhāt<sup>ε'</sup> sambandho yadi tadvayoḥ /

kaḥ sambandho 'navasthā ca na sambandhamatis tathā<sup>ε</sup> // 4

---

<sup>α-α</sup> Ci TŚV 146,14f; AS 111,7f; PKM 504,27f; NKC 305,17f; SVR 812,15f; TR 69\*,20f; VR 15,5f    <sup>α'-α'</sup> Ci PKM 514,14    <sup>α"-α"</sup> Ci ĪPVV 1. 204,21    <sup>β-β</sup> Ci TŚV 146,14f; PKM 504,27f; NKC 306,1f; TR 69\*,23f; VR 15,7f    <sup>β'-β'</sup> Ci PKM 516,1f; NKC 307,19;    <sup>β"-β"</sup> Ci ĪPVV 1. 205,8    <sup>γ-γ</sup> Ci SVR 812,22    <sup>δ-δ</sup> Ci TŚV 148,20f; PKM 505, 20f; NKC 306,6f; SVR 813,3f; VR 15,9f    <sup>δ'-δ'</sup> Ci TR 69\*,23f    <sup>δ"-δ"</sup> Ci PKM 516,13; NKC 308,20    <sup>δ""-δ""</sup> Ci ĪPVV 1. 203,20    <sup>δ""-δ""</sup> Ci ĪPVV 1. 200,24    <sup>ε-ε</sup> Ci TŚV 148,33; PKM 506,4f; NKC 306,16f; SVR 813,14f    <sup>ε'-ε'</sup> Ci PKM 516,15; NKC 309,7

---

1a sambandhaḥ : s{r}ambandhaḥ Ms : sambandhe TŚV    1'a-'b sambandhaḥ siddhe kā : sambandhasiddhikā SVR    1d **bhāvataḥ** Ms (yañ dag ñid du SP), TR : tattvataḥ TŚV, AS, PKM, NKC, SVR, VR, F    2a rūpaśleṣo : rūpeśleṣo VR    2b sa ca : sati ĪPVV    »    **bhāvataḥ** Ms (yañ dag ñid du SP), TR : tattvataḥ TŚV, PKM, NKC, SVR, VR, F    3a parāpekṣā hi : parāpekṣādi° TŚV : parāpekṣā yadi ĪPVV    3b so 'san : so sat TŚV    3d apekṣate : apekṣyate TŚV    4a °sambandhāt : °sambandhā° SVR    4'a-'b ekābhisambandhāt sambandho : ekābhisambandho Ms    4b **tadvayoḥ** TŚV, PKM, SVR : tad dvayoḥ F

॥tau ca bhāvau tadanyaś ca sarve te svātmani sthitāḥ /  
 ॥ity amiśrāḥ svayaṃ bhāvās tān miśrayati kalpanā ॥ 5  
 ॥tām eva cānurundhānaiḥ ॥ kriyākāraḥ kavācīnaḥ /  
 ॥bhāvabhedapratītyarthaṃ saṃyojyante 'bhīdhāyakāḥ ॥ 6  
 ॥kāryakāraṇabhāvo 'pi ॥ tayor asahabhāvataḥ /  
 prasidhyati kathaṃ dviṣṭho 'dviṣṭhe sambandhatā katham ॥ 7  
 ॥krameṇa bhāva ekaṭra vartamāno 'nyaniḥsprāḥ /  
 tadabhāve 'pi tadbhāvāt sambandho naikavṛttimān ॥ 8  
 ॥yady apekṣya tayor ekam anyatrāsau pravartate /  
 upakārī hy apekṣyaḥ syāt ॥ kathaṃ copakaroty asan ॥ 9  
 ॥yady ekārthābhīsambandhāt kāryakāraṇatā tayoh /  
 prāptā dvitvādisambandhāt savyetaraviśāṇa<sub>Ms1b</sub>yoḥ ॥ 10

Ms 1b6,  
end

॥-॥ Ci TŚV 148,34; PKM 506,7f; NKC 306,18f; SVR 813,20f ॥-॥ Ci SS 5,1;  
 3,23f; 11,9f; NKC 309,10; Cie TR 71\*,20f ॥-॥ Ci ĪPVV 1. 200,16-18 ॥-॥ Ci  
 TŚV 149,4f; PKM 506,18f; SVR 814,4f ॥-॥ Ci PKM 516,18 ॥-॥ Ci ĪPVV  
 1. 195,24 ॥-0 Ci TŚV 149,15; PKM 509,21f; SVR 814,11f ॥-0 Ci PKM  
 516,23 ॥- Ci TŚV 149,15f; PKM 510,1f; SVR 814,14f ॥- Ci TŚV 149,16f;  
 PKM 510,3f; SVR 814,19f ॥- Ci PKM 520,1f ॥- Ci TŚV 149,17f; PKM  
 510,5f; SVR 815,3f

5c miśrayati Ms, ĪPVV 1. 204,6 : yojayati SS, ĪPVV 1. 195,24; 200,16 »  
 bhāvās : bhāvās Ms 5d tān : tan TŚV 6a ānāiḥ Ms : ānan  
 TŚV 7a 'pi : pri Ms 7c prasidhyati : prasiddhyati TŚV, SVR, PKM  
 8b 'nyaniḥsprāḥ SPV : 'nyamiḥsprāḥ Ms, TŚV, SVR, PKM 8c 'pi :  
 pi Ms » tadbhāvāt SVR, PKM : bhāvāt tat Ms : bhāvāc ca TŚV  
 8d sambandho : sambandhau PKM 9a apekṣya tayor : apekṣitayor SVR  
 9c apekṣyaḥ : apekṣaḥ TŚV, SVR 10d savyetara° : savyetāra° Ms

<sup>μ</sup>dviṣṭho hi kaścit sambandho nāto 'nyat tasya lakṣaṇam /  
 bhāvābhāvopadhir yogaḥ kāryakāraṇatā yadi<sup>μ</sup> // 11  
<sup>ν</sup>yogopādhī na tāv eva kāryakāraṇatātra kim /  
 bhedāc cen nanv ayaṃ śabdo niyoktāraṃ samāśritaḥ<sup>ν</sup> // 12  
<sup>ξ, ξ'</sup>paśyann ekam adrṣṭasya darśane tadadarśane /  
 apaśyan kāryam anveti vināpy ākhyātr̥bhir janaḥ<sup>ξ</sup> // 13  
<sup>ο, ο'</sup>darśanādarśane muktvā kāryabuddher asambhavāt /  
 kāryādiśrutir apy atra lāghavārthaṃ niveśitā<sup>ξ', ο, ο'</sup> // 14  
<sup>π</sup>tadbhāvabhāvāt tatkāryagatir yāpy anuvarṇyate /  
 saṅketaviṣayākhyā sā sāsnāder gogatir yathā<sup>π</sup> // 15

---

<sup>μ-μ</sup> Ci TŚV 149,18f+33; PKM 510,7f; SVR 815.5+11    <sup>ν-ν</sup> Ci TŚV 149,19f;  
 PKM 510, 9f; SVR 815,12f    <sup>ξ-ξ</sup> Ci TŚV 149,20f; PKM 510,11f; SVR 816,1f  
<sup>ξ'-ξ'</sup> Ci ĪPVV 1. 199,18-21    <sup>ο-ο</sup> Ci TŚV 149,21; PKM 510,13f; SVR 816,7f  
<sup>ο'-ο'</sup> cf. PV 4.268 (= PVin 3.43)    <sup>π-π</sup> Ci TŚV 149,22; PKM 510,15f; SVR 816,15f

---

12c nanv : na tv TŚV    13d vināpy ākhyātr̥bhir : vinā vyākhyātr̥bhir PKM  
 14b asambhavāt : na sambhavāt ĪPVV    15b yāpy anuvarṇyate : yasya tu  
 vartate TŚV

<sup>ρ-ρ</sup>'bhāve bhāvini tadbhāvo bhāva eva ca bhāvitā<sup>ρ</sup> /

prasiddhe hetuphalate pratyakṣānupalambhataḥ<sup>ρ</sup> // 16

<sup>σ</sup>etāvanmātratattvārthāḥ kāryakāraṇagocarāḥ /

vikalpā darśayanty arthān mithyārthā ghaṭitān iva<sup>σ</sup> // 17

<sup>τ</sup>bhinne kā ghaṭanā <sup>τ</sup>bhinne kāryakāraṇatāpi kā /

bhāve hy anyasya viśliṣṭau śliṣṭau syātām katham ca tau<sup>τ</sup> // 18

<sup>υ</sup>saṃyogisamavāyyādi sarvam etena cintitam /

anyonyānupakārāc can na sambandhī ca tādr̥śaḥ<sup>υ</sup> // 19

<sup>φ</sup>janane <sup>φ</sup>pi hi kāryasya kenacit samavāyinā /

Ms 2b samavāyī tadā nāsau na tato<sub>Ms2b</sub> <sup>φ</sup>tiprasaṅgataḥ<sup>φ</sup> // 20

---

<sup>ρ-ρ</sup> Ci TŚV 149,22f; PKM 510,17f; SVR 816,20f    <sup>ρ-ρ</sup> cf. ĪPK I 2.9a-b    <sup>σ-σ</sup> Ci  
TŚV 149,23f; PKM 510,19f; SVR 817,3f    <sup>τ-τ</sup> Ci TŚV 149,24f; PKM 510,21f;  
SVR 817,9f    <sup>υ-υ</sup> Ci PKM 510,23f; SVR 817,17f    <sup>φ-φ</sup> Ci PKM 510,25f; SVR  
818,1f

---

17c arthān TŚV,PKM : arthā SVR    17d <sup>σ</sup>arthā PKM, F : <sup>σ</sup>arthān TŚV,  
SVR    18c bhāve hy anyasya PKM : bhāve vānyasya TŚV : anyasya bhāve  
SVR    19c <sup>σ</sup>ānupakārāc ca TŚV, PKM : <sup>σ</sup>ānupakārātma SVR

ʳtaylor anupakāre ʳpi samavāye paratra vā//  
 sambandho yadi viśvaṃ syāt samavāyi parasparam<sup>ʳ</sup> // 21  
 ʳsaṃyogajanane ʳpīṣṭau tataḥ saṃyoginau na tau /  
 karmādiyogitāpatteḥ sthitiś ca prativarṇitā<sup>ʳ</sup> // 22  
 ʳsaṃyogādyāśraye yogyaṃ ayogyaṃ tac ca jāyate /  
 nityayogyasvabhāvasya tadvaikalyavirodhataḥ // 23  
 iti tadyogyatāvācyāḥ svabhāvo ʳsya nirucyatām /  
 vibhāgayogagatibhiḥ kim anyair gamanādibhiḥ // 24  
 teṣu satsv api tasyeti sambandhasyāprasiddhitaḥ /  
 yuktaḥ svabhāvabhedo ʳyaṃ tat pratikṣaṇajanmanām<sup>ʳ</sup> // 25

sambandhaparīkṣākārikā samāptā // // kṛtir ācāryadharmakīrtipādānām // //

---

ʳʳ Ci PKM 510,27f; SVR 818,6f      ʳʳ Ci PKM 510,29f; SVR 818,11f  
 ʳʳ Cie TR 70\*,5-10; 71\*,4f; VR 19,1-6

---

21a ʳpi : pi Ms    22a ʳpīṣṭau : pīṣṭau Ms    22cd karmādiyogitāpatteḥ sthitiś ca prativarṇitā SP, PKM : karmāder api saṃyogitā syāj jananaṭ tataḥ SVR    23a saṃyog(ād)yāśraye TR (SPV) : śaṃyogyāśraye Ms : ṅcaye VR    23b <yogyam a>yogyam tac ca jāyate TR : yogyan (ta) □ c (ca) jāyate Ms : ayogyas cāpi jāyate VR    23c nitya° em. : nityam TR, VR    23d °vaikalya° TR : °vikalpa° VR    24b ʳsya TR : sya Ms    24c °gatibhiḥ TR : °jātibhiḥ VR    25a satsv api TR : satyepi VR



# Sambandhaparīkṣāvṛtti





## Sambandhaparīkṣāvṛtti

¶ vastubhūtaṃ sambandhaṃ nirākartum āha – pāratantryam ityādi. Ms 2b4

pāratantryaṃ hi sambandhaḥ siddhe kā paratantratā /

tasmāt sarvasya bhāvasya sambandho nāsti bhāvataḥ // 1

[v.1] <sup>α</sup>pāratantryaṃ parāyattatā. <sup>α</sup>sā sambandhaḥ sambandhinaḥ si-  
5 ddhasyāsiddhasya vā<sup>α</sup> bhavet. asiddhasyābhāvarūpatvān na vastubhūtaḥ  
sambandhaḥ. siddhe <sup>α</sup>pi sambandhini kā paratantratā. naivety asamban-  
dhaḥ.<sup>α</sup>

siddhasyāpi kiñcid asiddham astīti. tatsiddhau pāratantryam api na  
saṅgacchate, siddhāsiddhabhāvidōṣavikalpānatikramāt. <sup>β</sup>na caikasya  
10 niṣpannāniṣpanne rūpe staḥ.<sup>β</sup> <sub>(Ms3a)</sub>yata evaṃ na niṣpannasyetarasya vā  
pāratantryam. tasmāt sarvasya bhāvasya sambandho nāsti bhāvato vastu-  
taḥ. vikalpanirmitasyāpratiṣedho <sup>α</sup>vastutvāt.

---

<sup>α-α</sup> Cie NBhūṣ 503,13 <sup>α'-α'</sup> cf. TŚV 146,11-13; PKM 584,22-25; SVR 812,9-13

<sup>β-β</sup> Ci TŚV 146,13

---

1 vastubhūtaṃ sambandhaṃ nirākartum : vastubhūta<sup>+</sup> sambandha<sup>+</sup> nirākartum Ms  
6 naivety : nevety Ms 8 tatsiddhau : tatsiddho Ms 10 <sup>o</sup>syetarasya :  
<sup>o</sup>syaitarasya Ms 11f nāsti bhāvato vastutaḥ rec. (yañ dag ñid du dños por med  
SPV<sub>1</sub>) : nāsti bhā . . . . . taḥ Ms 12 <sup>o</sup>nirmitasyā<sup>o</sup> : <sup>o</sup>ni<sup>+</sup>mitasyā<sup>o</sup> Ms »  
<sup>o</sup>āpratiṣedho rec. (mi dgag T) : <sup>o</sup>ā.r. . . . . dho Ms » <sup>α</sup>vastutvāt rec. (dños po  
med pa<sup>i</sup> phyir SPV<sub>1</sub>) : <sup>α</sup>va . . tvāt Ms

rūpaśleṣo hi sambandho dvitve sa ca katham bhavet /

tasmāt prakṛtibhinnānām sambandho nāsti bhāvataḥ // 2

Ms3a1 [v.2] <sup>α</sup>rūpaśleṣo hi **sambandhaḥ**, na pāratantryam iti cet, tan na. **dvi-**  
**tve** sambandhinoḥ sva . . . . . **sa** svarūpaśleṣaḥ  
svabhāvaikātmyalakṣaṇaḥ **katham bhavet**. naiva bhavet. <sup>β</sup>aikye 'pi tayoh 5  
sambandhinor abhāvāt kaḥ sambandhaḥ, dviṣṭhatvād asya.<sup>β</sup>  
syād etat – naikasvābhāvyaṃ śleṣaḥ. kin tarhi. nairantaryam iti. bhavatu.  
kaḥ pratiṣedhaḥ. kevalaṃ nairantaryam antarābhāva iti vastubhūtaḥ sam-  
bandho na syāt. yadi ca nairantaryam sambandhaḥ, sāntaratā kin na sam-  
bandha iṣyate, ubhayatrāpi sambandhinoḥ svabhāvasthiter abhedāt. 10  
prāptyādayo 'pi nairantaryārthasamāveśina ity anudghoṣyāḥ. yata  
evaṃ na rūpaśleṣalakṣaṇo 'pi sambandhaḥ, **tasmāt prakṛtibhinnānām**  
sarvabhāvānām **sambandho nāsti bhāvato** 'nyatra kalpanāsamāropi-  
tāt.

---

<sup>α-α</sup> PKM 516,1    <sup>β-β</sup> cf. NKC 305,19-20

---

3 rūpaśleṣo hi *sambandhaḥ* rec. (PKM; ño bo 'dres pa 'brel pa yin gyi SPV) : . .  
. . . . . ndhaḥ Ms » na : n{ā}a Ms 5 aikye 'pi rec. (gcig tu  
gyur na yañ SPV) : ekya yi Ms 8 naira<nta>ryam em. : nairaryam Ms  
11 nairantaryā<sup>o</sup> : nerantaryā<sup>o</sup> Ms

parāpekṣā hi sambandhaḥ so 'san katham apekṣate /  
saṃś ca sarvanirāśaṃso bhāvaḥ katham apekṣate // 3

[v.3] atha **parāpekṣā hi sambandho** na rūpaśleṣa iti. atrāpi parasyā-<sup>Ms3a6</sup>  
pekṣamāṇasyāpekṣayā sambandhitve 'pekṣamāṇaḥ san vā 'pekṣate 'san  
5 vā. yady asa<sub>(Ms3b)</sub> n so 'san **katham apekṣate**. svayam anabhinirvṛttasva-  
bhāvasya bhāvasyāpekṣā na dharmāḥ syād iti kaḥ kasya sambandhaḥ.  
**saṃś ca sarvanirāśaṃsaḥ** sarvasvabhāvasvabhāvānapekṣo **bhāvaḥ katham**  
**apekṣate** yenāpekṣā sambandhaḥ syāt. śeṣaṃ pāratantryavad vācyam.

---

3 rūpaśleṣa : rūpakleṣa Ms » 4 'pekṣamāṇaḥ : 'pekṣyamāṇaḥ Ms 7 °ni-  
rāśaṃsaḥ : °nirāśa<sup>+</sup>saḥ Ms » sarvasvabhāvasvabhāvānapekṣo Ms : rañ gi ño  
bo thams cad skyes pa (!) bltos pa med pa'i SPV<sub>t</sub> (cf. T 5a8-5b3 for an explanation of this  
compound)

dvayor ekābhisambandhāt sambandho yadi taddvayoḥ /

kaḥ sambandho 'navasthā ca na sambandhamatis tathā// 4

Ms 3b2 [v.4] mā prāpad ayaṃ doṣa iti. **dvayoḥ** sambandhinor **ekābhisambandhāt** – “ekenārthāntareṇa guṇākhyena saṃyogenānarthāntareṇa vā dharṃeṇāvācyena vastubhūtena sambandhāt<sup>α</sup> kāraṇāt – **sambandho** 5  
**yadī**ṣyate, tadā 'narthāntarapakṣe sambandhinou kevalau kalpitau syātām  
iti na kaścit sambandhaḥ. tato 'pi vā sambandhāt sambandhinor avya-  
tirekeṇaikatvāc ca, vastubhūtasyāvācyasyāpi nyāyato 'rthāntarānarthānta-  
ravikalpānatikramāt. anarthāntarapakṣe na sambandhaḥ sambandhī vā  
kaścit. <sup>β</sup>bhavatu vā sambandho 'rthāntaram anyo vā, tathā **taddvayoḥ** 10  
**kaḥ sambandhaḥ**, tenaikena dvayoḥ sambandhinoḥ kaḥ sambandhaḥ. na-  
iva. 'yathā sambandhinor yathoktadoṣān na sambandhaḥ, tathā 'nenāpi<sup>γ</sup>  
sambandhinor asambandhaḥ.<sup>β</sup> anyathā kevalayoḥ sambandhinoḥ  
sambandhe kaḥ <sub>(Ms4a)</sub> pratiṣedha iti.  
kiñ ca. yady ekārthasambandhāt sambandha iṣyate, tadā sambandha- 15  
sambandhinor apy ekārthasambandhena bhavitavyam. tathā samban-  
dhābhyupagamāt punas tatraikārthābhisambandha ity **anavasthā** bhavet.  
tataś ca kvacin naikārthasambandhaḥ sidhyati. asambandhe sarvatra **na**  
**sambandhamatis tathā**. na vastvanupātini sambandhabuddhir anava-  
sthāyāṃ satyām. kvacid ekārthābhisambandham antareṇa sambandha- 20  
kalpanāyāṃ *prathamayor* api sambandhinor ekārthasambandhāt  
sambandho mā bhūt. kevalayor api sambandhe doṣa uktaḥ. etena nairan-  
taryāder dharmāntarakalpanāpi pratyuktā.

<sup>α-α</sup> Cie TŚV 148,26    <sup>β-β</sup> Cie PKM 505,27-29    <sup>γ-γ</sup> cf. NKC 306,11

3f sambandhinor : sambambhinor Ms    »    ekābhisambandhād : ekābhisam-  
bandhā#####ndhād Ms    6 sambandhinou : sambandhandhinou Ms    »  
kalpitau : kalpito Ms    9 °vikalpānatikramāt : °vikalpanatikramāt Ms    »  
sambandhī : sambandhā Ms    10 tathā : tathā {dvai} Ms    16 ekārtha° n.e.  
T, Ṭ    17 a⟨na⟩vasthā em. : a⟨/⟩vasthā Ms    21 kalpanāyāṃ prathamayor api  
sambandhinor rec. (rtog na ni 'brel pa can dañ po gñis la yañ T) : ka . . . . . yor api  
sambandhinor Ms    21f °sambandhāt sambandho rec. ('brel pa'i phyir 'brel pa SPV) :  
°sambandhā. . . ndho Ms    22f nairantaryāder : nairanta{{ranta}}ryāder Ms

tau ca bhāvau tadanyaś ca sarve te svātmani sthitāḥ /  
ity amiśrāḥ svayaṃ bhāvās tān miśrayati kalpanā // 5

[v.5] yata evam api sambandhavikalpo na jyāyān, tasmāt <sup>α,β</sup>tau ca bhāvau <sup>Ms 4a4</sup>  
sambandhitvenābhimatau **tadanyaś ca** sambandhākhyāḥ **sarve te** yatho-  
5 **ktāḥ svātmani sthitāḥ** svasmin svasmin svabhāve sthitā iti tasmād **amiśrā**  
asambaddhāḥ **svayaṃ** svātmanā **bhāvāḥ**. kathaṃ tarhy āyattarūpās tais  
taiḥ sambandhair vyapadiśyanta iti cet, na bhāvato 'sti kaścit samban-  
dhaḥ. <sup>γ</sup>kevalaṃ **tān bhāvān amiśrān** api **miśrayati kalpanā**.<sup>α,β</sup> <sup>δ</sup>sāpi  
<sup>γ</sup>parāyattarūpān iva kenacin nimittenopadarśanty utpadyate.<sup>γ</sup>

---

<sup>α-α</sup> cf. PKM 506,10-12      <sup>β-β</sup> cf. SVR 813,22-24; see PVSV 147,8-9 (cf.  
Eltschinger 2010: n.30 and p.199; Eltschinger-Ratié 2013: n.159 and p.103)  
<sup>γ-γ</sup> cf. PVSV 34,26f; PV 1.286 with PVSV 151,26-28

---

3 **api** n.e. T      4 **sarve** : sa<sup>+</sup>ve Ms      5 **svasmin** n.e. T      7 'sti : sti Ms  
8 **tān bhāvān amiśrān** rec. (dños po de dag 'dres pa med T, cf. PKM 506,11f) : . . . .  
. . . . . Ms      » **sāpi** (de yañ Ṭ 8b8) : sā . . . . . Ms      9 **parāyattarū-**  
**pān iva** rec. (g'zan la rag las pa'i ño bo lta bur SPV<sub>1</sub>) : . . . . yattarūpān iva Ms

tām eva cānurundhānaiḥ kriyākāra-kavācīnaḥ /

bhāvabhedapratītyarthaṃ saṃyojyante 'bhīdhāyākāḥ // 6

Ms4a6 [v.6] <sup>α</sup>tām eva ca kalpa<sub>(Ms4b)</sub>nām anurundhānaiḥ puruṣaiḥ kriyākāra-kavācīnaḥ kriyākāra-kābhīdhāyīnaś cābhīdhāyākāḥ saṃyojyante, ayaṃ kriyābhīdhāyī ayaṃ kāra-kābhīdhāyīti nīveśyante. bhāvabhedapratītyarthaṃ. <sup>5</sup> bhāvānām bhēdo 'nyāpohaḥ, tasya pratyāyanāya<sup>α</sup>, na punar vastu-bhūtaḥ kriyākāra-kasambandho ~ ~ ~.

---

<sup>α</sup> cf. TŚV 149,3f; PKM 506,13-15; SVR 813,25f

---

<sup>5</sup> °pratītyarthaṃ rec. (SP 6c) : °pratī. . . m Ms

kāryakāraṇabhāvo 'pi tayor asahabhāvataḥ /

prasidhyati katham dviṣṭho 'dviṣṭhe sambandhatā katham // 7

- [v.7] "kāryakāraṇabhāvaḥ sambandhas tarhi setsyatīti cet, tan na, ya- Ms 4b2  
smāt **kāryakāraṇabhāvo** 'pi sambandhaḥ **katham**, naiva, **prasidhyati**.  
5 kimbhūtaḥ. **dviṣṭhaḥ**. kiñ kāraṇam. **tayoḥ** kāryakāraṇayor **asahabhā-**  
**vataḥ**. tathā hi <sup>β</sup>yadā kāraṇaṃ tadā na kāryam, *tatkāle* vā na kāraṇam,<sup>β</sup>  
tulyakālaṃ kāryakāraṇānupapatteḥ. akṣaṇikānām apy abhāvavān na  
kāryakāraṇabhāvaḥ sahabhāvo vety akṣaṇikavādodāharaṇam apy atrāyuk-  
ktam, yato na vastubhūtau sahabhāvinau vidyete yena dvayor vartamānaḥ  
10 sambandhaḥ syāt. **advīṣṭhe** ca bhāve **sambandhatā katham**.<sup>α</sup> naiva. bu-  
ddhyā vyākṛtya sambandho *vikalpena* nirmītaḥ syāt.

---

<sup>α-α</sup> cf. PKM 506,21-26; SVR 814,6-10    <sup>β-β</sup> Cie NBhūṣ 503,11

---

3 tan na : tat na Ms    4 *kāryakāraṇabhāvo* rec. (rgyu dañ 'bras bu'i dños po'i SPV.) : . . . . . ṇabhāvo Ms    6 *kāryaṃ tatkāle* rec. (PKM, SVR) : kārya<sup>+</sup> . . kāle Ms    7 °kāraṇānupapatteḥ : °kāraṇān<sup>+</sup>papat<sup>+</sup>eḥ » akṣaṇikānām : akṣaṇikā<sup>+</sup>ām Ms8 āharaṇam : āhara..m Ms    8f ayuktam : ayukta<sup>+</sup> Ms    11 sbrel<sup>?</sup> for vyākṛtya » sambandho vikalpena miśritaḥ rec. (cf. 'brel na ni / nman par rtog pas bskyed par 'gyur ro T) : sambandha . . . . . miś<sup>+</sup>itaḥ Ms



krameṇa bhāva ekatra vartamāno 'nyaniḥspṛhaḥ /  
tadabhāve 'pi tadbhāvāt sambandho naikavṛttimān // 8

Ms 4b6 [v.8] <sup>α</sup>kāraṇe kārye vā krameṇa sambandho vartata ity apy ayuktam. ta-  
thā hi **krameṇāpi bhāva ekatraikasminn** api kāraṇe kārye vā **vartamānaḥ**  
sa<sub>(Ms5a)</sub>mbandhākhyo **'nyaniḥspṛhaḥ**. kāraṇe vartamānaḥ kāryānapekṣaḥ 5  
kārye vartamānaḥ kāraṇanirapekṣa iti dvayoḥ krameṇa vartamāno na  
tatsambandhaḥ. yo yasmin niḥspṛho **na** tasyāsau **sambandho** bhava-  
ty **ekavṛttimān**, krameṇa kāryakāraṇabhāvī, **tadabhāve 'pi bhāvāt**,<sup>α</sup>  
kāryakāraṇabhūtayoh parasparābhāve 'pi sambandhākhyasyārthasya  
sattākāraṇāt. 10

<sup>α-α</sup> cf. PKM 506,27-507,3; SVR 814,16-17

4 bhāva : bhāve Ms      5 °niḥspṛhaḥ : °nisṛhaḥ Ms      7 tat n.e. T      »  
niḥspṛhaḥ : nisṛhaḥ Ms      8 'pi : pi Ms      9 'pi : pi Ms      10 sattākāra-  
ṇāt : satākāraṇāt Ms

yady apekṣya tayor ekam anyatrāsau pravartate /

upakārī hy apekṣyaḥ syāt kathaṃ copakaroty asan // 9

[v.9] mā bhūd eṣa doṣa iti. <sup>α</sup>yady apekṣya tayoh <sup>β</sup>kāryakāraṇayor **ekam** Ms 5a3  
 kāryaṃ kāraṇaṃ **vānyatra** kārye kāraṇe **vāsau** sambandhaḥ krameṇa **pra-**  
 5 **varata** iti saspr̥hatvena dviṣṭha eveṣyate, tadā tenāpekṣyamāṇenopakā-  
 riṇā bhavitavyam.<sup>β</sup> kiñ kāraṇam. yata **upakārī hy apekṣyaḥ syān** nānyaḥ.  
 apekṣyamāṇam upakāry astv iti cet. **kathaṃ copakaroty asan.** kāraṇakāle  
 kāryākhyo 'san kāryakāle kāraṇākhyo 'san naivopakaroty asāmarthyāt.<sup>α</sup>

---

<sup>α-α</sup> cf. PKM 507,3-8; SVR 814,21-815,1

<sup>β-β</sup> cf. PKM 519,24-520,1

---

3 °kāraṇayor **ekam** rec. (PKM, SVR) : °kāraṇa ... Ms  
 8 kāryākhyo 'san (PKM, SVR) : kā..(khyo 'san) Ms

4 kārye : kārya Ms

yady ekārthābhisambandhāt kāryakāraṇatā tayoh /  
 prāptā dvitvādisambandhāt savyetaraviṣāṇayoh // 10

Ms5a5 [v.10] <sup>a</sup>kiñ ca. yady ekārthābhisambandhāt kāraṇāt kāryakāraṇatā tayoh  
 kāryakāraṇatvenābhimatayoh, tadā saṅkhyākhyena dvitvādinā samban-  
 dhāt prāptā kāryakāraṇatā savyetaragoviṣāṇa<sub>(Ms5b)</sub>yor<sup>aa</sup> api. na ceṣyate, 5  
 tadanyatrāpi mā bhūt. ādigrahaṇena paratvāparatvaviṣāṇatvādinā sam-  
 bandhāt.

---

<sup>a-a</sup> cf. PKM 507,9-11; SVR 815,7-9

---

3 kāryakāraṇatā rec. (rgyu dañ 'bras bu ñid SPV<sub>ṛ</sub>, PKM) : kārya . . . . . Ms

4 °ābhimatayoh rec. (mñon par 'dod pa SPV<sub>ṛ</sub>, PKM) : °ābhi . . . . . yos Ms

dviṣṭho hi kaścit sambandho nāto 'nyat tasya lakṣaṇam /  
bhāvābhāvopādhir yogaḥ kāryakāraṇatā yadi // 11

[v.11] "na yena kenacid ekena sambandhāt sambandhaḥ, kin tarhi Ms 5b1

sambandhalakṣaṇenaikeneti cet, tan na. <sup>β</sup>dviṣṭho hi kaścit padārthaḥ  
5 sambandhaḥ. nāto 'rthadvayābhisambandhino 'rthād anyat tasya sam-  
bandhasya lakṣaṇam<sup>β</sup> upapadyate, yena saṅkhyādes tasya viśeṣo vya-  
vasthāpyeta.

kasyacid bhāve bhāvo 'bhāve 'bhāvaḥ, tayor bhavator abhavatoś ca yau  
bhāvau 'bhāvau tāv upādhir viśeṣaṇaṃ yasya yogasya sambandhasyāsau

10 bhāvābhāvopādhir yogaḥ kāryakāraṇatā yadi, na sarvaḥ sambandhaḥ,<sup>α</sup>

---

<sup>α-α</sup> cf. PKM 507,11-14      <sup>β-β</sup> cf. SVR 815,6-7

---

4 ekena n.e. T, †      5 'rthadvayābhi<sup>o</sup> rec. (don gñis dañ mñon par SPV<sub>1</sub>, PKM) :  
...yābhi<sup>o</sup> Ms      » arthād n.e. T      » 6 upapadyate em. ('thad na T, †) :  
upalabhyate Ms      8f yau bhāvau <'bhāvau> tāv em. (yod pa dañ med pa gañ yin  
pa de'i SPV<sub>1</sub>) : yau bhāvau tāv Ms      9 upādhir em. : upādhi<sup>o</sup> Ms      10 sam-  
bandhaḥ n.e. T

yogopādhī na tāv eva kāryakāraṇatātra kim /

bhedāc cen nanv ayaṃ śabdo niyoktāraṃ samāśritaḥ // 12

Ms 5b4 [v.12] <sup>a</sup>tadā yau tau **yogopādhī** bhāvābhāvau **tāv eva kāryakāraṇatātra** **na kim**, yenāsato 'phalasya sambandhasya kalpanā. **bhedāc cet**, syād etat – bhāve bhāvo 'bhāve 'bhāva iti bahavo 'bhidheyāḥ, kāryakāraṇateti 5 caikārthābhīdhāyinā śabdena vācyās tadviṣayā ayuktā iti bhāvābhāvau na kāryakāraṇateṣyate. **nanv ayaṃ śabdo niyoktāraṃ** puruṣaṃ **samāśrita** iti niyoktṛsamāśrayād yaṃ śabdān asau yathā prayuñkte sa tathā prāhety anekatrāpy ekā śrutir ity a<sub>(Ms6a)</sub> parihāra eva.<sup>a</sup>

---

<sup>a-a</sup> cf. PKM 507,17-22

---

3 tadā em. (PKM, de'i tshe T, Ṭ) : yadā Ms

paśyann ekam adṛṣṭasya darśane tadadarśane /

apaśyan kāryam anveti vināpy ākhyātr̥bhir janah // 13

[v.13] tasmāt tāv eva bhāvābhāvau kāryakāraṇatā yuktā. <sup>α,β</sup>yasmāt Ms 6a1

paśyann ekam kāraṇābhimatam upalabdhilakṣaṇaprāptasyādṛṣṭasya

5 kāryākhyasya darśane sati yat paśyan dṛṣṭavāṃs tadadarśane saty apaśyan  
kāryābhimataṃ kāryam anvetīdam ato bhavatīti pratipadyate<sup>α</sup> vināpy  
ākhyātr̥bhir janah, ata idam bhavatīty ākhyātāram antareṇa janah.<sup>β</sup>

saṅketād anvetīty api vārttaḥ. tathā hi na bhāvābhāvābhyām anyat saṅke-  
te 'pi pratipadyate. tasmād yatpratipattau yatpratipattiḥ, sa tasyārthaḥ.

10 tad yathā śuklapaṭapratipattau śuklapratipatteḥ śauklyam. bhāvābhāvau  
ca pratipadyamānaḥ kāryakāraṇatām pratipadyata iti bhāvābhāvau kārya-  
kāraṇatāpratipatter arthaḥ, nānyaḥ.

syād etat – bhāvābhāvau sādhanam anyā kāryakāraṇatā sādhyā. anyā cet,

kin na tasyā rūpaṃ nirdiśyate. utpādyotpādakabhāvas tarhi rūpam. tat kin

15 nāmāntarād arthabhedo yenaivam ucyate. tathā hy utpādyotpādakabhāvo  
janyaJanakabhāvaḥ kāryakāraṇabhāva ity evamādayaḥ paryāyāḥ.

---

<sup>α-α</sup> Ce'e PVSV 22,2-3

<sup>β-β</sup> cf. PKM 507, 23-508,2; SVR 816,3-6

---

5 °paśyan : °pasyan Ms    »    tadadarśane : tadaśarśane Ms

darśanādarśane muktvā kāryabuddher asambhavāt /

kāryādiśrutir apy atra lāghavārthaṃ niveśitā // 14

Ms 6a6 [v.14] <sup>a</sup>tasmād **darśanādarśane** viṣayiṇā viṣayapradarśanād bhāvābhā-  
vau<sub>(Ms6b)</sub> **muktvā kāryabuddher asambhavāt** kāraṇāt **kāryādiśrutir apy atra**  
bhāvābhāvayor mā lokaḥ pratipadam iyantīṃ śabdamaḷām abhidhād iti 5  
vyavahāralāghavārthaṃ niveśiteti.<sup>a</sup>

---

<sup>a</sup> cf. PKM 508,2-5; SVR 816,9-11

---

5 lokaḥ (PKM, SVR) : loka° Ms » iya<n>tīṃ em. (SVR) : iyatīṃ Ms »  
abhidhād Ms : abhidadyād PKM, SVR

tadbhāvabhāvāt tatkāryagatir yāpy anuvarṇyate /

saṅketaviṣayākhyā sā sāsnaḍer gogatir yathā // 15

[v.15] nānyā<sup>α</sup> 'nvayavyatirekābhyāṃ kāryakāraṇatā. nānyā cet, katham Ms 6b1  
 bhāvābhāvābhyāṃ sā prasādhyate. <sup>β</sup>tadbhāve bhāvāl liṅgāt tatkāryagatiḥ,  
 5 yasya bhāve bhāvas tasya kāryasya gatiḥ, yāpy anuvarṇyate asyedaṃ  
 kāryaṃ kāraṇaṅ ceti, saṅketaviṣayākhyā sā. yad etad anuvarṇanaṃ  
 tadbhāvabhāvitvena kāryakāraṇasaṅketaviṣayākhyānam etad, nārthabhe-  
 daḥ. kim iva. sāsnaḍer gogatir yathā. yathā gaur ayaṃ sāsnaḍimattvād ity  
 anena govyavahārasya viṣayaḥ pradarśyate.<sup>α,β</sup>

---

<sup>α-α</sup> cf. PKM 508,6-10

<sup>β-β</sup> cf. SVR 816,17-19

---

3 nānyā 'nvaya° Ms : anvaya° (PKM, SPV, Ṭ) 4 bhāvā<bhāvā>bhyāṃ em.  
 (PKM) : bhāvābhyāṃ Ms 6 yad em. (gaṅ yaṅ T, Ṭ) : tad Ms



bhāve bhāvini tadbhāvo bhāva eva ca bhāvitā /  
 prasiddhe hetuphalate pratyakṣānupalambhataḥ // 16

Ms 6b4 [v.16] syād etat – bhāvābhāvayoḥ kāryakāraṇatve kāraṇatvaṃ kevalaṃ  
 kāryatvañ cobhayagatabhāvābhāvāpekṣam. anyathā kathaṃ bhāvamātraṃ  
 kāraṇaṃ kāryaṃ vā. na ca bhavator abhavatoś ca bhāvābhāvāv ubhaya- 5  
 gatau kāryatvaṃ kāraṇatvaṃ vā. kāryakāraṇatā tu syād iti.  
 tan na. ubhayagatatve 'py uttarabhāvābhāvaviśeṣaṇau pūrvasya bhāvā-  
 bhāvau kāraṇatvaṃ. pūrvasya bhāvābhāvaviśeṣaṇāv uttarasya bhāvā-  
 bhāvau kāryatvaṃ. tathā hi <sup>(Ms7a)</sup> **bhā** **ve bhāvini** bhavanadharmini bhāve  
**tadbhāvaḥ** kāraṇābhimatasya bhāvaḥ. **bhāva evetihāpy** avadhāraṇam. 10  
 anena vyatireka ākṣiptaḥ. kāraṇābhimatasya **bhāva eva ca bhāvitā**  
 kāryābhimatasya kāryatvaṃ iti **prasiddhe pratyakṣānupalambhato hetu-**  
**phalate.** yata evaṃ bhāvābhāvāv eva kāryakāraṇatā, nānyā.<sup>α</sup>

---

<sup>αα</sup> cf. PKM 508,10-14

---

3 °kāraṇatve : °karaṇatve Ms    5 bhāvābhāvāv em. (yod pa dañ med pa T) :  
 bhāvāv Ms    10 <bhāvaḥ.> bhāva evetihāpy em. (yod pa'o // yod pa ñid do źes 'dir  
 yañ SPV; T 17b4) : bhāva eva itihāpy<sup>o</sup> Ms    13 yata evam Ms : de ltar na T  
 (tato PKM)    » eva (PKM) : eda Ms

etāvanmātratattvārthāḥ kāryakāraṇagocarāḥ /

vikalpā darśayanti arthān mithyārthā ghaṭitān iva // 17

[v.17] tenaitāvanmātratattvārthāḥ. <sup>α</sup>etāvanmātraṃ bhāvābhāvau. tāv Ms 7a2  
 eva tattvaṃ bhūtaṃ yasyārthasyāsāv etāvanmātratattvaḥ. so 'rtho  
 5 yeṣāṃ vikalpānāṃ ta etāvanmātratattvārthāḥ. *kim.* etāvanmātrabījāḥ  
 kāryakāraṇagocarāḥ. te darśayanti ghaṭitān iva sambaddhān ivāsamba-  
 ddhān arthān. evaṃ ghaṭanāc ca mithyārthāḥ.<sup>α</sup>

---

<sup>α-α</sup> cf. PKM 508,14-17

---

4 etāvanmātra° n.e. T (Ṭ 18a7)

bhinne kā ghaṭanā 'bhinne kāryakāraṇatāpi kā /

bhāve hy anyasya viśliṣṭau śliṣṭau syātām katham ca tau // 18

Ms 7a4 [v.18] kim abhūtaḥ sambandhaḥ pradarśyate tair yena mithyārthāḥ. evam  
 etat. tathā hy atra dvayī kalpanā. sambadhyamānaḥ "kāryakāraṇabhūto  
 'rtho bhinno 'bhinno vā syāt. yadi bhinnaḥ, **bhinne kā ghaṭanā**. naiva, 5  
 svasvabhāvavyavasthiteḥ. athābhinnaḥ, **abhinne kāryakāraṇatāpi kā**. nai-  
 va,<sup>α</sup> aniṣṭannasya kartavyasya kāraṇād vyatiriktasyābhāvāt. kutaḥ punar  
 dvayor ghaṭanā.  
 βsyād etat – na bhinnasyābhinnasya vā kevalasya sambandhaḥ, kin ta-  
 rhi, sambandhākhyenaikena sambandhād iti. <sup>(Ms7b)</sup>atrāpi **bhāve** sattāyām 10  
**anyasya** sambandhākhyasya **viśliṣṭau** kāryakāraṇābhimateau **śliṣṭau syā-**  
**tām katham**.<sup>β</sup> naiva. sa eva sambandhākhyo 'paraḥ syāt. na punas tadbhā-  
 ve 'nyasya kasyacit svabhāvasaṃsarga iti kuto bhāvataḥ sambandhaḥ.

---

<sup>α-α</sup> cf. PKM 508,18-20      <sup>β-β</sup> cf. PKM 508,21-509,1

---

4f °bhūto 'rtho Ms : yañ dag pa ma yin pa'i don T (Ṭ 18b5)      6 athābhinnaḥ em.  
 (SVR 817,13; PKM) : athābhinne Ms      11 kāryakāraṇābhimatam em. (PKM,  
 Ṭ 19b4) : kāryakāraṇatābhimatam Ms (SVR 817,15)      12 °ākhyo Ms : žes bya  
 ba'i no bo T (Ṭ 19b5)      » 'paraḥ syāt Ms : gžan žig yod par zad pa'i phyir T  
 (Ṭ 19b5f) (?)      13 svabhāva° Ms : dños po T (Ṭ 19b6)

saṃyogisamavāyyādi sarvam etena cintitam /

anyonyānupakārāc ca na sambandhī ca tādrīśaḥ // 19

[v.19] <sup>a</sup>saṃyogisamavāyyādi. ādigrahaṇena svasvāmyādi. sarvam <sup>Ms 7b2</sup>

etenānantaroktena sāmānyena sambandhapraṭiṣedhakena granthena cin-

5 titam<sup>a</sup> na saṃyogādīlakṣaṇo vastutaḥ sambandho 'stīti.

samavāyīnas tāvan na sambandhitā, yathā śauklyam guṇaḥ paṭe sama-

vetam. <sup>β</sup>anayor anyonyam parasparam anupakārād ajanyajanakabhāvāt

kāraṇāt samavāyīlakṣaṇo na sambandhī ca tādrīśo 'nupakāryānupakāra-

kabhūtaḥ.<sup>β</sup> tathā hi yo yena upakāryaḥ sa tam apekṣate, yañ cāpekṣate

10 tena tasya sambandhaḥ. na caivam śuklapaṭayoḥ, svarūpasiddheḥ.

γādhārādheyabhāvo 'pi nākāryakāraṇabhūtaḥ, kāryakāraṇabhāve ca

tadbhāvī doṣaḥ. kāryakāraṇabhāve saty ādhārādheyabhāvāt śuklapaṭayoḥ

sambandhakalpanāpy asādhvī.<sup>γ</sup> tathā hi na tayor laukika ādhārādheya-

bhāvo 'sti. janyajanakalakṣaṇe cādhā<sub>(Ms8a)</sub>rādheyabhāve sāmānyatadvatoḥ

15 parasparam anupakāryopakārakayoḥ samavāyīlakṣaṇaḥ sambandho na  
syāt.

<sup>a-a</sup> cf. PKM 509,2-3

<sup>β-β</sup> cf. PKM 509,4-5

<sup>γ-γ</sup> cf. HBṬ 8,20-24

5 'stīti : stīti Ms 6 paṭe em. (snam bu SPV<sub>1</sub>) : ghaṭe Ms » 9 upakāryaḥ

em. (phan gdags par bya ba T, Ṭ 20b3) : kāryaḥ Ms 11 'pi : pi Ms 14 'sti :

sti Ms

janane 'pi hi kāryasya kenacit samavāyinā /  
 samavāyī tadā nāsau na tato 'tiprasaṅgataḥ // 20

Ms 8a1 [v.20] syād etad – <sup>α,β</sup>asti kaścit samavāyī yo 'vayavirūpaṃ kāryākhyam  
 janayati. tena nānupakārād asambandhiteti. evañ **janane 'pi hi kāryasya**  
**kenacit samavāyinābhyupagamyamāne nāsau samavāyī tadā**, jananakāle 5  
 janyasyāniṣpatter<sup>α,β</sup> dvayor asamavāyāt, niṣpanne 'pi kārye kāraṇasya  
 tirodhānāt, atirobhāve ca samavahitayor upakāryopakārahāvābhāvāt.  
 bhavatu vā kaścit samavāyī, <sup>γ</sup>na tu **tato** janānāt kāraṇāt. kiṃ kāraṇam.  
**atiprasaṅgataḥ**, kumbhakārāder api ghaṭasya janānāt<sup>γ</sup> sambandhitāpatteḥ.

<sup>α-α</sup> cf. PKM 509,6-9

<sup>β-β</sup> cf. SVR 817,24f + 818,3f

<sup>γ-γ</sup> cf. SVR 818,4-5

4 anupakārād Ms : phan par byed pa'i phyir T » 'pi : pi Ms 9 kumbha-  
 kārāder Ms (SVR) : °ādi n.e. T (Ṭ 22a6) » sambandhitā° Ms : de dañ 'brel  
 pa can du T (Ṭ 22a6f)

tayor anupakāre 'pi samavāye paratra vā /

sambandho yadi viśvaṃ syāt samavāyi parasparam // 21

[v.21] atha mā *bhūd eṣa* doṣa iti <sup>α</sup>tayoḥ samavāyinoḥ parasparam **anupa-** Ms 8a4  
**kāre 'pi**, tābhyāṃ sambandhibhyām anupakāre ca **samavāye**, nityatvāt  
 5 tasya, tābhyāṃ samavāye ca **paratra vā** kvacid anupakāre 'pi, **sambandho**  
**yadiṣyate**, tadā **viśvaṃ** sarvaṃ jagat parasparāsambaddhaṃ **samavāyi**  
**parasparam syāt.**<sup>α</sup> na caivam. tasmād evam upakārānupakārapakṣe na sa-  
 mavāyo 'sti. na cānyaḥ prakāraḥ sambhavati. <sub>(Ms8b)</sub> anena saṃyogināv api  
 pratyuktau.

---

<sup>α-α</sup> cf. PKM 509,10-13

---

3 atha mā *bhūd eṣa* doṣa iti rec. (skyon 'dir mi 'gyur bar bya ba'i phyir SPV;  
 cf. Ms 5a3) : a(tha mā) . . . . . doṣa iti Ms 4 'pi : pi Ms 5 sa<ma>vāye  
 em. : savāye Ms » 'pi : pi Ms 8 'sti : sti Ms

samyogajanane 'pīṣṭau tataḥ samyoginau na tau /  
karmādiyogitāpatteḥ sthitiś ca prativarnitā // 22

Ms 8b1 [v.22] <sup>α</sup>api ca samyogasya kāryatvāt tābhyāṃ <sup>β</sup>tajjananāt samyogitā yadi  
tayoḥ, tadaivaṃ **samyogajanane 'pīṣṭau tataḥ** samyogajanānāt kāraṇān  
**na tau samyoginau.**<sup>β</sup> kiṃ kāraṇam. **karmādiyogitāpatteḥ.** yadi samyoga- 5  
jananāt samyogī karmaṇo 'pi samyogitā syāt. 'tathā hy <sup>γ</sup>'anyatarakarmaja  
ubhayakarmajaḥ samyoga iṣyate. **ādīgrahaṇena** samyogasyāpi samyogitā  
syāt, yataḥ samyogajo 'pīṣyate 'sāv<sup>γ</sup> iti.  
<sup>δ</sup>na samyogajanānāt samyogitā, kin tarhi, sthāpanād iti cet. tan na. **sthitiś**  
**ca prativarnitā**<sup>δ</sup>, sthāpyasthāpakayor janyajanakabhāvān nānyā sthitiṣ<sup>γ</sup> iti 10  
pramāṇavārttike<sup>ε</sup> pratikṣiptā.<sup>α</sup>

---

<sup>α-α</sup> cf. PKM 509,13-20      <sup>β-β</sup> cf. SVR 818,13-14      <sup>γ-γ</sup> cf. SVR 818,15-17      <sup>γ'-γ'</sup> cf.  
PDhS §§ 169-171      <sup>δ-δ</sup> Cie TR 70\*,3      <sup>ε</sup> cf. PV 1.145 with PVSV 71,11-72,10

---

4 °jananāt kāraṇāt em. (cf. PKM 509,18) : °jananakāraṇāt Ms      6 'pi : pi Ms  
8 'pīṣyate : pīṣyate Ms

saṃyogādyāśraye योग्याय योग्याय तच्च जायते /

nityayogyasvabhāvasya तदवैकल्यविरोधताह् // 23

[v.23] yadī saṃyogādīm antareṇa saṃyogādibuddhiḥ, vibhaktayor yad Ms 8b4

rūpaṃ tat samprayuktayor api. evaṃ samprayuktayor yad rūpaṃ tad

5 vibhaktayor api sthitāsthitayoś ceti kin na saṃyogādibuddhiḥ. na caivam.

tasmāt saṃyogavibhāgakarmāṇi saṃyogādibuddher nimittam iti cet. <sup>a</sup>na,

tulyaparyanuyogataḥ. tavāpi tulyarūpasya vibhaktādeḥ kin na saṃyogā-

disamavāyaḥ. <sup>a</sup>

tajjananakarmābhāvān na saṃyogavibhāgāv iti cet. ta <sub>(Ms9a)</sub>d evaṃ sati kin

10 na karmāpi tatkāraṇāni ceti duruttaram etat. <sup>β</sup>tasmāt tvayaitad eva vaktā-

vyam. tad vibhaktādirūpaṃ ayogyam prāk paścāt saṃyogādyāśraye yo-

gyaṅ jāyate. <sup>β</sup> kiṃ kāraṇam. <sup>γ</sup>yato nityasaṃyogādiyogayogyasvabhāvasya

tadvaikalyavirodhataḥ, <sup>γ</sup> saṃyogādiyogavaikalyam virudhyate. mayāpi

caitad eva vaktavyam saṃyogādivarjitam.

---

<sup>α-α</sup> Ci TR 70\*,16f      <sup>β-β</sup> cf. TR 70\*,18-20      <sup>γ-γ</sup> cf. TR 70\*,21f

---

4 sam⟨pra⟩yuktayor em. : saṃyuktayor Ms      4f samprayuktayor ⟨yad rūpaṃ

tad vibhaktayor api⟩ em. (ldan pa'i ṅo bo gaṅ yin pa de ṅid bral ba'i ṅo bo yaṅ yin

SPV<sub>ṛ</sub>; cf. Ṭ 24a5f) : samprayuktayoḥ Ms      9 tajjanana° : tarjjanana° Ms

11 saṃyogādyāśraye em. (sbyor ba la sogs pa'i gnas SPV<sub>ṛ</sub>; Ṭ 25a2) : saṃyogyā-

śraye Ms      12 nitya° em. : nityam Ms, TR, VR



iti tadyogyatāvācyāḥ svabhāvo 'sya nirucyatām /

vibhāgayogagatibhiḥ kim anyair gamanādibhiḥ // 24

Ms 9a2 [v.24] <sup>α</sup>tasmād **yogyatāśabdavācyāḥ svabhāvo 'syārthasya nirucyatām**  
**vibhāgayogagatibhiḥ** saṃyogavibhāgakarmaśabdaiḥ. tadā **kim** aphalair  
**anyair gamanādibhiḥ**<sup>α</sup> kalpitaiḥ. naiva kiñcit. ādigrahaṇāntare saṃyo- 5  
gavibhāgaparatvāparatvādibhiḥ.

---

<sup>αα</sup> cf. TR 70\*,28-30

---

3 yogyatāśabdavācyāḥ (ruñ ba'i tshig brjod pa na T) : yogyatā(śa){bde..}(bda)-  
vācyāḥ Ms 5 aphalair : apha(l)er Ms » anyair : anyer Ms 5f °gra-  
haṇāntare saṃyoga° rec. (nañ du sbyor ba SPV<sub>1</sub>) : °graha . . . . . ga° Ms

teṣu satsv api tasyeti sambandhasyāprasiddhitaḥ /

yuktaḥ svabhāvabhedo 'yaṃ tat pratikṣaṇajanmanām // 25

[v.25] kutaḥ. yatas teṣu gamanādiṣu satsv api kalpiteṣv tasyeti sambandhasyāprasiddhitaḥ. <sup>α,α'</sup>pāratantryam ityādi<sup>α</sup>nā sarvathā sambandhasya niṣiddhatvāt,<sup>α'</sup> asya karma saṃyogo vibhāgo veti sambandhāsiddheḥ, <sup>β</sup>kutas tannimitto vyapadeśaḥ. yathānyagataiḥ karmādibhir anyasambandhī na bhavaty asambandhāt,<sup>β</sup> tadvad abhimatair api. yata evaṃ na karmādisambandhād gamanādayaḥ, tasmāt **pratikṣaṇajanmanām** bhāvānām nirantarotpattyādyāśrayair aparā<sub>(Ms9b)</sub>paraiḥ pratyayaiḥ **svabhāvabhedo 'yaṃ** saṃyukto viyukto gacchatīty *evam*ādir **yuktaḥ**, sasthiraikasvabhāvānām yogādisambandhāsiddher iti na kaścīd bhāvataḥ sambandhaḥ saṃyogādilakṣaṇaḥ. ity asambandhāḥ sarvabhāvasvabhāvāḥ. *śāntiḥ*.

*sambandhaparīkṣāvṛttiḥ samāptā*. kṛtir ācāryadevendrabuddheḥ. krauddha~anvitasya pustakam.

<sup>α-α</sup> see f. 2b4      <sup>α'-α'</sup> cf. TR 70\*,31-71\*,1      <sup>β-β</sup> Cie TR 71\*,1f

3 tasyeti : tasyaiti Ms      4 °āprasiddhitaḥ : °āpraśiddhitaḥ Ms      10 gacchatīty *evam*ādir em. (?) : gacchatīty . . . ādir Ms      » yuktaḥ, sa° : yukto sa° Ms      12 *sarvabhāvasvabhāvāḥ* rec. (dños po thams cad kyi rañ bzin ni SPV<sub>1</sub>) : sarva . . . . . ti . . . . . Ms      13 *śāntiḥ* rec. (ži ba yin no SPV<sub>1</sub>)      14 *sambandhaparīkṣāvṛttiḥ samāptā* em. : *sambandhaparīkṣāvṛttir vādisiṃhācāryadharmakīrtinā kṛtā samāptā* retr. ('brel pa brtag pa zes bya ba'i 'grel pa smra ba'i señ ge slob dpon chos kyi grags pas mdzad pa rdzogs so SPV<sub>1</sub>)      14f krauddha~anvitasya (?) : krodhdha~anvitasya Ms



# **Diplomatic Edition**



## Sambandhaparīkṣā and Sambandhaparīkṣāvṛtti

### f.1b (099: 130B)

1b1 ¶ namo vītarāgāya // [v.1] pāratantryaṃ hi s{r}ambandhaḥ  
siddhe kā paratantratā / tasmāt sarvasya bhāvasya sambandho nā-  
sti bhāvataḥ // [v.2] rūpaśleṣo hi sambandho dvitve sa ca katham  
bhavet{i} / tasmāt pra !

1b2 kṛtibhinnānāṃ sambandho nāsti bhāvataḥ // [v.3] parāpekṣā  
hi saṃ\* ☀ bandhaḥ so 'san\* katham apekṣate / saṃś ca sarvva-  
nirāśaṃso bhāvaḥ katham apekṣate // [v.4] dvayor ekābhisamba !

1b3 ndho yadi tadvayoḥ / ka(h sambandho 'nava)sthā ca na sa-  
mbandhamati ☀ s tathā // [v.5] tau ca bhāvau tadanyaś ca sarvve te  
svātmani sthitāḥ / ity amiśrāḥ svayam bhavās tān miśrayati kalpanā

1b4 // [v.6] tām eva cānurundhānaiḥ kriyākāravācinaḥ / bhāva-  
bhe ! ☀ dap+atītyartha(m) saṃyo(jyante 'bhidhāyakā)ḥ // [v.7] kā-  
ryakāraṇabhāvo pi tayor asahabhāvataḥ / prasidhyati ka

1b5 thaṃ dvi(ṣṭho 'dviṣṭhe) samba({ndhā}ndhatā katham) //  
[v.8] krameṇa bhāva e ! ☀ katra va+ttamāno 'nyanisprhaḥ / tada-  
bhāve pi bhāvāt tat sambandho naikavṛttimān\* // [v.9] yady apekṣya  
tayor e

1b6 kam anyatrāsau (pra . . . . . kārī) hy apekṣyaḥ syāt  
katham copakaroty asan\* // [v.10] yady ekārthābhi(samba)ndhāt  
kāryakāraṇatā tayor / prāptā dvitvādisambandhāt savyetāraviṣāna

## f.2b (063: 59B)

2b1 tipra(saṅga)taḥ // [v.21] . . . . . (k)āre pi samavāye  
 paratra vā / sambandho yadi viśvaṃ syāt samavāyi parasparam //  
 [v.22] saṃyogajanane pīṣṭau tataḥ saṃyogināu na tau / karmādiyo-  
 gitā

2b2 patteḥ s(th)itiś ca p<sup>+</sup>ati . . ṛ<sup>+</sup>ita // [v.23] saṃyogyāś<sup>+</sup>aye yo-  
 gyan (ta) † ☼ c (ca) jāyate / nityayogyasvabhāvasya tad(v)aikalya-  
 virodhataḥ // [v.24] iti tadyogyatāvācyaḥ svabhāvo sya ni

2b3 rucyatā<sup>+</sup> / vibhāgayogagatibhiḥ kim anyai<sup>+</sup> gamanādi). . ☼  
 (ḥ // [v.25] (t)e . . . . . sy)āpra(s)iddhitāḥ // .(u . taḥ)  
 svabhāvabhedo 'yan tat pratikṣaṇajanmanām\*

2b4 // sambandhaparīkṣākārikā samāptā // // kṛtir ācārya ☼  
 dharmmakīr(tt)ipādānā<sup>+</sup> // //

**Sambandhaparīkṣāvṛtti, dipl. ed., f.2b (063: 59B)**

2b4 ¶ vastubhūta<sup>+</sup> sambandha<sup>+</sup> nirākartum āha / **pāratantryam**  
ityādi / [v.1] **pāratantryam** parā

2b5 yattatā / sā sambandhaḥ sambandhinaḥ siddhasyāsiddhasya  
vā bha ḥ : ☀ vet\* / asiddha(s)yābhāvarūpatvān na va(s)tubhūtaḥ  
sambandhaḥ / **siddhe** pi sambandhini **kā paratantratā** / nevey a

2b6 sambandhaḥ / siddhasyāpi kiñcid asiddham astīti tatsiddho  
pāratantryam api na saṅgacchate / siddhāsīd(dhabhāvi)doṣavi-  
kalpānatikramāt\* / na caikasya niṣpannāniṣpanne rūpe staḥ /



## f.3a (062-60A)

3a1 yata evaṃ na niṣpannasyaitarasya vā pāratantryaṃ // **tasmāt\* sarvasya bhāvasya sambandho (nā)sti (bhā)** . . . . . (taḥ) vi-  
kalpani+mita(syā).r . . . . . dho '(va) . (tutvāt\*). [v.2] . . . . . i . .  
..

3a2 ndho n{ā}a pāratantryam iti cet\* / tan na / **dvitve** sampa-  
ndhinoḥ sva . . . . . (ye) . . . . . (sa sva)rūpaśleṣaḥ sva-  
bhāvaikātmyalakṣaṇaḥ **katha(m bha . . t\* / naiva) bhavet\* / (e)kya**  
(yi) (tayoh) (sa)

3a3 mbandhinor abhāvāt\* / kaḥ sambandho dviṣṭhatvād asya //  
syād etan nai ☼ kasvābhāvya+ śleṣaḥ kin tarhi / nairantaryam iti /  
bhavatu kaḥ pratiṣeddho / kevalaṃ nairaryam antarābhāva iti va

3a4 stubhūtaḥ sambandho na syāt\* / yadi ca nairantaryam sa-  
mbandhaḥ sānta ☼ ratā kin na sambandha iṣ(ya)te / ubhayatrāpi  
sambandhinoḥ svabhāvasthiter abhedāt\* // prāptyādayo pi nera !

3a5 ntaryārthasamāveśina ity anudghoṣyāḥ // yata evaṃ na rū-  
pa ! ☼ śleṣalakṣaṇo pi sambandhaḥ / **tasmāt prakṛtibhinnānām**  
sarvabhāvānām **sambandho nāsti bhāvato** 'nyatra kalpa !

3a6 nāsamāropitāt\* // [v.3] atha **parāpekṣā hi sambandho** na  
rūpakleṣa iti / atrāpi parasyāpekṣamāṇasyāpekṣayā sambandhitve  
'pekṣyamāṇaḥ san vā 'pekṣate 'san vā / yady asa

## f.3b (063: 60B)

3b1 n\* so san\* katham apekṣate sva(ya)m anabhinirvṛtta-  
svabhāvasya bhāvasyāpekṣā na dharmmaḥ syād iti kaḥ kasya  
sambandhaḥ / samś ca sarvanirāśa+saḥ sarvasvabhāvasvabhāvāna-  
pekṣo bhā |

3b2 vaḥ katham apekṣate yenāpekṣā sambandhaḥ syāt\* / śeṣaṃ  
pā ☀ ratantryavad vācyam / [v.4] mā prāpad ayaṃ doṣa iti / dvayoh  
sambambinor ekābhisambandhā #####

3b3 ndhād ekenārthāntareṇa guṇākhyena saṃyogena / ana-  
rthāntare ☀ na vā dharmenāvācyena vastubhūtena sambandhāt  
kāraṇāt\* sambandho yadīṣyate / tadā 'narthāntarapakṣe samba-  
ndha

3b4 ndhinau kevalau kalpito syātām iti / na kaścit samban-  
dhaḥ / ☀ tato pi vā sambandhāt sambandhinor avyatiरेकेनािका-  
tvāc ca / vastubhūtasyāvācyasyāpi nyāyato rthāntarā

3b5 narthāntaravikalpanatikramāt\* / anarthāntarap{e}akṣe na  
samba ☀ ndhaḥ sambandhī vā kaścit\* / bhavatu (vā sa)mbandho  
rthāntaram anyo vā tathā {dvai} tad(dva)yoḥ kaḥ sambandhaḥ /  
te(n)ai(k)e(na) dva

3b6 yoḥ sambandhinoḥ kaḥ sambandho naiva / yathā sambandhi-  
nor yathoktadoṣān na sambandhas tathā 'nenāpi sambandhinor  
asambandhaḥ / anyathā keva(la)yoḥ sambandhinoḥ (sambandhe  
kaḥ)



## f.4b (075: 84B)

4b1 nām **anurundhānaiḥ** puruṣaiḥ **kriyākāra**kavācīnaḥ kriyākāra kābhīdhā(yinaś cā)**bhīdhāyakaḥ** samyojyante (/ aya)ṃ kriyābhīdhāy aya(ṃ) kāra kābhīdhāyīti (n)i(veśya)nte **bhāvabhedapratī**

4b2 . . . .(m) bhāvānā(ṃ) bhedo 'nyāpohas tasya pratyāyanāya / na puna ḥ ☼ r (vastubhūta)ḥ kriyākāra kasambandho ~ ~ ~ / [v.7] kāryakāraṇabhāvaḥ sambandhas tarhi setsyatīti cet\* / tat na yasmā

4b3 . . . . . (ṇa)**bhāvo** pi sambandh{ā}aḥ ka(tham) nai-va **prasiḍhyati** / ki ☼ mbhūto dviṣṭhaḥ / kiṃ kāraṇam **tayoḥ** kāryakāraṇayor **asahabhāvataḥ** / tathā hi yadā kāraṇam tadā na kāryam ḥ

4b4 . . . . (kā)le vā na kāraṇam tulyakālam kāryakāraṇan+pa ḥ ☼ pat+eḥ / (akṣaṇikā+ām) apy abhāvadvān na kāryakāraṇ{ā}abhāvah / sahabhāvo vety akṣaṇikavādodāhara

4b5 /// .. (m apy a)trāyukta+ / (y)ato na vastubhūt(o) sahabhāv(i)-n(o) vidye ☼ te / yena dvayo(r varitta)mānaḥ sambandhaḥ syāt\* / **adviṣṭhe** ca bhāve **sambandhatā katham** / nai-va buddhyā vyākṛtya samba

4b6 /// . . . . . nirmītaḥ syāt / [v.8] kāraṇe kārye vā krameṇa sambandho varttata ity apy ayuktaṃ / tathā hi **kra(men)āpi bhāve ekatra** ekasminn api kāraṇe kārye vā **varttamānaḥ** sa

## f.5a (068: 70A)

5a1 mbandhākhyo 'nyanispr̥haḥ kārāṇe varttamānaḥ kāryāna-  
pekṣaḥ kārye varttamānaḥ kārāṇanirapekṣa iti dvayoḥ krameṇa  
varttamāno na tatsambandhaḥ / yo yasmin nispr̥ho na

5a2 tasyāsau sambandho bhavati / ekavṛttimān\* krameṇa kārya;  
☀ kārāṇabhāvī tadabhāve pi bhāvāt\* / kāryakārāṇabhūtayoh  
parasparābhāve pi sambandhākhyasyārthasya †

5a3 (satā)kārāṇāt\* // [v.9] mā bhūd eṣa doṣa iti ya(dy a)pekṣya  
tayo ☀ ḥ kāryakārāṇa . . . . . kāryaṃ kārāṇaṃ vānyatra kārya-  
kārāṇe vāsau sambandhaḥ krameṇa pravarttata iti sa

5a4 spr̥hatvena dviṣṭha evesyate / tadā tenāpekṣyamāṇeno ☀  
pakāriṇā bhavitavyaṃ / kiñ kārāṇaṃ / yata upakārī hy apekṣyaḥ  
syān nānyaḥ apekṣyamā(ṇam u)pakā(ry a) †

5a5 stv iti cet\* / kathañ copakaroty asa(n\* /) kārāṇakāle  
kā ☀ . . (khyo +san) kāryakāle kārāṇākhyo 'san\* naivopakaroty  
asāmarthyāt\* / [v.10] kiñ ca / yady ekārthābhi

5a6 sambandhāt\* kārāṇāt\* (kārya) . . . . . (ta)yoh kā+yakārāṇa-  
tvenābhi . . . . . yos tadā saṃkhyākhyena dvitvādinā sambandhāt  
prāptā kāryakārāṇatā / savyetaragoviṣāna †

## f.5b (069: 70B)

5b1 **yo(r a)pi** (na ceṣyate) (tad) anyatrāpi mā bhūt\* / **ādī**grahaṇena paratvāparatvaviṣānatvādinā sambandhāt\* / [v.11] na yena kenacid ekena sambandhāt sambandhaḥ kin tarhi sambandhalakṣaṇenai

5b2 keneti cet\* / tan na † **dviṣṭho hi kaścit** padārthaḥ **sambandho nā** ☀ (to . . . . . yābhi)sambandhino 'rthād **anyat tasya** sambandhasya **lakṣaṇam** upalabhyate / yena saṃkhyādes tasya viśe

5b3 ṣo vyavasthāpyeta / kasyacid bhāve bhāvo 'bhāve 'bhāvas ta ☀ yor bhavator abhavatoś ca yau bhāvau tāv upādhiviśeṣaṇam yasya yogasya sambandhasyāsau **bhāvābhāvopā** †

5b4 **dhir yogah** / **kā+yakāraṇatā yadī** na sarvaḥ sambandhaḥ / [v.12] yadā ☀ yau tau **yogopādhī** bhāvābhāvau **tāv eva kāryakāraṇatā** 'tra na **kim** / yenāsato 'phalasya sambandhasya kalpa

5b5 nā / **bhedāc cet** / syād etad bhāve bhāvo 'bhāve 'bhāva iti † ☀ bahavo bhidheyāḥ kāryakāraṇateti caikārthābhidhāyinā śabdena vācyāḥ / tadviśayā ayuktā iti / bhā †

5b6 vābhāvau na kāryakāraṇateṣyate / **nanv ayaṃ śabdo niyoktāram** pur+ṣaṃ **samāśrita** iti niyokṛṣamāśrayād yaṃ śabdam asau yathā prayu(ṃ)kte sa tathā prāhety anekatrāpy ekā śrutir ity a †

## f.6a (064: 63A)

6a1 parihāra eva / [v.13] tasmāt tāv eva bhāvābhāvau kāryakā-  
raṇatā yuktā / yasmāt **paśyann ekam** kāraṇābhimatam upalabdhi-  
lakṣaṇaprāptasyā**dr̥ṣṭasya** kāryākhyasya **darśane** sati yat pa(syan\*)  
dr̥ !

6a2 ṣṭavāṃs **tadaśarśane** saty **apaśyan** kāryābhimatam **kāryam**  
**anvetī**da ☀ m ato bhavatīti pratipadyate / **vināpy ākhyātṛbhir**  
**janaḥ** / ata idaṃ bhavatīty ākhyātāram antareṇa janaḥ

6a3 / saṅketād anvetīty api vārttaḥ // tathā hi na bhāvābhāvā-  
bhyā ! ☀ m anyat saṅkete pi pratipadyate / tasmād yatpratipattau  
yatpratipattiḥ sa tasyārthaḥ / tad yathā śuklapaṭapra

6a4 tipattau śuklapratipatteḥ śauklyam / bhāvābhāvau ca prati-  
pa ☀ dyamānaḥ kāryakāraṇatām pratipadyata iti bhāvābhāvau  
kāryakāraṇatāpratipatter artho nānyaḥ / syā

6a5 d etad bhāvābhāvau sādhanam anyā kāryakāraṇatā sādhyā //  
anyā ☀ cet kin na tasyā rūpaṃ nirdiśyate / utpādyotpādakabhāvas  
tarhi rūpaṃ / tat kin nāmāntarād arthabhedo yenai !

6a6 vam ucyate / tathā hy utpādyotpādakabhāvo janyajanaka-  
bhāvaḥ kāryakāraṇabhāva ity evamādayaḥ paryāyāḥ // [v.14] ta-  
smād **darśanādarśane** viṣayiṇā viṣayapradarśanād bhāvābhāvau

## f.6b (065: 63B)

6b1 **muktvā kāryabuddher asambhavāt** kāraṇāt **kāryādiśrutir apy atra** bhāvābhāvayor mā lokapratipadam iyatīm śabdamaḷām abhidhād iti vyavahāralāghavārthan nivesīteti / [v.15] nānyā 'nva-ya

6b2 vyatirekābhyām kāryakāraṇatā / nānyā cet\* / katham bhāvābhyām\* ☀ sā prasādhyate / **tadbhāve bhāvān** liṅgāt **tatkāryagatiḥ** / yasya bhāve bhāvas tasya kāryasya gatiḥ **yāpy anuvarṇṇya**

6b3 **te** / asyedaṃ kāryaṅ kāraṇaṅ ceti **saṅketaviṣayākhyā sā** / ta ☀ d etad anuvarṇṇanam tadbhāvabhāvitvena kāryakāraṇa-saṅketavi<ṣa>yākhyānam etan nārthabhedah / kim iva **sā** !

6b4 **snāder gogatir yathā** / yathā gaur ayaṃ sāsnaḍimattvād ity ane ☀ na govyavahārasya viṣayaḥ pradarśyate / [v.16] syād etad bhāvābhāvayoḥ kāryakāraṇatve kāraṇatvam kevalam\* !

6b5 kāryatvaṅ cobhayagatabhāvābhāvāpekṣam / anyathā katham bhāva ☀ mātram kāraṇam kāryam vā / na ca bhavator abh{ā}avatoś ca bhāvāv ubhayagatau kāryatvam kāraṇatvam vā / kāryakāra

6b6 ṇatā tu syād iti / tan na / ubhayagatatve py uttarabhāvābhāvaviśeṣaṇau pūrvasya bhāvābhāvau kāraṇatvam / pūrvasya bhāvābhāvaviśeṣaṇāv uttarasya bhā<vābhā>vau kāryatvam / tathā hi **bhā**



## f.7a (064: 64A)

7a1 <ve **bhā**>vini bhavanadharmmiṇi bhāve / **tadbhāvaḥ** kāraṇābhimatasya **bhāva eva** itihāpy avadhāraṇam / anena vyatireka ā(kṣ)iptaḥ / kāraṇābhimatasya **bhāva <eva> ca bhāvītā** kāryābhimatasya

7a2 kāryatvam iti / **prasiddhe pratyakṣānupalambhato hetu-phala** ☀ **te** / ya(ta) evaṃ bhāvābhāvāv eda kāryakāraṇatā nānyā / [v.17] **tenaitāvanmātratatvārthāḥ** / etāvatmātraṃ bhāvābhāvau |

7a3 tāv eva tatvaṃ bhūtaṃ yasyārthasyāsāv etāvanmātratatvaḥ / so | ☀ rtho yeṣāṃ vikalpānāṃ ta etāvanmātra<tatvā(rthāḥ kim) etāvanmātra>bījāḥ **kāryakāraṇagocarāḥ** / te **darśayanti ghaṭītān iva** sambaddhā

7a4 n ivāsambaddhān **arthān\*** / evaṃ ghaṭanāc ca **mithyārthāḥ** / [v.18] kim abhū | ☀ taḥ sambandhaḥ pradarśyate / tair yena mithyārthāḥ / evam etat\* / tathā hy atra dvayī kalpanā sambaddhyamānaḥ kārya

7a5 kāraṇabhūto rtho bhinno <'bhinno> vā syāt\* / yadi bhinnno **bhinne kā** | ☀ **ghaṭanā** naiva svasvabhāvavyavasthiteḥ / athābhinne **abhinne kāryakāraṇatāpi kā** naiva / anīṣpanna

7a6 sya karttavyasya kāraṇād vyatiriktasyābhāvāt\* / kutaḥ punar dvayor ghaṭanā / syād etat\* / na bhinnasyābhinnasya vā kevalasya sambandhaḥ / kin tarhi sambandhākhyenaikena sambandhād iti

## f.7b (065: 64B)

7b1 / atrāpi **bhāve** sattāyām **anyasya** sambandhākhyasya **viśliṣṭau** kāryakāraṇatābhimate **śliṣṭau syātām** / **katham** naiva sa eva sambandhākhyo 'paraḥ syāt\*' / na punas tadbhāve 'nyasya kasya

7b2 cit svabhāvasaṃsargga iti kuto bhāvataḥ sambandhaḥ / [v.19] **saṃyogi** ☀ **samavāyyādi** / **ādigrahaṇena** svasvāmyādi / **sarvam etenā**nantaroktena sāmānyena sambandhapraṭiṣedha

7b3 kena granthena **cintitam** / na saṃyogādilaḥṣaṇo vastutaḥ ☀ sambandho stīti / samavāyinas tāva<n na sa>mbandhitā / yathā śauk<l>yam guṇaḥ ghaṭe samavetaṃ\* / anayor **anyonyam** pa

7b4 rasparam **anupakārād** ajanyajanakabhāvāt\* kāraṇāt samavā ☀ yilaḥṣaṇo **na sambandhī ca tādrśo** 'nupakāryānupakāra-kabhūtaḥ / tathā hi yo yena kāryaḥ sa tam apekṣa

7b5 te / yañ cāpekṣate tena tasya sambandhaḥ / na caivam śuklapaṭa ☀ yoḥ svarūpasiddheḥ / ādhārādheyabhāvo pi nākāryakāraṇabhūtaḥ yoh kāryakāraṇabhāve ca tadbhāvī

7b6 doṣaḥ / kāryakāraṇabhāve saty ādhārādheyabhāvāt\* śuklapaṭayoh sambandhakalpanāpy asādhvī / tathā hi na tayor laukika ādhārādheyabhāvo sti / janyajanakalaḥṣaṇe cādihā

## f.8a (066: 65A)

8a1 rādheyabhāve sāmānyatadvatoḥ parasparam anupakāryo-  
pakārakayoḥ samavāyalakṣaṇas sambandho na syāt\* / [v.20] syād  
etad asti kaścit samavāyī yo 'vayav{ī}irūpaṃ kāryākhyam janaya

8a2 ti tena nānupakārād asambandhiteti / evañ **janane pi hi** ☀  
**kāryasya kenacit samavāyinābhyupagamyaṃ nās(o) sama-**  
**vāyī / tadā** jananakāle janyasyāniṣpa !

8a3 tter dvayor asamavāyāt\* / niṣpanne pi kārye kāraṇasya  
ti ! ☀ (r)odhānāt\* / atirobhāve ca samavahitayor upakāryopa-  
karakabhāvābhāvāt\* / bhavatu vā kaścit sama !

8a4 vāyī (**na tu tat**)o (jananāt k)ā(ra)ṇāt\* / (kiṃ kāraṇam) /  
(**atiprasa**) ☀ ṅgataḥ kumbhakārāder api ghaṭasya jananāt\* / sa-  
mbandhitāpatteḥ / [v.21] a(tha mā) . . . . . doṣa iti **tayoḥ** sama

8a5 vāyinoḥ parasparam **anupakā(r)e pi** tābhyāṃ sambandhi-  
bhyā ☀ m anupakāre ca **samavāye** nityatvāt tasya tābhyāṃ /  
sa<ma>vāye {na} ca **paratra vā** kvacid **anu(pakār)e (pi samba-**  
**ndho) . . (ya)**

8a6 dīṣyate / tadā **viśvam** sarvaṃ jagat parasparāsamba-  
ddham **sam{ā}avāyi parasparam syāt\*** na caivaṃ / tasmād evam  
upakārānupakārapakṣe na samavāyo sti / na cānyaḥ prakāraḥ  
sa(mbhavat)i /

## f.8b (067: 65B)

8b1 anena saṃyogināv api pratyuktau / [v.22] api ca saṃyogasya kāryatvāt tābhyāṃ tajjananāt saṃyogitā yadi tayos tadaivaṃ **saṃyogajana{ye}ne 'pīṣṭau / tataḥ** saṃyogajananakāraṇā(n na)

8b2 **tau saṃyogināu / kiṃ kāraṇaṃ / karmmādiyogitāpatteḥ /** ya ☀ di saṃyogajananāt saṃyogī karmaṇo pi saṃyogitā syāt\* / tathā hy anyatarakarmaja ubhayakarmajaḥ saṃyoga

8b3 iṣyate / ādigrahaṇena saṃyogasyāpi saṃyogitā syāt\* ☀ / yataḥ saṃyogajo pīṣyate 'śāv iti / na saṃyogajananāt\* saṃyogitā / kin tarhi sthāpanād iti cet\* / ta

8b4 n na / **sthitīś ca prativarṇitā** sthāpyasthāpakayor janyajanakabhā ☀ vāt\* nānyā sthitir iti pramāṇavārttike pratikṣiptā / [v.23] yadi saṃyogādīm antareṇa saṃyogādibuddhir vi

8b5 bhaktayor yad rūpaṃ tat saṃyuktayor api / evaṃ saṃpratyuktayoḥ sthi ☀ tāsthitayoś ceti kin na saṃyogādibuddhiḥ / na caivaṃ tasmāt saṃyogavibhāgakarmmāṇi saṃyogādibuddhe

8b6 r nimittam iti cet\* / na / tulyaparyanuyogataḥ / tavāpi tulyarūpasya vibhaktādeḥ kin na saṃyogādisamavāyaḥ / tarjjanana-karmābhāvāt\* / na saṃyogavibhāgāv iti cet\* / ta

## SPV\_dipl. ed., f.9a (103: 138B&gt;A)

9a1 d evaṃ sati kiṃ na karmāpi tatkāraṇāni ceti duruttaram  
etat\* / tasmāt tvayaitad eva vaktavyaṃ / **tad** vibhaktādirūpam **ayo-**  
**gyaṃ** prāk paścāt **saṃyogyāśraye yogañ jāyate** / ki(m) kāraṇa+  
yato †

9a2 **nityaṃ** saṃyogādiyogayogyasvabhāvasya **tadvaikalya-**  
**viro** ☀ **dhataḥ** saṃyogādiyogavaikalyaṃ virudhyate / mayāpi  
caitad eva vaktavyaṃ saṃyogādivarjitaṃ / [v.24] tasmāt\* **yo**

9a3 **gyatā(śa){bde . .}(bda)vācyah** (sva)bhāvo (śyā)rthasya **niru-**  
**cyatā(m)** // **vi** ☀ **(bhāga)yogagatibhiḥ** saṃyogavibhāgakarmma-  
śabdais tadā **kim** apha(l)er **anyer gamanādibhiḥ** kalpitaiḥ nai

9a4 va kiñcit\* **ādigraha** . . . . . gavibhāga(paratvāpara-  
tvā ☀ di)bhiḥ / [v.25] **kutaḥ** / yatas **teṣu** gamanādiṣu **satsv api**  
**kalpiteṣ(u)** / **(tasy)aiti (sambandha)syāpra(ṣ)iddhitah pāra**tantrya

9a5 **m ityādinā** sarvathā sambandhasya niṣiddhatvāt\* / asya  
karma † ☀ saṃyogo vibhāgo veti sambandhāsi(ddh)eḥ / kutas  
tannimi(tto vyapa)deśaḥ / yathānyagataiḥ karmādibhi †

9a6 r anyasambandhī na bhavaty asambandhāt\* / tadvad  
abhimatair api yata eva(m) na (karmādisambandhāt) gamanāda-  
yaḥ / tasmāt **pratikṣaṇajam{ā}anā(m)** bhāvānām nira(nt)arotpa-  
{. .}<ttyā>dyāśrayai{{rapa}}r aparā

## SPV\_dipl. ed., f.9b (102: 138A&gt;B)

9b1 paraiḥ pratyayaiḥ **svabhāvabhedo yaṃ** saṃyukto viyukto  
 ga(cchatīty) . . . . . (ād)i(r yu)kto sasthiraika(svabhā)vānām yogā-  
 disambandhāsiddher iti na kaścid bhāvataḥ sambandhaḥ sa(m)yo-  
 gādi(la)

9b2 kṣaṇaḥ / ity asambandhāḥ sa(r)va . . . . . ti . . . .  
 . . . // . . . . . // // (kṛtir ācā)-  
 ryadevendrabuddheḥ // // krodha . . (anvita)sya pustakaṃ //



**Tibetan Translations**  
critically edited





**// 'Brel pa brtag pa'i rab tu byed pa bźugs so //**

N 375b6  
P 357a3  
D 255a2

rgya gar skad du / saṃ baṃ dha<sup>1</sup> pa řī kṣa pra ka ra ṇa<sup>2</sup> / bod skad  
du / 'brel pa brtag pa'i rab tu byed pa //

'phags pa<sup>3</sup> 'jam dpal gźon nur gyur pa la phyag 'tshal lo //

gźan dbaṅ kho nar<sup>4</sup> 'brel pa<sup>5</sup> ni / grub na gźan dbaṅ ci źig yod<sup>6</sup> /  
de phyir dños po thams cad kyi / 'brel pa yaṅ (N 376a) dag ñid du med //  
[v.1]

ño bo 'dres pa 'brel yin du / gñis ñid la de'aṅ<sup>7</sup> ji ltar 'gyur /  
de bas<sup>8</sup> raṅ bźin tha dad pa / 'brel pa yaṅ dag ñid du med // [v.2]

gźan bltos<sup>9</sup> pa ni 'brel par yaṅ / med na de ni<sup>10</sup> ji ltar bltos<sup>11</sup> /  
yod na'aṅ kun la rag ma las / dños po ji ltar bltos<sup>12</sup> pa yin // [v.3]

gñis ni 'brel pa gcig pu<sup>13</sup> yis / ci ste 'brel na de daṅ gñis /  
'brel pa gaṅ yin thug pa'aṅ<sup>14</sup> med / de bźin 'brel med śes par bya // [v.4]

- 
- <sup>1</sup> baṃ dha NP : bandha D  
<sup>2</sup> pra ka ra ṇa NPD : kā ri kā Ta  
<sup>3</sup> 'phags pa Ta : om. NPD  
<sup>4</sup> kho nar NPD (V) : kho na Ta  
<sup>5</sup> pa NPD : par Ta  
<sup>6</sup> yod NPD (V) : yin Ta  
<sup>7</sup> la de'aṅ NP : yin na DTa  
<sup>8</sup> bas Ta (V) : phyir NPD  
<sup>9</sup> bltos NP : ltos DTa  
<sup>10</sup> ni Ta (V) : ñid NPD  
<sup>11</sup> bltos N : ltos DTa : blta'o P  
<sup>12</sup> bltos NP : ltos DTa  
<sup>13</sup> pu D : du NP  
<sup>14</sup> pa'aṅ Ta (V) : pa NPD

dños po de gñis de las gźan / de dag thams cad bdag ñid gnas /  
de bas<sup>15</sup> rañ dños ma 'dres la / de dag rtog<sup>16</sup> pas 'dres<sup>17</sup> par byed // [v.5]

dños po tha dad rtogs pa'i<sup>18</sup> phyir / de yi rjes su 'brañ ba yis /  
bya dañ byed pa po yi tshig / smra ba po dag 'god<sup>19</sup> par byed // [v.6]

rgyu dañ 'bras bu'i dños po<sup>20</sup> yañ / de gñis lhan cig mi gnas pas /  
gñis <sub>(P 357b)</sub> la gnas pa ji ltar grub<sup>21</sup> / gñis la mi gnas ji ltar 'brel // [v.7]

rim las dños po gcig la gnas / gźan la re ba med pa yin /  
de med par yañ yod pa'i phyir / gcig la gnas<sup>22</sup> pa 'brel pa med // [v.8]

gźan du 'di ni<sup>23</sup> 'dug pa na<sup>24</sup> / ci ste de gñis gcig la ltos /  
ltos pa phan pa byed par 'gyur / med na ji ltar phan par byed // [v.9]

ci ste don gcig 'brel pa'i phyir / de gñis rgyu 'bras ñid yin na /  
gñis ñid la sogs 'brel pa'i phyir / gyas gyon rwa yañ de gñis<sup>25</sup> thob<sup>26</sup> //  
[v.10]

'ga' źig gñis gnas 'brel pa yin / de mtshan de <sub>(N 376b)</sub> las gźan du min /  
yod dañ med pa'i bye brag can / sbyor ba ci ste rgyu 'bras <sub>(D 255b)</sub> na //  
[v.11]

---

<sup>15</sup> bas NDTa (V) : las P

<sup>16</sup> rtog F (Ta V) : rtogs NPD

<sup>17</sup> 'dres DTa (V) : 'brel NP

<sup>18</sup> pa'i N (V) : bya'i PD : bya Ta

<sup>19</sup> 'god ND : 'gog P

<sup>20</sup> dños po Ta (V) : 'brel pa NPD

<sup>21</sup> 'grub Ta (V) : grub NPD

<sup>22</sup> gnas NPD : 'dug Ta

<sup>23</sup> gźan du 'di ni NPD : 'di ni gźan du Ta

<sup>24</sup> na DTa (V) : dañ NP

<sup>25</sup> gñis NPTa : ñid D

<sup>26</sup> thob F (V) : 'thob NPDTa

sbyor ba'i bye brag can de ñid / 'dir ni rgyu 'bras ci phyir min /  
tha dad ces byar<sup>27</sup> sgra 'di ni / smra byed la brten<sup>28</sup> ma yin nam // [v.12]

'ga'<sup>29</sup> žig mthoñ na ma mthoñ mthoñ / de ma mthoñ na ma mthoñ ba /  
'bras bu yin pa ñid du ni / ston pa'i skye bo med par šes // [v.13]

mthoñ dañ ma mthoñ ma gtogs par / 'bras bu'i blo ni mi srid phyir /  
'di la 'bras bu la sogs sgra<sup>30</sup> / tha sñad sla ba'i phyir bkod do<sup>31</sup> // [v.14]

de yod yod phyir de 'bras rtogs / gañ yañ rjes su smra ba yi /  
brda yi yul du de brjod de / lkog<sup>32</sup> šal la sogs glañ rtogs bžin // [v.15]

yod 'gyur yod na de yod ciñ / yod pa ñid na'añ yod 'gyur ba /  
mñon sum mi dmigs pa dag las / rgyu 'bras kho nar<sup>33</sup> rab tu grub //  
[v.16]

re žig de tsam yañ dag don / rgyu dañ 'bras bu'i spyod yul rnam /  
rnam par rtog pas ston pa ni / don log<sup>34</sup> pa yi don bžin ston // [v.17]

tha dad yin na ci žig 'brel / tha dad min na rgyu 'bras gañ /  
gžan<sup>35</sup> žig yod na ma 'brel gñis / (P 358a) de gñis 'brel par<sup>36</sup> ji ltar byed //  
[v.18]

sbyor dañ 'du ba la sogs pa / thams cad des kyañ spyad pa yin /  
phan tshun phan pa mi byed phyir / de 'dra ba la 'brel pa med // [v.19]

---

<sup>27</sup> byar Ta : bya'i NPD

<sup>28</sup> byed la brten NPD : byed rten pa Ta

<sup>29</sup> 'ga' F (Ta) : gañ NPD

<sup>30</sup> la sogs sgra NPD : sgra las stsogs sgra 'añ Ta

<sup>31</sup> tha sñad sla ba'i phyir bkod do NPD : sla bar bya phyir rnam par bkod Ta

<sup>32</sup> lkog NPD : kog Ta

<sup>33</sup> rgyu 'bras kho nar NPD : rgyu dañ 'bras bur Ta

<sup>34</sup> log NPDTa (V) : 'brel F (cf. Tauscher 1994:179f)

<sup>35</sup> gžan NPDTa (V) : gañ F

<sup>36</sup> par NPTa : pa D

'du ba can ni 'ga' žig gis / 'bras bu skyed par byed pa na<sup>37</sup> /  
de'i<sup>38</sup> tshe 'du ba can 'di med / śin tu thal phyir de las<sup>39</sup> min // [v.20]

de gñis dañ ni 'du ba 'am<sup>40</sup> / gžan yañ phan pa mi byed par /  
ci ste 'brel na mtha' dag kyañ / phan<sub>(N 386b)</sub> tshun 'brel pa can du 'gyur //  
[v.21]

las<sup>41</sup> sogs sbyor ba can grub phyir / sbyor ba bskyed kyañ des de gñis<sup>42</sup> /  
sbyor ba can du mi 'dod de / gnas par byed pa'añ<sup>43</sup> rab tu brjod //  
[v.22]

sbyor ba la sogs pa yi gnas / ruñ ba'i dños po de 'gyur na /  
ruñ ba'i dños po rtag na ni / de dañ bral ba<sup>44</sup> 'gal phyir ro // [v.23]

de bas bral dañ ldan pa dañ / 'gro sogs ruñ ba brjod pa na /  
ño bo 'di la ñes par brjod / 'gro sogs gzan brtags<sup>45</sup> ci žig bya // [v.24]

de dag rnam la yod na yañ / 'di'i žes 'brel pa mi 'grub phyir /  
skad cig so sor<sup>46</sup> skye ba yi / dños po tha dad 'di yin rigs // [v.25]

<sub>(D 256a)</sub> 'brel pa brtag pa'i rab tu byed pa slob dpon mkhas pa chen po  
chos kyi grags pas mdzad pa rdzogs so // rgya gar gyi mkhan po dznā  
na gar bha<sup>47</sup> dañ / lo tsa ba ban de<sup>48</sup> nam mkhas bsgyur ba'o<sup>49</sup> //

<sup>37</sup> pa na NP : na yañ DTa

<sup>38</sup> de'i Ta (V) : de NPD

<sup>39</sup> gñis NPD : las F (Ta'V)

<sup>40</sup> 'am Ta : dañ NPD (V)

<sup>41</sup> las F (TaV) : la NPD

<sup>42</sup> sbyor ba bskyed kyañ des de gñis NPD : sbyor (s)kye(d) kyañ de gñis des Ta

<sup>43</sup> pa'añ NPD : pa Ta

<sup>44</sup> ba N : bar PD

<sup>45</sup> brtags V : rtags NPD : rtog F

<sup>46</sup> so sor D (V) : so so NP

<sup>47</sup> gar bha NP : garbha D

<sup>48</sup> ban de NP : bande D

<sup>49</sup> ba'o om. D

// 'Brel pa brtag pa'i 'grel pa bźugs so //

N 377a4

P 358a7

D 256a2

// rgya gar skad du / saṃ baṃ dha pa rī kṣā bri tti / bod skad du / 'brel  
pa brtag pa'i 'grel pa /

'jam pa'i dbyaṅs la phyag 'tshal lo //

'brel pa dños por gyur pa bsal bar 'dod nas / **gźan dbaṅ kho nar** źes  
bya ba la sogs pa smras<sup>1</sup> so //

[v.1] **gźan dbaṅ** ni gźan la rag las pa ste / de '**brel pa** (P 358b) yin na /  
'brel pa can grub pa 'am ma grub pa źig<sup>2</sup> gi yin / ma grub pa ni med  
pa'i no bo yin pa'i phyir 'brel pa dños por yod pa ma yin no // 'brel pa  
can **grub na gźan dbaṅ ci źig yod** / med pa ñid de<sup>3</sup> / de bas na 'brel  
pa med pa ñid do //

grub tu<sup>4</sup> zin kyaṅ cuṅ zad ma grub pa ñid do źe na / de grub par bya  
ba'i ched du gźan gyi dbaṅ kho nar yaṅ mi 'gyur te / grub pa daṅ ma  
grub pa (N 277b) las gyur pa'i ñes pa'i rnam par rtog pa las mi 'da' ba'i  
phyir ro // dños po gcig la grub pa daṅ ma grub pa'i no bo gñi ga med  
do // gaṅ gi phyir de ltar grub pa 'am cig śos kyi gźan gyi dbaṅ kho na  
med pa **de bas na**<sup>5</sup> **dños po thams cad kyi** / '**brel pa yaṅ dag**<sup>6</sup> **ñid du**  
dños por<sup>7</sup> **med** / dños po med pa'i phyir rnam par rtog pas<sup>8</sup> bkod pa ni  
mi dgag go //

<sup>1</sup> smras D (Ṭ 2b4) : smos NP

<sup>2</sup> źig em. (Ṭ 2b6) : gcig NPD

<sup>3</sup> yod / med pa ñid de / em. (Ṭ 3a1+3a2) : yod pa ñid de / N : yod med pa ñid de / PD

<sup>4</sup> grub tu D (Ṭ 3a3) : grub na NP

<sup>5</sup> de bas na em. (Ṭ 3b4) : de bas D : de las NP

<sup>6</sup> dag N : dag pa PD

<sup>7</sup> por NP : po D

<sup>8</sup> rtog pas em. F (Ṭ 3b5) : rtog pa ND : rtogs pa P

[v.2] **ño bo**<sup>9</sup> **'dres**<sup>10</sup> **pa 'brel**<sup>11</sup> **yin** gyi g'zan dbaň kho na ma yin no že na / de ni mi ruň ste / **gñis ñid** yin te / 'brel pa can gñis kyi ño bo yin na / ño bo 'dres pa raň gi ño bo gcig pa'i mtshan ñid **der yaň ji ltar 'gyur** te mi 'gyur ba ñid do // gcig tu<sup>12</sup> gyur na yaň 'brel pa can<sup>13</sup> gñis med pa'i phyir 'brel pa gaň žig yin te / 'di ni gñis la<sup>14</sup> gnas pa'i phyir ro // 'on te 'di sñam du 'dres pa ni ño bo ñid<sup>15</sup> gcig tu 'gyur ba ma yin te / 'o na ci že na bar chad med pa yin no že na / yin du zad mod ci žig dgag ste / bar chad med pa<sup>16</sup> ni bar<sup>17</sup> med pa tsam<sup>18</sup> du zad pas 'brel pa dños por gyur pa <sub>(D 256b)</sub> yod par mi 'gyur ro // ci ste bar chad med pa<sup>19</sup> 'brel pa yin na / bar daň bcas pa<sup>20</sup> yaň 'brel pa<sup>21</sup> ci ste mi 'dod de / gñis kar yaň 'brel pa can<sup>22</sup> gñis raň gi ño bo la gnas par bye brag med pa'i phyir ro //

phrad pa la sogs pa yaň bar <sub>(P 359a)</sub> chad med pa'i don du 'dus pa kho na yin pas<sup>23</sup> brjod par ma byed cig / gaň gi phyir de ltar ño bo 'dres pa'i mtshan ñid kyaň 'brel pa ma yin pa **de'i phyir** yaň<sup>24</sup> **raň b'zin tha dad** de / dños po thams cad kyi raň gi ño bo tha dad pa la<sup>25</sup> rtog pas sgro btags pa las<sup>26</sup> ma gtogs par / **'brel pa yaň** <sub>(N 378a)</sub> **dag**<sup>27</sup> **ñid du med pa'o** //

<sup>9</sup> ño bo ND : ño bos P

<sup>10</sup> 'dres PD : 'drel N

<sup>11</sup> 'brel PD : 'brel pa N

<sup>12</sup> gcig tu NP : gcig pu D

<sup>13</sup> 'brel pa can D : 'brel can NP

<sup>14</sup> la em. F (T 4a5) : las NPD

<sup>15</sup> ño bo ñid em. (T 4a6) : ño bo NPD

<sup>16</sup> med pa em. (F) : med pa pa NPD

<sup>17</sup> bar NP : bar chad D

<sup>18</sup> tsam ND : can P

<sup>19</sup> med pa em. (T 4b2) : med par NPD

<sup>20</sup> bcas pa N : bcas pa na PD

<sup>21</sup> pa N : par PD

<sup>22</sup> can ND : cam P

<sup>23</sup> pas N : par PD

<sup>24</sup> phyir F (T 5a1) : phyir yaň NPD

<sup>25</sup> pa la D : pa NP

<sup>26</sup> pa las NP : pa D

<sup>27</sup> dag ñid em. (F) : dag pa ñid NPD

[v.3] 'on te gžan la bltos pa 'brel pa yin gyi ño bo 'dres pa ma yin no  
že na / 'dir yañ gžan la bltos pa na bltos pas 'brel pa can du 'gyur te /  
bltos na<sup>28</sup> yod pa žig bltos sam / med pa žig bltos / ji ste **med na de ni**  
**ji ltar bltos** / rañ gi ño bor ma grub pa'i dños po la bltos pa'i chos med  
pas gañ žig gañ gi 'brel pa yin / **yod na yañ kun la rag ma las** te / rañ  
gi ño bo thams cad skyes pa bltos pa med pa'i **dños po** bltos pa gañ gis  
na 'brel par 'gyur ba<sup>29</sup> **ji ltar bltos pa yin** / lhag ma<sup>30</sup> ni gžan gyi dbañ  
bžin du brjod par bya'o //

<sup>28</sup> bltos na em. F (Ṭ 5a5) : bltos nas NPD

<sup>29</sup> ba F (Ṭ 5b3) : bar NPD

<sup>30</sup> lhag ma em. (Ṭ 5b3) : lhag ma rnams NPD



[v.4] ñes pa 'dir mi 'gyur bar bya ba'i phyir / **gñis** te 'brel pa can gñis ni **'brel pa gcig pu yis**<sup>31</sup> yon tan du brjod pa'i sbyor ba don tha dad pa gcig pu 'am / tha dad pa med pa'i chos sam / brjod du med pa'i dños por gyur pa dañ mñon par 'brel pa'i<sup>32</sup> rgyus ci **ste 'brel par** 'dod na de'i tshe 'brel pa don<sup>33</sup> tha dad pa ma yin pa'i phyogs la ni 'brel pa can gñis brtags pa kho nar 'gyur bas 'brel pa gañ yañ med do // de lta na yañ<sup>34</sup> 'brel pa can gžan ma yin pas gcig tu gyur pa'i yañ phyir ro // brjod du med pa'i dños por gyur pa yañ rigs pa'i tshul gyis na don tha dad pa dañ don tha dad pa ma<sup>35</sup> yin pa'i rnam par rtog pa las mi 'da' ba'i phyir ro // don tha dad pa ma yin pa'i phyogs la ni <sup>(P 359b)</sup> 'brel pa dañ 'brel pa <sup>(N 378b)</sup> can<sup>36</sup> gañ yañ med do // tha dad pa 'am cig śos kyi 'brel pa yod du chug kyañ / <sup>(D 257a)</sup> 'on kyañ **de dañ gñis 'brel pa gañ yin** / gcig pa de dañ 'brel pa can gñis su 'brel pa gañ yin te / med pa ñid do // ji skad du smos pa'i skyon yod pa'i phyir ji ltar 'brel pa can gñis 'brel pa med pa de bžin du / de dañ yañ<sup>37</sup> 'brel pa can gñis 'brel pa med do // gžan du na 'brel pa can gñis ñi tshe 'brel pa yañ ci žig že sdañ<sup>38</sup> du yod /

gžan yañ ci ste 'brel pa'i don gcig dañ 'brel pa'i phyir 'brel par 'dod na / de'i tshe 'brel pa dañ 'brel pa can gñis la yañ 'brel pa žig 'dod<sup>39</sup> par bya dgos te / de lta bur 'brel pa khas len pa'i phyir ro // de la yañ 'brel pa'i don gcig pu žig yod pas **thug pa'añ med** par 'gyur ro // de ste 'ga' žig tu 'brel pa gcig pu'i don ma grub ste / 'brel pa med na ni thams cad du **de bžin 'brel med śes par bya** / thug pa med par 'gyur bas na 'brel pa'i blo ni dños po'i rjes su žugs pa ma yin no // kha cig

<sup>31</sup> pu yis NP : pus D

<sup>32</sup> mñon par 'brel pa'i em. F (Ṭ 6a4) : 'brel pa NPD (only sambandhāt in Ms)

<sup>33</sup> don D : om. NP

<sup>34</sup> yañ 'brel pa can NP : yañ 'brel pa las 'brel pa can D

<sup>35</sup> don tha dad pa dañ tha dad pa ma F (Ṭ 6b2) : don dañ tha dad pa tha dad ma NP : don tha dad pa tha dad ma D

<sup>36</sup> can em. F (Ṭ 6b4) : can gyi NPD

<sup>37</sup> dañ yañ D : dañ NP

<sup>38</sup> že sdañ PD (Ṭ 7a6) : žes sdañ N : žes skad (?) F

<sup>39</sup> 'dod NPD : yod Ṭ 7a8

tu 'brel pa gcig pu'i don med par yañ 'brel pa rtog<sup>40</sup> na ni 'brel pa can  
dañ po gñis la yañ don gcig pu dañ 'brel pa'i phyir 'brel par mi 'gyur  
ro // ñi tshé žig 'brel pa yin na<sup>41</sup> yañ ñes pa smras zin to // des ni bar  
chad med pa la sogs pa'i chos tha dad par rtog<sup>42</sup> pa'i lan kyañ btab zin  
to //

---

<sup>40</sup> rtog em. F (Ṭ 8a2) : rtogs NPD

<sup>41</sup> yin na em. F (Ṭ 8a4) : yin NPD

<sup>42</sup> rtog em. F (Ṭ 8a5) : rtogs NPD

[v.5] gañ gi phyir de ltar 'brel par rnam par rtog pa ruñ<sup>(N 379a)</sup> ba ma yin pa de bas na 'brel pa can du mñon par 'dod pa'i **dños po de gñis** dañ / **de las gžan pa** 'brel pa žes bya ba ji skad du smos pa **de dag thams cad bdag ñid gnas** rañ gi ño bo la gnas pa yin no // **de bas na** de'i phyir bdag ñid kyis<sup>43</sup> **rañ dnös ma 'dres pa ste**<sup>44</sup> 'brel pa med pa'o // <sup>(P360a)</sup> 'o na ji ltar rag las pa'i ño bo de dañ des 'brel pa yin par brjod ce na / 'brel pa yañ dag pa ni 'ga' yañ med kyi / dnös po **de dag** 'dres pa med kyañ **rtog**<sup>45</sup> **pas 'dres par byed** / gžan la rag las pa'i ño bo lta bur mtshan ma 'ga' žig ston pa skye'o //

<sup>43</sup> kyis em. F : kyi NPD

<sup>44</sup> 'dres pa ste em. F : 'brel pas te NPD

<sup>45</sup> rtog NP : rtogs D

[v.6] **dños po tha dad rtogs pa'i phyir** / dños po tha dad pa ni gžan  
 bsal ba'o // de khoñ du chud par bya ba'i phyir / rtog pa **de'i rjes su**  
**'brañ ba'i** <sub>(D 257b)</sub> skyes bu **yis**<sup>46</sup> // **bya ba byed pa po yi tshig** / bya ba'i  
 tshig dañ byed pa po'i tshig<sup>47</sup> / **smra ba po dag 'god par byed** / 'di ni  
 bya ba'i brjod pa'o<sup>48</sup> // 'di ni byed pa po'i brjod pa'o // žes tshig 'god  
 par byed kyi / bya ba dañ byed pa po'i<sup>49</sup> 'brel pa dños su ni yod pa ma  
 yin no //

<sup>46</sup> skyes bu yis NP : skyes bus D

<sup>47</sup> bya ba'i tshig dañ byed pa po'i tshig om. NDP, but included by F from T 8a7 (with byed pa po'i for byed pa'i) and corresponding to Ms

<sup>48</sup> 'di ni bya ba'i brjod pa'o om. NPD, but included by F from T 8a8 and corresponding to Ms

<sup>49</sup> byed pa po'i em. F (T 9b6) : byed pa'i NPD

[v.7] 'o na rgyu dañ 'bras bu'i dños po 'brel pa<sup>50</sup> 'grub mod<sup>51</sup> že na / de<sup>52</sup> mi ruñ ste / 'di ltar **rgyu dañ 'bras bu'i dños po'i** 'brel pa **yañ ji** lta bu žig ce na / **gñis la gnas pa<sup>53</sup> ji ltar 'grub<sup>54</sup>** / mi 'grub pa ñid do // ci'i phyir že na /<sup>55</sup> rgyu dañ 'bras bu **de gñis lhan cig mi gnas pa'i phyir te** / 'di lta ste / gañ gi tshe rgyu yod pa de'i tshe 'bras bu med do // <sub>(N 379b)</sub> 'bras bu yod pa'i tshe yañ<sup>56</sup> rgyu med de / rgyu dañ 'bras bu gñis dus gcig tu mi 'thad pa'i phyir ro // skad cig ma ma yin pa'an dños po med pa'i phyir rgyu dañ 'bras bu'i dños po lhan cig tu gnas pa ma yin pas<sup>57</sup> / skad cig ma ma yin par smra bas brjod pa yañ rigs pa ma yin pa'i phyir gañ gis na gñis la 'brel pa gnas par 'grub par 'gyur ba'i 'brel pa can gñis dños su lhan cig tu<sup>58</sup> gnas pa med do // dños po **gñis la mi gnas na yañ ji ltar 'brel pa** / ma yin pa ñid do // blos sbrel te 'brel na ni / rnam par rtog<sup>59</sup> pas bskyed par 'gyur ro //

<sup>50</sup> pa ND : par P

<sup>51</sup> 'grub mod em. (Ṭ 10a1) : 'grub po NPD

<sup>52</sup> de em. F (Ṭ 10a2) : om. NPD

<sup>53</sup> pa M : par NPD

<sup>54</sup> 'grub D : om. NP

<sup>55</sup> The beginning of the response is seemingly corrupted. But cf. T 10a2-4: **'di ltar rgyu dañ 'bras bu'i dños po yañ** zes bya ba 'di'i bśad pa ni **'brel pa ji ltar grub** ces bya ba'o // 'di'i bśad pa ni **mi 'grub pa ñid do** zes bya ba de yin no // **ji lta bu žig ce na** zes bya ba ..... **gñis la gnas par** zes bya ba smras te / ..... // **ci'i phyir že na** zes bya ba ni .....

<sup>56</sup> yod pa'i tshe yañ em. F (Ṭ 10a5) : yod pa de'i tshe NPD

<sup>57</sup> ma yin pas em. (Ṭ 10a8) : ma yin pa ñid pas D : ma yin pa ñid yin pas NP(F)

<sup>58</sup> tu D : om. NP

<sup>59</sup> rtog PD : rtogs N

[v.8] rgyu 'am 'bras bu la rim gyis 'brel pa gnas so že na / de yañ<sup>(P 360b)</sup>  
mi rigs te / 'di ltar **rim las kyañ dños po gcig la**<sup>60</sup> rgyu 'am 'bras bu  
gcig la 'brel pa zes bya ba **gnas na / gžan la re ba med de** / rgyu la<sup>61</sup>  
gnas pa na 'bras bu la bltos pa med do // 'bras bu la<sup>62</sup> gnas pa na rgyu  
la bltos pa med pas gñis la rim gyis 'dug<sup>63</sup> na ni 'brel par mi ruñ ste /  
**de med par yañ yod pa'i phyir** / rgyu dañ 'bras bu gñis phan tshun  
med par yañ<sup>64</sup> 'brel pa zes bya ba'i don yod pa'i gtan tshigs kyis na /  
**gcig la gnas pa can** / rgyu dañ 'bras bu la rim gyis gnas pa 'di dañ gañ  
la re ba med pa de dañ **'brel pa med do** //<sup>65</sup>

<sup>60</sup> la F (Ṭ 11a1) : las NPD

<sup>61</sup> rgyu la F (Ṭ 11a2) : rgyu NPD

<sup>62</sup> la F (Ṭ 11a3) : om. NPD

<sup>63</sup> 'dug NPD : gnas Ṭ 11a3

<sup>64</sup> yañ F (Ṭ 11a8) : om. NPD

<sup>65</sup> After de med par yañ yod pa'i phyir the sequence of sentences differs in Ṭ 11a5-11b2.

[v.9] ñes pa 'dir mi 'gyur bar <sub>(N 380a)</sub> bya ba'i phyir **gžan du** rgyu 'am 'bras bu la rim gyis 'brel pa '**di 'dug pa na ji ste** rgyu dañ 'bras bu **de gñis** las rgyu 'am 'bras bu **gcig la bltos** pas re ba dañ bcas pa ñid kyis gñis la gnas pa kho nar 'dod do že na / de lta na<sup>66</sup> yañ **bltos**<sup>67</sup> **pa** <sub>(D 258a)</sub> des **phan par byed par 'gyur** ro // ci'i phyir že na / 'di ltar bltos pa phan pa byed par 'gyur te / gžan du ma yin no // bltos pa na phan pa byed pa yin mod ce na / de **med na ji ltar phan pa byed** / rgyu'i tshe na 'bras bu zes bya ba'i don med do // 'bras bu'i tshe na yañ rgyu zes bya ba'i don med do // mthu med pas phan pa byed pa ma yin no //

<sup>66</sup> de lta na F (T 11b8) : des na NPD

<sup>67</sup> bltos NP : ltos D

[v.10] gžan yañ **ci ste don gcig 'brel pa'i phyir** žes bya ba'i gtan tshigs kyis rgyu dañ 'bras bur<sup>68</sup> mñon par 'dod pa **de gñis rgyu dañ 'bras bu ñid yin** par 'dod na de'i tshe grañs su brjod pa **gñis ñid la sogs 'brel pa'i phyir** / žes<sup>69</sup> bya ba'i gtan tshigs kyis ba lañ gi<sup>70</sup> **gyas gyon rwa yañ** rgyu dañ 'bras bu kho na<sup>71</sup> **thob ste** / de ltar mi 'dod na ni de las gžan yañ 'gyur re skan / **sogs pa smos** pa ni pha rol<sup>72</sup> ñid dañ <sub>(P 361a)</sub> tshu rol ñid dañ rwa ñid<sup>73</sup> la sogs pa dañ 'brel pa'i phyir žes bsdu'o //

<sup>68</sup> bur NP (Ṭ 12a6) : bu D

<sup>69</sup> žes F (Ṭ 12a7) : de žes NPD

<sup>70</sup> gi F : gi rwa NPD

<sup>71</sup> na ND : na'o P

<sup>72</sup> pha rol F (Ṭ 12b2) : pha rol po NPD

<sup>73</sup> rwa ñid F (Ṭ 12a2) : rwa D : ro NP



[v.11] gañ yañ ruñ ba gcig dañ 'brel pa'i phyir na<sup>74</sup> 'brel pa ni ma yin no // 'o na ci že na / 'brel pa'i mtshan ñid dañ ño že na / de mi ruñ ste / dños po'i don 'ga' žig gñis la gnas pa ni 'brel pa yin gyi<sup>75</sup> / don gñis dañ mñon par 'brel pa can **de las gźan du** 'brel pa **de'i mtshan ñid mi** 'thad na / gañ gis na grañs la sogs pa las de'i khyad par rnam par bźag<sup>76</sup> par bya //

'ga' žig<sup>77</sup> yod na yod par 'gyur la med na med par 'gyur te / yod par gyur pa dañ med par gyur pa de gñis kyi<sup>78</sup> yod pa dañ med pa<sup>79</sup> gañ yin pa<sup>80</sup> de'i bye brag <sub>(N 380b)</sub> can khyad par can gyi sbyor ba gañ yin pa de ni 'brel pa žes bya ste / **yod pa dañ med pa'i bye brag can gyi sbyor ba 'di ci ste rgyu 'bras** kho na yin gyi thams cad ni ma yin no<sup>81</sup> že na /

<sup>74</sup> na em. F : ma NPD (Ṭ 12b5)

<sup>75</sup> gyi ND : gyis P

<sup>76</sup> rnam par bźag D (Ṭ 13a3) : bźag NP

<sup>77</sup> 'ga' žig F (Ṭ 13a4) : gañ žig NPD

<sup>78</sup> de gñis kyi D : de gñis kyis NP

<sup>79</sup> yod pa dañ med pa F (Ṭ 13a6f) : don pa dañ med pa P : don yod pa dañ med pa D : don med pa N

<sup>80</sup> gañ yin pa D : yin pa NP

<sup>81</sup> cad ni ma yin no F (Ṭ 13b1) : cad ma yin no D : cado N : cad do P

[v.12] de'i tshe **sbyor ba'i bye brag can** gañ yin pa yod pa dañ med pa **de ñid 'dir**<sup>82</sup> **ni rgyu 'bras ci'i phyir min** te / gañ gis na yod pa ma yin žiñ don med pa'i 'brel pa rtog<sup>83</sup> par byed / **tha dad ces bya** ba ni 'di sñam du yod na yod pa yin<sup>84</sup> la med na med pa yin no žes bya ba 'di ni brjod par <sub>(D 258b)</sub> bya ba mañ po yin te / don gcig rjod par byed pa rgyu dañ 'bras bu kho na žes bya ba'i sgras<sup>85</sup> brjod pa'i yul du de mi rigs pas / yod pa dañ med pa ni rgyu dañ 'bras bu kho nar mi 'dod do že na / **sgra**<sup>86</sup> **'di ni smra bar byed pa'i** skyes bu **la brten pa ma yin nam** žes bya ba ni sgra gañ yin pa 'di ni smra bar byed pa la brten pa'i phyir ji<sup>87</sup> ltar sbyar ba de<sup>88</sup> bžin du smra ba yin te / du ma la yañ sgra gcig yod pas lan du mi ruñ ba ñid do //

<sup>82</sup> 'dir D : 'di NP

<sup>83</sup> rtog F (Ṭ 13b3) : rtogs NPD

<sup>84</sup> yin om. D

<sup>85</sup> žes bya ba'i sgras em. F (Ṭ 13b6) : žes NPD

<sup>86</sup> sgra NP : sgra žes D

<sup>87</sup> ji om. P

<sup>88</sup> de : de de NPD

[v.13] de bas na yod pa dañ med pa de ñid rgyu dañ 'bras bur<sup>89</sup> rigs te / 'di<sup>90</sup> ltar rgyur mñon par 'dod pa 'ga' źig<sup>91</sup> mthoñ na / <sub>(P 361b)</sub> rig bya'i mtshan ñid du gyur<sup>92</sup> pa 'bras bu źes bya ba **ma mthoñ ba mthoñ** ba ni<sup>93</sup> / gañ mthoñ na mthoñ ba yin te<sup>94</sup> / **de ma mthoñ na** 'bras bur mñon par 'dod pa **ma mthoñ ba ni** / 'bras bu yin pa ñid du źes te / 'di las 'di 'byuñ ño źes rtogs pa'o // **ston pa'i skye bo** yañ med pa ni 'di las 'di 'byuñ ño źes bya ba 'di ni 'chad pa med par ro //

brda sprad nas źes so źes bya ba tshig tsam du zad de<sup>95</sup> / 'di ltar brda sprad du zin kyañ yod pa dañ med pa dag las<sup>96</sup> gźan<sup>97</sup> ni rtogs par mi 'gyur te / de bas na gañ rtogs na gañ khoñ du chud par<sup>98</sup> 'gyur ba<sup>99</sup> de ni de'i don te / 'di lta ste snam bu dkar po rtogs na<sup>100</sup> dkar po khoñ du chud pas dkar po kho na rtogs pa bźin du / yod pa dañ med pa rtogs pa na<sup>101</sup> rgyu dañ 'bras bu kho na khoñ du chud pas na<sup>102</sup> yod pa dañ med pa ni rgyu dañ 'bras bu khoñ du chud pa <sub>(N 381a)</sub> las don gźan ma yin no //

'di sñam du yod pa dañ med pa ni sgrub par byed pa yin la<sup>103</sup> / rgyu dañ 'bras bu ñid ni bsgrub par bya ba<sup>104</sup> yin pas gźan no źe na / gźan yin na yañ de'i ño bo ci'i phyir mi bstan / 'on te skyed par byed pa

<sup>89</sup> bur D : bu NP

<sup>90</sup> 'di ltar F (T 14a6) : ji ltar NPD

<sup>91</sup> 'ga' źig F (M) : 'ba' źig NPD (cf. gcig pu T 14a6)

<sup>92</sup> gyur F (T 14a7) : grub NPD

<sup>93</sup> ma mthoñ ba mthoñ ba ni F (T 14a7) : mthoñ ba na NPD

<sup>94</sup> yin te F (T 14a8) : yin no NPD

<sup>95</sup> de om. N

<sup>96</sup> las D : la NP

<sup>97</sup> gźan N : gźan du PD

<sup>98</sup> par F (T 14b8) : pa la NP : pa D

<sup>99</sup> 'gyur ba F (T 14b8) : om. NPD

<sup>100</sup> dkar po rtogs na em. F (T 15a1) : om. NPD

<sup>101</sup> med pa rtogs pa na em. F (T 15a2f) : med pa khoñ du chud pas na NPD

<sup>102</sup> kho na khoñ du chud pas na em. F (ñid khoñ du chud pas na T 15a3) : kho na rtogs pas na NPD

<sup>103</sup> la F (T 15a6) : om. NPD

<sup>104</sup> bsgrub par bya ba em. F (T 15a6) : sgrub par byed pa NPD

dañ bskyed par bya ba'i ño bo<sup>105</sup> yin no že na / gañ de skad du smra  
ba de'i<sup>106</sup> miñ gi rnam grañs kyi sgo nas don tha dad par 'gyur ram ci /  
'di ltar skyed par byed pa dañ bskyed par bya ba'i ño bo dañ skye<sup>107</sup>  
ba dañ bskyed pa'i ño bo dañ rgyu dañ 'bras bu'i ño bo zes bya ba la  
sogs pa rnam grañs su gtogs pa yin no //

<sup>105</sup> ño bo NPD : ño bo kho na T 15a8

<sup>106</sup> de'i F (T 15b1) : de NPD

<sup>107</sup> skye D : skyed NP

[v.14] de bas na **mthoñ ba dañ ma mthoñ ba** yul can gyis yul bstan  
 pa'i phyir yod pa dañ med pa **ma**<sup>108</sup> **gtogs par 'bras bu'i blo ni mi**  
**srid pa'i** gtan tshigs kyi **phyir** ro <sub>(D 259a)</sub> / yod pa dañ med pa gñis **'di**  
**la 'bras bu la sogs sgra** yañ tshig<sup>109</sup> so so'i phreñ ba 'di sñed 'jig rten  
 pa rnams ma brjod kyañ ruñ <sub>(P 361b)</sub> sñams nas / **tha sñad sla ba'i phyir**  
**bkod do**<sup>110</sup> //

<sup>108</sup> ma ND : la P

<sup>109</sup> tshig D (Ṭ 16a1) : tshigs NP

<sup>110</sup> sla ba'i phyir bkod do NPD : sla bar bya ba'i phyir rnam par bkod do Ṭ 16a1f

[v.15] rjes su 'gro ba dañ ldog pa las rgyu dañ 'bras bu gžan ma yin  
yañ ji ltar yod pa dañ<sup>111</sup> med pa gñis kyis bsgrub par bya že na / **de**  
**yod na yod pa**'i rtags kyis **de 'bras**<sup>112</sup> **rtogs te** / gañ yod na yod pa de  
ni 'bras bur<sup>113</sup> rtogs so // rgyu 'di'i 'bras bu 'di'o<sup>114</sup> žes **gañ yañ rjes**  
**su smra ba'i / brda'i yul du de**<sup>115</sup> **brjod de** / de yod na<sup>116</sup> yod pa ñid  
kyis gañ yañ 'di skad du rjes su smra ba'i<sup>117</sup> rgyu dañ 'bras bu'i tha  
sñad kyi yul du de bstan gyi don tha dad pa ni med do // ci 'dra že na /  
**lkog šal la sogs glañ rtogs bžin** te / ji ltar 'di ni ba lañ yin te / lkog šal  
la sogs pa dañ ldan pa'i phyir ro žes bya ba 'dis ba lañ gi tha sñad kyi  
yul du ston<sup>118</sup> to //

<sup>111</sup> dañ D : om. NP

<sup>112</sup> de 'bras F (Ṭ 16a8) : de'i bras bu NPD

<sup>113</sup> bur F (Ṭ 16b8) : bu NPD

<sup>114</sup> 'di'o D (Ṭ 16b2) : 'di'i NP

<sup>115</sup> de om. P

<sup>116</sup> yod na om. NP

<sup>117</sup> rjes su smra ba'i D : smra ba'i NP (Ṭ 16b3)

<sup>118</sup> ston em. (Ṭ 16b7) : bstan NPD

[v.16] ji ste yod pa dañ med pa gñis<sup>119</sup> rgyu dañ 'bras bu ñid<sup>120</sup> yin na / rgyu ñid 'ba' žig gam 'bras bu 'ba' žig kyañ<sup>(N 381b)</sup> gñi gar gtogs te<sup>121</sup> yod pa dañ med pa la bltos<sup>122</sup> par 'gyur ro // gžan du na yod pa tsam rgyu 'am<sup>123</sup> 'bras bu ji ltar yin / yod pa dañ med pa yin na<sup>124</sup> yañ rgyu 'am 'bras bu ni yod pa dañ med pa gñi gar<sup>125</sup> gtogs<sup>126</sup> pa ma yin gyi / rgyu dañ 'bras bu kho na yin na<sup>127</sup> ni ruñ ño že na /

de mi ruñ ste / gñi gar gtogs<sup>128</sup> su zin kyañ phyi ma yod pa dañ med pa'i bye brag gis rgyu<sup>(Ta t009 28 = f.3b)</sup> sña ma yod pa dañ med pa yin la sña ma yod pa dañ med pa'i bye brag gis 'bras bu phyi ma yod pa dañ med pa yin te / 'di ltar **yod 'gyur yod de**<sup>129</sup> yod par 'gyur ba'i chos can yod **na de yod pa** ni rgyur mñon par 'dod pa yod pa'o<sup>130</sup> // **yod pa ñid** do žes 'dir yañ ñes par gzuñ bar bya'o // 'dis ni bzlog pa'añ don gyis 'dren to // rgyur mñon par 'dod pa **yod pa ñid**<sup>131</sup> **na'añ**<sup>132</sup> **yod**<sup>133</sup> **par 'gyur ba** ni 'bras bur mñon par 'dod pa'i 'bras bu ñid do<sup>134</sup> // <sup>(P 362b)</sup> **mñon sum mi dmigs pa dag las / rgyu 'bras kho nar**<sup>135</sup> **rab tu grub** ste / de ltar na yod<sup>136</sup> pa dañ med pa ñid<sup>(D 259b)</sup> rgyu dañ 'bras bu yin gyi / gžan ni ma yin no //

<sup>119</sup> gñis em. (Ṭ 16b8) : gñis ñid NPD(F)

<sup>120</sup> ñid F (Ṭ 17a1) : om. NPD

<sup>121</sup> gñis gar gtogs te F (Ṭ 17a1) : om. NPD

<sup>122</sup> bltos F (Ṭ 17a1) : bltos (ltos D) śiñ gñi gar rtogs NPD

<sup>123</sup> 'am F (Ṭ 17a3) : dañ NPD

<sup>124</sup> yin na em. F (yin pa Ṭ 17a5) : om. NPD

<sup>125</sup> gñi gar ND : gñis P

<sup>126</sup> gtogs NP : rtogs D

<sup>127</sup> yin na D : om. NP

<sup>128</sup> gtogs F (Ṭ 17a7) : rtogs NPD

<sup>129</sup> yod de PDTa : yod N

<sup>130</sup> yod pa'o F (Ṭ 17b4) : yod pa'o om. NPD

<sup>131</sup> yod pa ñid Ta : yod ñid NPD

<sup>132</sup> na'añ NP : pa'añ D : na yañ Ta

<sup>133</sup> yod Ta (M) : yod par NPD

<sup>134</sup> do N : de PDTa

<sup>135</sup> nar M : na NPD

<sup>136</sup> yod Ta (Ṭ 18a6) : don yod NPD

[v.17] des na re **žig de tsam yañ dag don** yin<sup>137</sup> te / re žig de tsam ñid ni yod pa dañ med pa'o // de dag ñid yañ dag pa bden pa ste / 'di gañ gi don yin pa de dag ñid yañ dag pa'o // don de ni gañ dag rnam par rtog pa rnam kyī ste<sup>138</sup> / re žig de tsam yañ dag don ni re žig de tsam sa bon no // **rgyu dañ 'bras bu'i spyod yul rnam ston pa** de yañ 'brel pa'i **don**<sup>139</sup> **bžin ston** te / ma 'brel pa'i don la yañ 'brel pa yod pa bžin<sup>140</sup> du'o<sup>141</sup> // de ltar byed pas **log pa'i don** yin no //

<sup>137</sup> don yin NPDTa : don F (Ṭ 18a6)

<sup>138</sup> kyī ste Ta (Ṭ 18a8) : kyis te NPD

<sup>139</sup> don om. NP

<sup>140</sup> bžin Ta : de bžin D

<sup>141</sup> du'o Ta : du bya'o NPD



[v.18] 'brel pa yañ dag ma yin pa'i don gcig de dag gis bstan tam ci /  
 gañ gis log pa'i don yin že na / de de bžin te / 'di ltar 'dir brtag par bya  
 ba gñis te / rgyu dañ 'bras bu yañ dag par don tha dad pa'am tha dad  
 pa ma yin pa žig 'brel / ji ste tha dad na / **tha dad** <sup>(N382a)</sup> pa<sup>142</sup> **yin na ci**  
**žig 'brel** / ma yin pa ñid de / rañ rañ gi ño bo la gnas pa'i phyir ro //  
 'on te<sup>143</sup> tha dad pa ma yin na ni / **tha dad min na rgyu 'bras gañ** / ma  
 yin pa ñid de / bskyed par bya ba ma<sup>144</sup> skyes pa la byed pa'i phyir la  
 tha dad pa med pa'i phyir ro<sup>145</sup> // gñis 'brel pa ga la yod //

ci ste de ñi tshe<sup>146</sup> tha dad pa'am tha dad pa ma yin pa 'brel pa ma yin  
 gyi / 'o na ci že na / 'brel pa žes bya ba gcig dañ 'brel pa'i phyir ro že  
 na / 'dir yañ 'brel pa žes bya ba<sup>147</sup> **gžan žig yod** de / yod pa yin<sup>148</sup> na  
 yañ rgyu dañ 'bras bur mñon par 'dod pa **ma 'brel pa gñis / de gñis**  
**'brel par ji ltar byed** / mi byed pa ñid de<sup>149</sup> / 'brel pa žes<sup>150</sup> bya ba'i  
 ño bo de ñid gžan žig yod par zad pa'i phyir / <sup>(P 363a)</sup> gžan de yod pas  
 dños po gañ<sup>151</sup> yañ 'dres par gyur pa med pa'i phyir yañ dag par ji ltar  
 'brel pa yod //

<sup>142</sup> pa F (Ṭ 19a2) : ma NP : om. DTa

<sup>143</sup> 'on te Ta (Ṭ 19a3) : gal te NPD

<sup>144</sup> bya ba ma NPD : bya bas Ta

<sup>145</sup> ro F (Ṭ 19a5) : om. NPD

<sup>146</sup> de ñi tshe Ta (Ṭ 19a7) : de ñid ñi tshe NPD(F)

<sup>147</sup> ba om. NP

<sup>148</sup> yin Ta (Ṭ 19b2) : ma yin NPD

<sup>149</sup> byed // mi byed pa ñid de Ta : byed pa ñid de NPD

<sup>150</sup> žes em. D

<sup>151</sup> gañ om. P

[v.19] **sbyor ba can dañ 'du can sogs** źes bya ba la **sogs pa smos pas** ni rje khol<sup>152</sup> la sogs pa'o // bśad ma thag pa'i<sup>153</sup> spyir<sup>154</sup> 'brel pa 'gog pa'i gźuñ **des kyañ thams cad dpyad pa yin** te / sbyor ba la sogs pa'i mtshan ñid kyi 'brel pa ni dños su med do //

re źig 'du ba can yañ 'brel pa ma yin te / ji ltar yon tan dkar po snam bu la 'du ba de <sub>(D 260a)</sub> gñis **phan tshun phan pa mi byed** de / gcig la gcig bskyed par bya ba dañ skyed par byed pa'i dños po med pa'i gtan tshigs kyi phyir / 'du ba can gyi mtshan ñid phan par bya ba<sup>155</sup> dañ phan par byed par gyur pa med pa **de 'dra ba la 'brel pa med** do // 'di ltar gañ źig gañ gis phan gdags par bya ba de ni de la ltos<sup>156</sup> pa yin no // gañ ltos<sup>157</sup> pa de ni de dañ 'brel pa yin no<sup>158</sup> // dkar po dañ snam bu gñis ni de lta bu<sup>159</sup> ma yin te / rañ gi ño bo grub pa'i phyir ro //

gźi <sub>(N 382b)</sub> dañ gnas pa'i dños po yañ rgyu dañ 'bras bu'i dños por ma<sup>160</sup> gyur pa ma yin te / rgyu dañ 'bras bu yin na ni de la yod pa'i ñes par 'gyur ro // dkar po dañ snam bu gñis rgyu dañ 'bras bu yin na gźi dañ gnas par gyur pa'i phyir<sup>161</sup> 'brel pa rtog<sup>162</sup> pa yañ legs pa ma yin te / 'di ltar de gñis la ni 'jig rten pa'i gźi dañ gnas pa'i dños po yañ med do // skye ba dañ skyed par byed pa'i dños po'i mtshan ñid kyi gźi dañ gnas pa'i dños po yañ spyi dañ de dañ ldan pa phan tshun phan pa<sup>163</sup> mi byed pa gñis 'du ba'i mtshan ñid kyi<sup>164</sup> 'brel par mi ruñ ño<sup>165</sup> //

<sup>152</sup> khol NPD : gol Ta

<sup>153</sup> pa'i NPD : pa Ta

<sup>154</sup> spyir Ta (em. F, p. 295, n.1) : phyir NPD (Ṭ 20a3)

<sup>155</sup> phan par bya ba em. F (Ṭ 20a2) : phan gdags pa NPD

<sup>156</sup> ltos D : bltos NP

<sup>157</sup> ltos D : bltos NP

<sup>158</sup> yin no em. F : yin na NPDTa (Ṭ 20a4)

<sup>159</sup> de lta bu DTa (Ṭ 20a4) : de lta NP

<sup>160</sup> bu'i dños por ma F (Ṭ 20a8) : bur ma NPDTa

<sup>161</sup> phyir Ta (Ṭ 21a6) : phyir ro NPD

<sup>162</sup> rtog Ta : rtogs NPD

<sup>163</sup> phan tshun phan pa DTa : phan tshun pa NP

<sup>164</sup> kyi om. Ta

<sup>165</sup> ño DTa (Ṭ 21b2) : ste NP

[v.20] 'on te 'di skad du yan lag can gyi ño bo 'bras bur brjod pa skyed par byed pa'i<sup>166</sup> 'du ba can 'ga' žig yod do // des na<sup>167</sup> phan par mi byed<sup>168</sup> pa'i<sub>(P 363b)</sub> phyir 'brel pa med pa ni ma yin no že na / de ltar **'du ba can ni 'ga' žig gis 'bras bu skyed<sup>169</sup> par byed par khas len na<sup>170</sup> de'i tshe 'du ba can 'di med<sup>171</sup>** / skyed pa'i dus na bskyed par bya ba ma skyes pas gñis tshogs pa med pa'i phyir ro // 'bras bu skyes pa na yañ rgyu 'gags pa'i phyir ro // ma 'gags na<sup>172</sup> yañ lhan cig tu 'dug pa gñis phan par bya ba<sup>173</sup> dañ phan par byed pa'i<sup>174</sup> dños po med pa'i phyir ro // 'du ba can 'ga' žig yod na yañ skyed par byed pa'i gtan tshigs **de las min** / ci'i phyir že na / **śin tu thal ba'i phyir ro<sup>175</sup>** // rdza mkhan yañ bum pa skyed<sup>176</sup> pa'i phyir de dañ 'brel pa can du 'gyur ro //

<sup>166</sup> byed pa'i Ta (Ṭ 21b4) : byed NPD

<sup>167</sup> des na Ta : de na NPD : de bas na F (Ṭ 21b5)

<sup>168</sup> phan par mi byed em. : phan pa myi byed Ta : phan par byed NPD

<sup>169</sup> skyed NDTa : bskyed P

<sup>170</sup> len na Ta (Ṭ 21b6) : len NPD

<sup>171</sup> med NPTa : mi D

<sup>172</sup> na NPD : pa Ta

<sup>173</sup> bya ba F (Ṭ 22a2) : byed pa NPD

<sup>174</sup> byed pa'i F (Ṭ 22a2) : bya ba'i NPDTa

<sup>175</sup> ro NP : te DTa

<sup>176</sup> skyed DTa : bskyed NP

[v.21] skyon 'dir mi 'gyur bar bya ba'i phyir 'du ba can **de gñis** kyañ gcig la gcig **phan pa mi byed** 'brel pa can de gñis kyañ '**du ba la phan pa**<sup>177</sup> mi byed de / de rtag pa'i phyir ro // de gñis dañ 'du ba **dañ** (D 260b) **gžan yañ** gañ yañ<sup>178</sup> **phan pa mi byed par 'brel par**<sup>179</sup> **ci ste** 'dod na / de'i tshe **mtha' dag** phan tshun ma 'brel pa'i 'gro ba thams cad **phan tshun 'brel pa can du 'gyur** / de lta yañ ma yin pa'o<sup>180</sup> // de bas na phan par byed pa dañ phan par mi<sup>181</sup> byed pa'i phyogs la 'du ba med (N 383a) la<sup>182</sup> rnam pa gžan yañ mi srid do // 'dis sbyor ba can gyi lan kyañ btab bo //

<sup>177</sup> pa DTa : par NP

<sup>178</sup> yañ om. NPD

<sup>179</sup> 'brel par F (Ṭ 22b4) : 'brel pa NPD

<sup>180</sup> pa'o em. : pa Ta (Ṭ 22b7) : na NPD

<sup>181</sup> phan par byed pa dañ phan par mi em. F : phan pa byed pa dañ phan pa mi DTa (Ṭ 22b8) : phan pa mi NP

<sup>182</sup> la Ta (Ṭ 22b8) : pa la NPD

[v.22] gžan yañ sbyor ba ni 'bras bu yin pa'i phyir de gñis kyis de skyed<sup>183</sup> pas<sup>184</sup> na ci ste de gñis sbyor ba can yin na / de'i tshe de ltar **sbyor ba skyed kyañ** sbyor ba<sup>185</sup> skyed<sup>186</sup> pa'i gtan tshigs **des de gñis sbyor ba can du mi 'dod de**<sup>187</sup> / ci'i phyir že na / **las la sogs** pa<sup>188</sup> **sbyor ba can du**<sup>189</sup> **'grub pa'i**<sup>190</sup> **phyir** te / ci ste sbyor ba skyed<sup>191</sup> pa'i phyir sbyor ba can yin na las kyañ sbyor ba can du 'gyur te / 'di lta ste 'ga' žig gi<sup>192</sup> las kyis skyes pa<sup>193</sup> dañ gñis ka'i<sup>194</sup> las kyis skyes pa<sup>195</sup> ni sbyor bar 'dod do // **sogs pa** smos (P 364a) pas ni sbyor ba yañ sbyor ba can du 'gyur bar<sup>196</sup> bsdus te<sup>197</sup> / 'di ltar de ni sbyor ba las skyes par yañ<sup>198</sup> 'dod do //

sbyor ba skyed<sup>199</sup> pa'i phyir sbyor ba can ma yin gyi / 'o na ci že na / 'jog par byed do že na yañ de mi ruñ ste / **gnas par byed pa'añ rab tu brjod** / gžag<sup>200</sup> pa dañ 'jog par byed pa gñis ni bskyed par bya ba<sup>201</sup> dañ skyed par byed pa yin pa'i phyir gnas pa gžan med do žes tshad ma rnam 'grel las so sor spros zin to //

<sup>183</sup> skyed N : bskyed PDTa

<sup>184</sup> pas DTa : pa NP

<sup>185</sup> skyed kyañ sbyor ba om. NP

<sup>186</sup> skyed Ta (Ṭ 23a6) : bskyed NPD

<sup>187</sup> can du mi 'dod de Ta (M) : can mi 'dod NPD

<sup>188</sup> pa Ta (Ṭ 23b1) : pa'i NPD

<sup>189</sup> can du F (Ṭ 23b1) : can NPDTa

<sup>190</sup> pa'i om. Ta

<sup>191</sup> skyed Ta (Ṭ 23b1) : bskyed NPD

<sup>192</sup> gi D : gis NPTa

<sup>193</sup> pa DTa : pas NP

<sup>194</sup> ka'i NP : ga'i DTa

<sup>195</sup> pa Ta (Ṭ 23b3) : pas NPD

<sup>196</sup> bar DTa : om. NP

<sup>197</sup> bsdus te NPD : bsdu ste Ta (Ṭ 23b4)

<sup>198</sup> yañ DTa : om. NP

<sup>199</sup> skyed DTa : bskyed NP

<sup>200</sup> gžag PDTa : bžag N (Ṭ 23b7)

<sup>201</sup> bya ba DTa : om. NP

[v.23] ci ste sbyor ba la sogs pa med par sbyor ba la sogs pa'i blo yod na ni bral ba'i ño bo gañ yin pa de ldan pa'i ño bo yañ<sup>202</sup> yin par 'gyur / de bźin du ldan pa'i ño bo gañ yin pa de ñid<sup>203</sup> bral ba'i ño bo yañ yin / gnas<sup>204</sup> pa gañ yin pa mi gnas<sup>205</sup> pa yañ yin pas na / sbyor ba la sogs pa'i blo ci ste mi 'byuñ / de lta yañ ma yin pa<sup>206</sup> / de bas na sbyor ba<sup>207</sup> dañ bral ba'i las ni sbyor ba la sogs pa'i blo'i rgyu mtshan yin no źe na / de mi ruñ<sup>208</sup> ste / dri ba<sup>209</sup> mtshuñs pa'i phyir ro // khyed kyi yañ ño bo 'dra ba yin na bral ba la sogs pa la sbyor ba la sogs pa ci ste<sup>210</sup> mi 'du /

de skyed par byed pa'i las med pa'i phyir sbyor ba ni bral ba<sup>211</sup> ma<sup>212</sup> yin no źe na / de ltar las kyañ ci ste med / de'i rgyu yañ ci ste med<sup>213</sup> ces bya ba'i (N 383b) lan gdab dka'o // de bas na khyed ñid kyis<sup>214</sup> kyañ sñar bral ba la sogs (D 261a) pa'i ño bor **mi ruñ ba'i** phyis<sup>215</sup> **sbyor ba la sogs pa'i gnas ruñ** (/// Ta, end of folio) **ba'i**<sup>216</sup> **dños po de 'gyur te / ci'i** phyir źe na / 'di ltar sbyor ba la sogs pa dañ ldan par **ruñ ba'i** dños po **rtag na ni / de dañ bral ba 'gal phyir te / sbyor ba la sogs pa dañ ldan pa ni bral bar 'gal lo źes de skad brjod par bya dgos so // ñed kyis kyañ sbyor ba la sogs pa dañ bral ba yin no źes de skad<sup>217</sup> brjod par bya'o //**

<sup>202</sup> gañ yin pa de ldan pa'i ño bo yañ DTa (Ṭ 24a4) : gañ NP : gañ yin pa de ñid ldan pa'i ño bo yañ em. F

<sup>203</sup> de ñid F (Ṭ 24a6) : om. NPD

<sup>204</sup> gnas NPDTa : mi gnas F (Ṭ 24a6)

<sup>205</sup> mi gnas NPDTa : gnas F (Ṭ 24a6)

<sup>206</sup> pa DTa : pas NP

<sup>207</sup> de bas na sbyor ba Ta (Ṭ 24b1) : de bas na sbyor ba dañ bral ba na sbyor ba NPD

<sup>208</sup> ruñ Ta (Ṭ 24b3) : ruñ ba NPD

<sup>209</sup> dri ba DTa (Ṭ 24b3) : dri ma NP

<sup>210</sup> pa ci ste em. F (Ṭ 24b3) : par ci ste Ta : pa ji ltar NPD

<sup>211</sup> sbyor ba ni bral ba em. (Ṭ 24b6) : bral ba ni sbyor ba NPDTa

<sup>212</sup> ma om. Ṭ

<sup>213</sup> med om. Ta

<sup>214</sup> khyed ñid kyis DTa (Ṭ 25a2) : khyod ñid NP

<sup>215</sup> phyis Ta (Ṭ 25a2) : phyir NPD

<sup>216</sup> ba'i NPD : bar F (Ṭ 25a2)

<sup>217</sup> skad PD : bskad N

[v.24] **de bas na bral dañ ldan dañ 'gro**<sup>218</sup> **sogs** pas **śes bya ba la**<sup>219</sup> sbyor ba dañ bral ba'i<sup>220</sup> las kyi tshig gis<sup>221</sup> **ruñ ba'i** tshig **brjod pa na** don gyi **ño bo 'di la ñes par brjod** / de'i tshe don med pa'i **'gro** ba la **sogs**<sup>222</sup> **gžan brtags** pas **ci žig bya** ste cuñ zad<sup>223</sup> kyañ mi bya'o // **sogs** pa'i nañ du sbyor ba dañ bral ba dañ gžan dañ gžan ma yin pa la sogs pa gzuñ ño //

<sup>218</sup> 'gro F (Ṭ 25b1) : gro D : 'bral NP

<sup>219</sup> la om. D

<sup>220</sup> ba'i F (Ṭ 25b2) : ba NPD

<sup>221</sup> tshig gis ND : tshigs su P

<sup>222</sup> sogs NP : sogs pa D (Ṭ 25b3)

<sup>223</sup> cuñ zad PD : cuñ N

[v.25] ci'i phyir źe na / gañ gi phyir 'gro ba la sogs pa **de dag rnams la brtags te yod na yañ 'di'i źes** 'brel pa **mi 'grub pa'i phyir te / gźan gyi dbań can** źes bya ba<sup>224</sup> la sogs pas<sup>225</sup> 'brel pa rnam pa thams cad du bkag pas 'di'i las dań sbyor ba dań bral ba źes bya ba'i 'brel pa mi<sup>226</sup> grub pa'i phyir de'i rgyu mtshan can gyi brjod pa ga la yod / ji ltar gźan du rtogs pa'i las la sogs pa ni<sup>227</sup> de gźan<sup>228</sup> dań 'brel pa ma yin te / ma 'brel pa'i phyir ro // mñon par 'dod pa yañ de bźin no // gañ gi phyir de ltar las la sogs pa dań 'brel pa'i phyir 'gro ba la sogs pa ma yin pa de bas na rgyun mi 'chad par skye ba'i gźi rkyen gźan dań gźan gyis **skad cig ma so sor skye ba'i dños po rnams ni dños po tha dad 'di'**<sup>229</sup> **yin**<sup>230</sup> **rigs** te / ldan pa dań bral ba dań 'gro ba la sogs par rigs kyi / brtan pa<sup>231</sup> gcig pu'i ño bo ni sbyor ba la sogs pa'i 'brel pa ma yin pas <sup>(N 384a)</sup> sbyor ba la sogs pa'i mtshan ñid kyi 'brel pa yañ dag par gañ yañ med do // de bas na dños po thams cad kyi rañ bźin ni 'brel pa med do // źi ba yin no //

/ 'brel pa brtag pa źes bya ba'i 'grel pa smra ba'i seń ge slob dpon<sup>232</sup> chos kyi grags pas mdzad pa rdzogs so //

<sup>224</sup> bya ba om. D

<sup>225</sup> pas NPD : pa F (Ṭ 25b6)

<sup>226</sup> mi em. (Ṭ 25b6) : ma NPD

<sup>227</sup> na PD : ni N

<sup>228</sup> gźan D : bźin NP

<sup>229</sup> dad 'di F (Ṭ 25b4) : dad pa 'di D : dad pa NP

<sup>230</sup> yin F (Ṭ 25b4) : yin par NPD

<sup>231</sup> brtan pa NP : brten pa D : bstan Ṭ 25b2

<sup>232</sup> dpon NP : dpon chen po D





---

**图书在版编目 (CIP) 数据**

法称《观相属论》及天主慧《观相属论注》：英文、梵文 /  
(奥) 恩斯特·斯坦因凯勒

(Ernst Steinkellner) 校勘. -- 北京：中国藏学出版社，  
2022.3

(西藏自治区梵文文本系列丛书；23)

ISBN 978-7-5211-0380-9

I. ①法… II. ①恩… III. ①因明 (印度逻辑) - 研  
究 - 英文、梵语 IV. ①B81-093.51

中国版本图书馆CIP数据核字(2022)第043406号

---

法称《观相属论》及天主慧《观相属论注》 (奥)恩斯特·斯坦因凯勒 校勘

---

**出版：**中国藏学出版社

**发行：**中国藏学出版社

**责任编辑：**张荣德

**特邀编辑：**李学竹

**封面设计：**李建雄

**印刷：**北京隆昌伟业印刷有限公司

**开本：**787×1092 1/16

**印张：**8.5

**印次：**2022年3月第1版第1次

**印数：**600

**书号：**ISBN 978-7-5211-0380-9

**定价：**39.00元

